

2017 ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

WISCONSIN

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 1: CRIMINALIZATION OF DOMESTIC MINOR SEX TRAFFICKING

Legal Components:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*
- 1.2 *Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.*
- 1.3 *Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.*
- 1.4 *The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.*

Legal Analysis¹:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*

Wisconsin criminalizes the sex trafficking of minors in Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), separately from Wis. Stat. § 940.302 (Human trafficking).² Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) states,

¹ This report includes legislation enacted as of August 1, 2017.

² Wis. Stat. § 940.302 (Human trafficking) states,

- (1) In this section:
 - (a) "Commercial sex act" means any of the following for which anything of value is given to, promised, or received, directly or indirectly, by any person:
 1. Sexual contact.
 2. Sexual intercourse.
 3. Except as provided in sub. (2) (c), any of the following:
 - a. Sexually explicit performance.
 - 940.302(1)(a)3.b. Any other conduct done for the purpose of sexual humiliation, degradation, arousal, or gratification.

- (1) Whoever knowingly recruits, entices, provides, obtains, harbors, transports, patronizes, or solicits or knowingly attempts to recruit, entice, provide, obtain, harbor, transport, patronize, or solicit any child³ for the purpose of commercial sex acts, as defined in s. 940.302(1)(a)⁴ is guilty of a Class C felony.
- (2) Whoever benefits in any manner from a violation of sub. (1) is guilty of a Class C felony if the person knows that the benefits come from an act described in sub. (1).
- (3) Any person who incurs an injury or death as a result of a violation of sub. (1) or (2) may bring a civil action against the person who committed the violation. In addition to actual damages, the court may award punitive damages to the injured party, not to exceed treble the amount of actual damages incurred, and reasonable attorney fees.

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(c) (Classification of felonies), a Class C felony is punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both.

1.2 Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.

In addition to Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), the following laws criminalize CSEC in Wisconsin:

1. Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) states, “Whoever intentionally solicits or causes any child to engage in an act of prostitution⁵ or establishes any child in a place of prostitution is guilty of a Class

(b) "Debt bondage" means the condition of a debtor arising from the debtor's pledge of services as a security for debt if the reasonable value of those services is not applied toward repaying the debt or if the length and nature of the services are not defined.

(c) "Services" means activities performed by one individual at the request, under the supervision, or for the benefit of another person.

(d) "Trafficking" means recruiting, enticing, harboring, transporting, providing, or obtaining, or attempting to recruit, entice, harbor, transport, provide, or obtain, an individual without consent of the individual.

- (2) (a) Except as provided in s. 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], whoever knowingly engages in trafficking is guilty of a Class D felony if all of the following apply:

1. One of the following applies:

- a. The trafficking is for the purposes of labor or services.

- b. The trafficking is for the purposes of a commercial sex act.

....

(b) Whoever benefits in any manner from a violation of par. (a) is guilty of a Class D felony if the person knows that the benefits come from an act described in par. (a).

³ Wis. Stat. § 948.01(1) (Definitions) defines a “child” as “a person who has not attained the age of 18 years, except that for purposes of prosecuting a person who is alleged to have violated a state or federal criminal law, ‘child’ does not include a person who has attained the age of 17 years,” “unless the context of a specific section manifestly requires a different construction.”

⁴ Wis. Stat. § 940.302(1)(a) defines “commercial sex act” as a sexual act, sexual intercourse, sexually explicit performance, or “[a]ny other conduct done for the purpose of sexual humiliation, degradation, arousal, or gratification . . . for which anything of value is given to, promised, or received, directly or indirectly, by any person.”

⁵ Although it does not specifically define “act of prostitution,” Wis. Stat. § 944.30 (Prostitution) states,

- (1m) Any person who intentionally does any of the following is guilty of a Class A misdemeanor:
 - (1) Has or offers to have or requests to have nonmarital sexual intercourse for anything of value.
 - (2) Commits or offers to commit or requests to commit an act of sexual gratification, in public or in private, involving the sex organ of one person and the mouth or anus of another for anything of value.
 - (3) Is an inmate of a place of prostitution.

D felony.” A Class D felony is punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(d).

2. Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child) states in part,

(1) Whoever does any of the following with knowledge of the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child may be penalized under sub. (2p):

(a) Employs, uses, persuades, induces, entices, or coerces any child to engage in sexually explicit conduct for the purpose of recording or displaying in any way the conduct.

(b) Records or displays in any way a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct.

(1m) Whoever produces, performs in, profits from, promotes, imports into the state, reproduces, advertises, sells, distributes, or possesses with intent to sell or distribute, any recording of a child engaging in sexually explicit conduct may be penalized under sub. (2p) if the person knows the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child and if the person knows or reasonably should know that the child engaging in the sexually explicit conduct has not attained the age of 18 years.

....

A conviction is punishable as a Class C felony by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(a), 939.50(3)(c). However, if the offender is under 18, it is a Class F felony punishable by imprisonment up to 12 ½ years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(b), 939.50(3)(f).⁶ Also, if the offender is 18 or older, “the court shall impose a bifurcated sentence” with a prison portion of no less than 5 years. However, if “the court finds that the best interests of the community will be served and the public will not be harmed,” and “the person is no more than 48 months older than the child who is the victim of violation” a lesser sentence may be imposed. Wis. Stat. § 939.617(1), (2).

3. Wis. Stat. § 948.07 (Child enticement) states,

Whoever, with intent to commit any of the following acts, causes or attempts to cause any child who has not attained the age of 18 years to go into any vehicle, building, room or secluded place is guilty of a Class D felony:

(1) Having sexual contact or sexual intercourse with the child in violation of s. 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.085 [Sexual assault of a child placed in substitute care], or 948.095 [Sexual assault of a child by a school staff person or a person who works or volunteers with children].

(2) Causing the child to engage in prostitution.

(3) Exposing a sex organ to the child or causing the child to expose a sex organ in violation of s. 948.10.

(4) Recording the child engaging in sexually explicit conduct.

....

A Class D felony is punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(d).

(4) Masturbates a person or offers to masturbate a person or requests to be masturbated by a person for anything of value.

(5) Commits or offers to commit or requests to commit an act of sexual contact for anything of value.

⁶ Under Wis. Stat. § 948.05(3), “It is an affirmative defense to prosecution for violation of sub. (1) (a) or (b) or (2) if the defendant had reasonable cause to believe that the child had attained the age of 18 years. A defendant who raises this affirmative defense has the burden of proving this defense by a preponderance of the evidence.”

Certain sexual offense laws may apply in CSEC cases although they do not specifically refer to commercial sex acts.

1. Wis. Stat. § 948.02 (Sexual assault of a child) consists of two degrees of sexual assault. Wis. Stat. § 948.02(1) establishes the offense of first degree sexual assault as including the following:

....

(b) Whoever has sexual intercourse with a person who has not attained the age of 12 years is guilty of a Class B felony.

(c) Whoever has sexual intercourse with a person who has not attained the age of 16 years by use or threat of force or violence is guilty of a Class B felony.

(d) Whoever has sexual contact with a person who has not attained the age of 16 years by use or threat of force or violence is guilty of a Class B felony if the actor is at least 18 years of age when the sexual contact occurs.

(e) Whoever has sexual contact with a person who has not attained the age of 13 years is guilty of a Class B felony.

If the victim is less than 12 years of age, a conviction under this statute is punishable as a Class B felony by imprisonment up to 60 years. A court “shall impose a bifurcated sentence under s. 973.01,” and “[t]he term of confinement in prison portion of the bifurcated sentence shall be at least 25 years.” Wis. Stat. §§ 939.616(1r), 939.50(3)(b), 948.02(1)(b), (c).

Second degree sexual assault is prohibited under Wis. Stat. § 948.02(2), which states, “Whoever has sexual contact or sexual intercourse with a person who has not attained the age of 16 years” is guilty of a Class C felony punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.02(2), 939.50(3)(c).

2. Wis. Stat. § 948.09 (Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older) states, “Whoever has sexual intercourse with a child who is not the defendants spouse and who has attained the age of 16 years is guilty of a Class A misdemeanor.” A Class A misdemeanor is punishable by imprisonment up to 9 months, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Wis. Stat. § 939.51(3)(a).

1.3 Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.

Wis. Stat. § 944.30 (Prostitution) does not specifically refer to the human trafficking law to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization; however, Wis. Stat. § 939.46(1m) (Coercion) indirectly acknowledges the intersection of prostitution and trafficking victimization by providing a defense for human trafficking victims that would apply to prostitution charges, among others related to the trafficking victimization. It states, “A victim of a violation of s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child] has an affirmative defense for any offense committed as a direct result of the violation of s. 940.302 (2) or 948.051 without regard to whether anyone was prosecuted or convicted for the violation of s. 940.302 (2) or 948.051.”

1.4 The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.

Wisconsin Organized Crime Control Act, Wis. Stat. § 946.83 provides,

(1) No person who has received any proceeds with knowledge that they were derived, directly or indirectly, from a pattern of racketeering activity may use or invest, whether directly or indirectly, any

part of the proceeds or the proceeds derived from the investment or use thereof in the acquisition of any title to, or any right, interest, or equity in, real property or in the establishment or operation of any enterprise.

(2) No person, through a pattern of racketeering activity, may acquire or maintain, directly or indirectly, any interest in or control of any enterprise or real property.

(3) No person employed by, or associated with, any enterprise may conduct or participate, directly or indirectly, in the enterprise through a pattern of racketeering activity.

Wis. Stat. § 946.82(3) defines a “pattern of racketeering activity” as

engaging in at least 3 incidents of racketeering activity that have the same or similar intents, results, accomplices, victims or methods of commission or otherwise are interrelated by distinguishing characteristics, provided at least one of the incidents occurred after April 27, 1982 and that the last of the incidents occurred within 7 years after the first incident of racketeering activity. Acts occurring at the same time and place which may form the basis for crimes punishable under more than one statutory provision may count for only one incident of racketeering activity.

“Racketeering activity” is defined in Wis. Stat. § 946.82(4) as including “the attempt, conspiracy to commit, or commission of, any of the felonies specified in,” among other things, Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), or § 948.12 (Possession of child pornography). Based on this definition of racketeering, acts of commercial sexual exploitation constitute predicate crimes under the racketeering law, making it available for combatting criminal enterprises that engage in domestic minor sex trafficking.

Conviction under this section is punishable as a Class E felony by imprisonment up to 15 years, a fine not to exceed \$50,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 946.84(1), 939.50(3)(e). Instead of the fine listed in Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(e), “any person convicted of engaging in conduct in violation of s. 946.83, through which he or she derived pecuniary value,⁷ or by which he or she caused personal injury or property damage or other loss, may be fined not to exceed 2 times the gross value gained or 2 times the gross loss caused, whichever is the greater, plus court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution, reasonably incurred.” Wis. Stat. § 946.84(2). However, subsection (2) also states, “In calculating the amount of fine based on personal injury, any measurement of pain and suffering shall be excluded.” Wis. Stat. § 946.84(2).

Similarly, Wis. Stat. § 946.85(1) penalizes “[a]ny person who engages in a continuing criminal enterprise.” Engaging in a continuing criminal enterprise is defined in Wis. Stat. § 946.85(2) as

engage[ing] in a prohibited activity under [Wis. Stat. § 946.83 (Prohibited activities) of the Wisconsin Organized Crime Control Act] and;

- (a) The activity is undertaken by the person in concert with 5 or more other persons, each of whom acted with intent to commit a crime and with respect to whom the person occupies a supervisory position; and
- (b) The person obtains gross income or resources in excess of \$25,000 from the activity.

Engaging in a continuing criminal enterprise is a Class E felony punishable by imprisonment up to 15 years, a fine not to exceed \$50,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 946.85(1), 939.50(3)(e).

A violation of Wis. Stat. § 946.83 [Prohibited Activities] or Wis. Stat. § 946.85[Continuing criminal enterprise] shall be grounds for mandatory criminal forfeiture “of all real or personal property used in the course of, or

⁷ Wis. Stat. § 946.84(4)(a) defines “pecuniary value” as “Anything of value in the form of money, a negotiable instrument, or a commercial interest or anything else the primary significance of which is economic advantage; or (b) Any other property or service that has a value in excess of 100.”

intended for use in the course of, derived from or realized through conduct in violation of s. 946.83 or 946.85.” Wis. Stat. § 946.86(1). “Any injured person has a right or claim to forfeited property or the proceeds derived therefrom superior to any right or claim the state has under this section in the same property or proceeds.” Wis. Stat. § 946.86(4). In addition to criminal penalties and forfeiture, Wis. Stat. § 946.87(2)(a) (Civil remedies) provides for civil forfeiture to the state of “[a]ll property, real or personal, including money, used in the course of, intended for use in the course of, derived from, or realized through, conduct which has resulted in a conviction for violation of s. 946.83 or 946.85.”

Legal Components:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.*
 - 2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*
 - 2.3 *Solicitation laws differentiate buying sex acts with an adult and buying sex acts with a minor under 18.*
 - 2.4 *Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.*
 - 2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*
 - 2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*
 - 2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*
 - 2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*
 - 2.9 *Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
 - 2.10 *Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.*
-

Legal Analysis:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.*

Wisconsin’s core human trafficking law applies to buyers who purchase sex with minors through the words “patronize,” “solicit,” and, following federal precedent, through the word “obtain.”⁸ Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) states, “Whoever knowingly recruits, entices, provides, obtains, harbors, transports, patronizes, or solicits, or knowingly attempts to recruit, entice, provide, obtain, harbor, transport, patronize, or solicit any child for the purpose commercial sex acts, as defined in § 940.302 (1)(a) [Commercial sex act], is guilty of a Class C felony.”

⁸ See *United States v. Jungers*, 702 F.3d 1066 (8th Cir. 2013). In this case, the Eighth Circuit held that the federal sex trafficking law, 18 U.S.C. § 1591 (Sex trafficking of children or by force, fraud, or coercion) applies to buyers of sex with minors. Reversing a District of South Dakota ruling that Congress did not intend the string of verbs constituting criminal conduct under 18 U.S.C. § 1591(a)(1) (“recruits, entices, harbors, transports, provides, obtains, or maintains”) to reach the conduct of buyers (*United States v. Jungers*, 834 F. Supp. 2d 930, 931 (D.S.D. 2011)), the Eighth Circuit concluded that 18 U.S.C. § 1591 does not contain “a latent exemption for purchasers” because buyers can “engage in at least some of the prohibited conduct.” *Jungers*, 702 F. 3d 1066, 1072. Congress codified *Jungers* clarifying that the federal sex trafficking law is intended to apply to buyers in the Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act (JVTA) of 2015 Pub. L. No. 114-22, 129 Stat 227), enacted on May 29, 2015. The JVTA adds the terms “patronize” and “solicit” to the list of prohibited conduct and expressly states, “section 108 of this title amends section 1591 of title 18, United States Code, to add the words ‘solicits or patronizes’ to the sex trafficking statute making absolutely clear for judges, juries, prosecutors, and law enforcement officials that criminals who purchase sexual acts from human trafficking victims may be arrested, prosecuted, and convicted as sex trafficking offenders when this is merited by the facts of a particular case.” *Id.* at Sec. 109. The Eighth Circuit decision in *United States v. Jungers* and the federal sex trafficking law as amended by the Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act establish persuasive authority when state courts interpret the string of verbs constituting prohibited conduct in state sex trafficking laws (in particular the term “obtains”) to the extent such interpretation does not conflict with state case law.

2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) penalizes “[w]hoever intentionally solicits or causes⁹ any child to engage in an act of prostitution” The interpretation of this statute as it applies to buyers has been impacted by amendments made by 2007 Wis. Act 80 § 17 and the case law interpreting the prior version of this statute and its “sister statute,” Wis. Stat. § 944.32 (Soliciting prostitutes) suggest that the current version of Wis. Stat. § 948.08 would be applicable to buyers.¹⁰ Wis. Stat. § 948.08 is a Class D felony punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 939.50(3)(d).

Buyers could also face charges under Wis. Stat. § 948.07(1) (Child enticement).¹¹ Wis. Stat. § 948.07(1) applies to a buyer who “with intent to commit any of the following acts, causes or attempts to cause any child who has not attained the age of 18 years to go into any vehicle, building, room or secluded place” to “[h]av[e] sexual contact or sexual intercourse with the child in violation of s. 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.085 [Sexual assault of a child placed in substitute care].” It may also apply to buyers who “with intent to commit any of the following acts, causes or attempts to cause any child who has not attained the age of 18 years to go into any vehicle, building, room or secluded place” to “[c]aus[e] the child to engage in prostitution.” Wis. Stat. § 948.07(2). A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.07 is punishable as a Class D felony by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.07, 939.50(3)(d).

The following sex offenses, described in detail in Section 1.2 above, would also apply to some buyers of sex acts with a minor: Wis. Stat. § 948.02 (Sexual assault of a child) and § 948.09 (Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older).

⁹ See *State v. Payette*, 756 N.W.2d 423, 433 (Wis. Ct. App. 2008) (“Although § 948.08 is colloquially referred to as prohibiting ‘solicitation,’ the statute also specifically, and alternatively, prohibits ‘causing’ a child to practice prostitution. As we have seen, ‘cause’ is ‘a substantial factor’ which need not be the first cause, nor the sole cause, of a child practicing prostitution.”)

¹⁰ Prior to the enactment of Wis. Stat. § 948.08 in 1987, solicitation of prostitution involving a minor was punishable under Wis. Stat. § 944.32, which then stated, “Whoever intentionally solicits or causes any person to practice prostitution or establishes any person in a place of prostitution is guilty of a Class D felony. If the person is under the age of 18, the defendant is guilty of a Class C felony.” 1987 Wis. Act 332 § 46. In applying this statute as written at the time, *State v. Huff*, 367 N.W.2d 226, 230 (Wis. Ct. App. 1985) held that application of Wis. Stat. § 944.32 was not restricted to a defendant who solicited a minor to practice prostitution with a third party and that financial gain need not have been the purpose of the solicitation. The court, however, did note its previous decision where it held that, given the statute’s use of the word “practice,” “sec. 944.32 proscribes inducing a person to engage in ongoing criminal conduct.” *Id.* at 231 (citing *State v. Johnson*, 324 N.W. 2d 447, 451 (Wis. Ct. App. 1982). 1987 Wis. Act 332 created Wis. Stat. § 948.08 and made solicitation of a child to practice prostitution a separate crime. 1987 Wis. Act 332 § 55. The most recent amendment to that statute, 2007 Wis. Act 80 § 17, changed the language from causing a child to “practice prostitution” to causing a child to “engage in an act of prostitution.” Interpreting the statute’s language as it existed prior to the 2007 amendment, *State v. Payette*, 756 N.W.2d 423, 433 (Wis. Ct. App. 2008) explained that “‘causes’ is ‘a ‘substantial factor’ which need not be the first cause, nor the sole cause, of a child practicing prostitution.” The court found the defendant’s conduct sufficient to meet that requirement. *Id.* The court also noted that “[t]he habitual nature of Payette’s trading cocaine for sex with RS (over thirty times) satisfies the § 948.08 requisite that RS did ‘practice prostitution’ with Payette.” *Id.* at 431. By replacing the word “practice” with the phrase “engage in an act of,” the 2007 amendment seems to aim to criminalize the purchase of a single act of prostitution, rather than an extensive pattern of such acts. 2007 Wis. Act 80.

¹¹ See *supra* discussion of this provision in Component 1.2.

2.3 Solicitation laws differentiate buying sex acts with an adult and buying sex acts with a minor under 18.

Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) is minor specific. However, Wis. Stat. § 944.31 (Patronizing prostitutes)¹² and § 944.33 (Pandering)¹³ do not distinguish between acts with an adult versus acts with a child.

2.4 Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.

A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) is punishable as a Class C felony by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.051(1), 939.50(3)(c). A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) is punishable as a Class D felony by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 939.50(3)(d). A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.07 (Child enticement) is punishable as a Class D felony punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.07, 939.50(3)(d).

Buyers who fall under Wisconsin's sexual offense statutes also face potentially lengthy prison sentences.¹⁴

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the buyer has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense¹⁵ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). To the extent buyers can be prosecuted under other federal CSEC laws,¹⁶ a conviction is punishable by penalties ranging from a fine not to exceed \$250,000 to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.¹⁷

¹² Wis. Stat. § 944.31 (Patronizing prostitutes) states, “Any person who enters or remains in any place of prostitution with intent to have nonmarital sexual intercourse or to commit an act of sexual gratification, in public or in private, involving the sex organ of one person and the mouth or anus of another, masturbation or sexual contact with a prostitute is guilty of a Class A misdemeanor.”

¹³ Wis. Stat. § 944.33 (Pandering) states in part, “(1) Whoever does any of the following is guilty of a Class A misdemeanor: (a) Solicits another to have nonmarital sexual intercourse or to commit an act of sexual gratification, in public or in private, involving the sex organ of one person and the mouth or anus of another, masturbation or sexual contact with a person the solicitor knows is a prostitute”

¹⁴ See *supra* Component 1.2 for the sexual offense statutes that may apply to certain buyers.

¹⁵ Pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(2), “federal sex offense” is defined as

an offense under section 1591 [18 USCS § 1591] (relating to sex trafficking of children), 2241 [18 USCS § 2241] (relating to aggravated sexual abuse), 2242 [18 USCS § 2242] (relating to sexual abuse), 2244(a)(1) [18 USCS § 2244(a)(1)] (relating to abusive sexual contact), 2245 [18 USCS § 2245] (relating to sexual abuse resulting in death), 2251 [18 USCS § 2251] (relating to sexual exploitation of children), 2251A [18 USCS § 2251A] (relating to selling or buying of children), 2422(b) [18 USCS § 2422(b)] (relating to coercion and enticement of a minor into prostitution), or 2423(a) [18 USCS § 2423(a)] (relating to transportation of minors).

¹⁶ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (Selling or buying of children), 2251(a) (Sexual exploitation of children), 2423(a) (Transportation of a minor with intent for minor to engage in criminal sexual activity), 2422(a) (Coercion and enticement), 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors).

¹⁷ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 30 years to life and a fine), 2251(e) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 15–30 years and a fine), 2423(a) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 10 years to life and a fine), 2422(a) (conviction punishable by a fine, imprisonment up to 20 years, or both), 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); see also 18 U.S.C §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*

While not expressly commercial in nature, Wis. Stat. § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime) prohibits a person from using the Internet to lure or entice a minor to engage in a sex act. Wis. Stat. § 948.075(1r) states, “Whoever uses a computerized communication system to communicate with an individual who the actor believes or has reason to believe has not attained the age of 16 years with intent to have sexual contact or sexual intercourse with the individual in violation of s. 948.02 (1) or (2) [Sexual assault of a child] is guilty of a Class C felony.” Additionally, to obtain a conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.075(1r), subsection (3) states “[p]roof that the actor did an act, other than use a computerized communication system to communicate with the individual, to effect the actor’s intent under sub. (1r) shall be necessary to prove that intent.” Additionally, pursuant to subsection (2), “This section does not apply if, at the time of the communication, the actor reasonably believed that the age of the person to whom the communication was sent was no more than 24 months less than the age of the actor.” Wis. Stat. § 948.075(2).

A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.075 is punishable as a Class C felony punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.075(1r), 939.50(3)(c). For offenders 18 and older, Wis. Stat. § 939.617(1) (Minimum sentence for certain child sex offenses) requires imposition of a bifurcated sentence with a minimum prison sentence of 5 years for conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.075. The court may impose a lesser sentence “only if the court finds that the best interests of the community will be served and the public will not be harmed and if the court places its reasons on the record.” Wis. Stat. § 939.617(2).

2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*

Although Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), and § 948.07 (Child enticement) are silent regarding the availability of a mistake of age defense, Wis. Stat. § 939.43(2) (Mistake) states, “[a] mistake as to the age of a minor . . . is not a defense.” Because Wis. Stat. § 939.43 applies generally to Wisconsin’s Criminal Code, a mistake of age defense appears to be prohibited for the buyer-applicable offenses listed above.

However, Wis. Stat. § 948.05(3) (Sexual exploitation of a child), another buyer-applicable offense, states, “It is an affirmative defense to prosecution for violation of sub. (1)(a) or (b) or (2) if the defendant had reasonable cause to believe that the child had attained the age of 18 years. A defendant who raises this affirmative defense has the burden of proving this defense by a preponderance of the evidence.”

2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*

Wisconsin’s buyer-applicable trafficking and CSEC laws do not stagger penalties based on a minor’s age and provide sufficiently high penalties. A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) is punishable as a Class C felony by imprisonment up to 40 years. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.051(1), 939.50(3)(c). A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) or § 948.07 (Child enticement) is punishable as a Class D felony punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 948.07, 939.50(3)(d).

2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) imposes a fine of \$100,000. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.051(1), 939.50(3)(c). Buyers also face possible \$100,000 fines for convictions under Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), § 948.07 (Child enticement), § 948.02(2) (Sexual assault of a child in the second degree),

or § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime). Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 948.05(2p)(a), 948.07, 948.02, 948.025, 948.075, 939.50(3)(c), (d). A \$10,000 fine may be assessed for convictions under Wis. Stat. § 948.09 (Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older). Wis. Stat. §§ 948.09, 939.51(3)(a).

Wisconsin's generally applicable forfeiture provision could apply to buyers. Wis. Stat. § 973.075(1)(a) states, "The following are subject to seizure and forfeiture under ss. 973.075 to 973.077: (a) All property, real or personal, including money, directly or indirectly derived from or realized through the commission of any crime." Wis. Stat. § 973.075(1)(b)(1m)(a), (c) provides specifically for the criminal forfeiture of vehicles used "[t]o transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony," or "[i]n the commission of a crime in violation of s. 944.30 [Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33 [Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping place of prostitution] 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or 948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors]." Property may be seized, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.075(2)(d), when there is ". . . probable cause to believe that the property was derived from or realized through a crime, or was used in a crime under s. 948.07, or that the property is a vehicle which was used to transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony," or pursuant to a court order or search warrant.

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.075(2) "A law enforcement officer may seize property subject to this section upon process issued by any court of record having jurisdiction over the property." Seizure without process is permissible under certain enumerated circumstances, but is not permissible for seizure of vehicles used in the commission of a violation of s. 944.30[Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33 [Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping a place of prostitution], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or 948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors]. Wis. Stat. §973.075(2).

Distribution of forfeited property is governed by Wis. Stat. § 973.075(4), which states,

[T]he agency seizing the property may sell the property that is not required by law to be destroyed or transferred to another agency. The agency may retain any vehicle for official use or sell the vehicle. The agency seizing the property may deduct 50% of the amount received for administrative expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution reasonably incurred. The remainder shall be deposited in the school fund as the proceeds of the forfeiture. If the property forfeited under ss 973.075 to 973.077 is money, all the money shall be deposited in the school fund.

Buyers are subject to mandatory restitution orders under Wis. Stat. § 973.20(1r) (Restitution), which provides in part,

When imposing sentence or ordering probation for any crime, other than a crime involving conduct that constitutes domestic abuse under s. 813.12(1)(am) or 968.075(1)(a), for which the defendant was convicted, the court, in addition to any other penalty authorized by law, shall order the defendant to make full or partial restitution under this section to any victim of a crime considered at sentencing or, if

the victim is deceased, to his or her estate, unless the court finds substantial reason not to do so and states the reason on the record.¹⁸

Subsection (3)(a) states, “If a crime considered at sentencing resulted in bodily injury, the restitution order may require that the defendant do one or more” of the things listed in the statute, including “(a) Pay an amount equal to the cost of necessary medical and related professional services and devices relating to physical, psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.” In addition, subsection (4m) specifically provides restitution to minor victims of trafficking and states,

If the defendant violated s. 940.225 [Sexual assault], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], or 948.085 [Sexual assault of a child placed in substitute care], or s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking], if the court finds that the crime was sexually motivated, as defined in s. 980.01(5),¹⁹ and sub. (3)(a) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount, not to exceed 10,000, equal to the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment. The 10,000 limit under this subsection does not apply to the amount of any restitution ordered under sub. (3) or (5) for the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.

Finally, if the child sex trafficking statute applies to buyers, Wis. Stat. 973.20(4o) states,

If the defendant violated s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], and sub. (2) or (3) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount equal to any of the following:

- (a) The costs of necessary transportation, housing, and child care for the victim.
- (b) The greater of the following:
 1. The gross income gained by the defendant due to the services of the victim.
 2. The value of the victim’s services as provided under the state minimum wage.
- (c) Any expenses incurred by the victim if relocation for personal safety is determined to be necessary by the district attorney.
- (d) The costs of relocating the victim to his or her city, state, or country of origin.

2.9 *Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.12(1m) (Possession of child pornography) states,

Whoever possesses, or accesses in any way with the intent to view, any undeveloped film, photographic negative, photograph, motion picture, videotape, or other recording of a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct under all of the following circumstances penalized under sub. (3):

- (a) The person knows that he or she possesses or has accessed the material.
- (b) The person knows, or reasonably should know, that the material that is possessed or accessed contains depictions of sexually explicit conduct.
- (c) The person knows or reasonably should know that the child depicted in the material who is engaged in sexually explicit conduct has not attained the age of 18 years.

In addition, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 948.12(2m) (Possession of child pornography),

¹⁸ See *infra* Component 5.10 for full discussion of these restitution provisions.

¹⁹ Wis. Stat. § 980.01(5) states that “[s]exually motivated” means that one of the purposes for an act is for the actor’s sexual arousal or gratification or for the sexual humiliation or degradation of the victim.”

Whoever exhibits²⁰ or plays a recording of a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct, if all of the following apply, may be penalized under sub. (3):

- (a) The person knows that he or she has exhibited or played the recording.
- (b) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct.
- (c) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew or reasonably should have known that the child engaged in sexually explicit conduct had not attained the age of 18 years.”

Both of the above crimes are Class D felonies punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both, unless the defendant is under 18, in which case they are Class I felonies punishable by imprisonment up to 3½ years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.12(3)(a), (b), 939.50(3)(d), (i).

Wis. Stat. § 973.042(2) (Child pornography surcharge) provides, “If a court imposes a sentence or places a person on probation for a crime under s. 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child] or 948.12 [Possession of child pornography] and the person was at least 18 years of age when the crime was committed, the court shall impose a child pornography surcharge of 500 [sic] for each image or each copy of an image²¹ associated with the crime. The court shall determine the number of images or copies of images associated with the crime by a preponderance of the evidence and without a jury.”

In comparison, a federal conviction for possession of images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE)²² is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²³ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²⁴

2.10 *Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.*

Wis. Stat. § 301.45 (Sex offender registration) sets out the circumstances under which buyers of commercial sex acts with minors must register as sex offenders. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 301.45(1g)(a), with certain exceptions, “[A] person shall comply with the reporting requirements under this section if he or she . . . [i]s convicted or adjudicated delinquent on or after December 25, 1993, for a sex offense.” The definition of “sex offense” in Wis. Stat. § 301.45(1d)(b), includes “a violation, or the solicitation, conspiracy, or attempt to commit a violation” of, among other things, Wis. Stat. § 948.02(1) or (2) (Sexual assault of a child), § 948.051

²⁰ “‘Exhibit,’ with respect to a recording of an image that is not viewable in its recorded form, means to convert the recording of the image into a form in which the image may be viewed.” Wis. Stat. § 948.01(1d).

²¹ “In this section, ‘image’ includes a video recording, a visual representation, a positive or negative image on exposed film, and data representing a visual image.” Wis. Stat. § 973.042(1).

²² 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2)–(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a), (b) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

²³ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

²⁴ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years, but if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(4), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 10–20 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

(Trafficking of a child), § 948.07(1)–(4) (Child enticement), § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), and § 948.12 (Possession of child pornography). However, pursuant to subsection (1m)(a),

A person is not required to comply with the reporting requirements under this section if all of the following apply:

1. The person meets the criteria under sub. (1g) (a) to (dd) based on any violation, or on the solicitation, conspiracy or attempt to commit any violation, of s. 948.02 (1) or (2) [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025, or 948.085 (2).
- 1g. The violation, or the solicitation, conspiracy or attempt to commit the violation, of s. 948.02 (1) or (2), 948.025, or 948.085 (2) did not involve sexual intercourse, as defined in s. 948.01 (6), either by the use or threat of force or violence or with a victim under the age of 12 years.
2. At the time of the violation, or of the solicitation, conspiracy or attempt to commit the violation, of s. 948.02 (1) or (2), 948.025, or 948.085 (2), the person had not attained the age of 19 years and was not more than 4 years older or not more than 4 years younger than the child.
3. It is not necessary, in the interest of public protection, to require the person to comply with the reporting requirements under this section.

Furthermore, Wis. Stat. § 939.615(2)(a) (Lifetime supervision of serious sex offenders) states in part that, unless the individual has already been placed on lifetime supervision that has not been terminated, “if a person is convicted of a serious sex offense . . . the court may, in addition to sentencing the person . . . place the person on lifetime supervision by the department” According to Wis. Stat. § 939.615(1)(b), “serious sex offenses” includes, among other things, violations of Wis. Stat. § 948.02 (Sexual assault of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.07 (Child enticement), § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), and § 948.12 (Possession of child pornography).

Legal Components:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*
- 3.2 *Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
- 3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*
- 3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*
- 3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*
- 3.6 *Laws relating to termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.*

Legal Analysis:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.051(1) (Trafficking of a child) provides, “Whoever knowingly recruits, entices, provides, obtains, harbors, transports, patronizes, or solicits or knowingly attempts to recruit, entice, provide, obtain, harbor, transport, patronize, or solicit any child for the purpose of commercial sex acts, as defined in s. 940.302 (1)(a)²⁵ is guilty of a Class C felony.” A Class C felony is punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(c).

Convictions for violating Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution) or § 948.07 (Child enticement) are Class D felonies punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 948.07, 939.50(3)(d).

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²⁶ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1).

- 3.2 *Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child) states in part,

- (1) Whoever does any of the following with knowledge of the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child may be penalized under sub. (2p):
 - (a) Employs, uses, persuades, induces, entices, or coerces any child to engage in sexually explicit conduct for the purpose of recording or displaying in any way the conduct.
 - (b) Records or displays in any way a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct.

²⁵ See *supra* note 4.

²⁶ See *supra* note 15.

(1m) Whoever produces, performs in, profits from, promotes, imports into the state, reproduces, advertises, sells, distributes, or possesses with intent to sell or distribute, any recording of a child engaging in sexually explicit conduct may be penalized under sub. (2p) if the person knows the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child and if the person knows or reasonably should know that the child engaging in the sexually explicit conduct has not attained the age of 18 years.

....

A conviction is punishable as a Class C felony by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(a), 939.50(3)(c). However, if the offender is under 18, it is a Class F felony punishable by imprisonment up to 12 ½ years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(b), 939.50(3)(f). Also, if the offender is 18 or older, “the court shall impose a bifurcated sentence” with a prison portion of no less than 5 years. If “the court finds that the best interests of the community will be served and the public will not be harmed” and “the person is no more than 48 months older than the child who is the victim of violation,” a lesser sentence may be imposed. Wis. Stat. § 939.617(1),(2).

Wis. Stat. § 948.12(2m) (Possession of child pornography) states,

Whoever exhibits²⁷ or plays a recording of a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct, if all of the following apply, may be penalized under sub. (3):

- (a) The person knows that he or she has exhibited or played the recording.
- (b) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct.
- (c) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew or reasonably should have known that the child engaged in sexually explicit conduct had not attained the age of 18 years.

A defendant convicted under Wis. Stat. § 948.12(2m) is guilty of a Class D felony punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both, unless the defendant is under 18, in which case he is guilty of a Class I felony punishable by imprisonment up to 3 ½ years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.12(3)(a), (b), 939.50(3)(d), (i).

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²⁸ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). Additionally, a federal conviction for distribution of images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE)²⁹ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³⁰ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³¹

²⁷ See *supra* note 20.

²⁸ See *supra* note 15.

²⁹ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

³⁰ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); see also 18 U.S.C.

3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*

Although not expressly commercial in nature, Wis. Stat. § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime) prohibits a person from using the Internet to lure or entice a minor under 16 years of age to engage in commercial sex acts. However, this law also requires the defendant to lure the child “with intent to have sexual contact or sexual intercourse with the individual in violation of 948.02 (1) or (2) [Sexual assault of a child].” Therefore, its applicability is limited to traffickers who act with this intent.

3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*

A trafficker convicted under Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) may face a fine of \$100,000. Wis. Stat. § 948.051(1), 939.50(3)(c). Traffickers may also face \$100,000 fines for convictions under Wis. Stat. § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), and § 948.07 (Child enticement). Wis. Stat. §§ 948.08, 948.05(2p)(a), 948.07, 939.50(3)(c), (d).

Criminal forfeiture of a trafficker’s assets may be required, at the discretion of the court, under Wis. Stat. § 973.075 (Forfeiture of property derived from crime and certain vehicles), which provides for forfeiture of “[a]ll property, real or personal, including money, directly or indirectly derived from or realized through the commission of any crime,” and any vehicles used, among other purposes, “[t]o transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony” or used “[i]n the commission of a crime in violation of s. 944.30 [Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33 [Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping place of prostitution], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or 948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors].” Wis. Stat. § 973.075(1)(a), (b)(1m)(a), (c). Property may be seized, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.075(2)(d), when there is “. . . probable cause to believe that the property was derived from or realized through a crime, or was used in a crime under s. 948.07, or that the property is a vehicle which was used to transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony,” or pursuant to a court order or search warrant.

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. §973.075(2) “A law enforcement officer may seize property subject to this section upon process issued by any court of record having jurisdiction over the property.” Seizure without process is permissible under certain enumerated circumstances, but is not permissible for vehicles used in the commission of a violation of s. 944.30[Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33 [Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping a place of prostitution], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or

§§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

³¹ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors]. Wis. Stat. §973.075(2). Distribution of forfeited property is governed by Wis. Stat. § 973.075(4), which states,

[T]he agency seizing the property may sell the property that is not required by law to be destroyed or transferred to another agency. The agency may retain any vehicle for official use or sell the vehicle. The agency seizing the property may deduct 50% of the amount received for administrative expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution reasonably incurred. The remainder shall be deposited in the school fund as the proceeds of the forfeiture. If the property forfeited under ss. 973.075 to 973.077 is money, all the money shall be deposited in the school fund.

Traffickers are subject to mandatory restitution orders, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.20(1r) (Restitution), which provides in part,

When imposing sentence or ordering probation for any crime, other than a crime involving conduct that constitutes domestic abuse under s. 813.12 (1) (am) or 968.075 (1) (a), for which the defendant was convicted, the court, in addition to any other penalty authorized by law, shall order the defendant to make full or partial restitution under this section to any victim of a crime considered at sentencing or, if the victim is deceased, to his or her estate, unless the court finds substantial reason not to do so and states the reason on the record.³²

Subsection (3)(a) states, “If a crime considered at sentencing resulted in bodily injury, the restitution order may require that the defendant,” among other things, “(a) Pay an amount equal to the cost of necessary medical and related professional services and devices relating to physical, psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.” In addition, subsection (4m) specifically provides restitution to minor victims of trafficking and states,

If the defendant violated . . . 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], . . . 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], . . . and sub. (3) (a) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount, not to exceed \$10,000, equal to the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment. The \$10,000 limit under this subsection does not apply to the amount of any restitution ordered under sub. (3) or (5) for the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.

Also, Wis. Stat. 973.20(4o) states,

If the defendant violated s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], and sub. (2) or (3) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount equal to any of the following:

- (a) The costs of necessary transportation, housing, and child care for the victim.
- (b) The greater of the following:
 1. The gross income gained by the defendant due to the services of the victim.
 2. The value of the victims services as provided under the state minimum wage.
- (c) Any expenses incurred by the victim if relocation for personal safety is determined to be necessary by the district attorney.
- (d) The costs of relocating the victim to his or her city, state, or country of origin.

Wis. Stat. § 973.042(2) (Child pornography surcharge) provides, “If a court imposes a sentence or places a person on probation for a crime under s. 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child] or 948.12 [Possession of child pornography] and the person was at least 18 years of age when the crime was committed, the court shall impose

³² See *infra* Component 5.10 for full discussion of these restitution provisions.

a child pornography surcharge of \$500 for each image³³ or each copy of an image associated with the crime. The court shall determine the number of images or copies of images associated with the crime by a preponderance of the evidence and without a jury.”

Lastly, traffickers who receive a sentence or probation are also subject to Wis. Stat. § 973.045(1) (Crime victim and witness assistance surcharge), which provides that a “crime victim and witness assistance surcharge” of \$67 for every “misdemeanor count on which a conviction occurred” and \$92 for every “felony count on which a conviction occurred” shall be imposed. The surcharge is the total amount of adding up the amount for every misdemeanor count and every felony count. It “may not be waived, reduced, or forgiven for any reason.” § 973.045(1).

3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 301.45(1g)(a), with certain exceptions, “[A] person shall comply with the reporting requirements under this section if he or she . . . [i]s convicted or adjudicated delinquent on or after December 25, 1993, for a sex offense.” The definition of “sex offense” at Wis. Stat. § 301.45(1d)(b), includes “a violation, or the solicitation, conspiracy, or attempt to commit a violation” of, among other things, Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.07(1)–(4) (Child enticement), § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), and § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution).

Furthermore, Wis. Stat. § 939.615 (Lifetime supervision of serious sex offenders) states in part that, unless the individual has already been placed on lifetime supervision that has not been terminated, “if a person is convicted of a serious sex offense . . . the court may, in addition to sentencing the person . . . place the person on lifetime supervision by the department” According to Wis. Stat. § 939.615(1)(b), “serious sex offenses” includes, among other things, violations of Wis. Stat. § 948.05(1), (1m) (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.07 (Child enticement), § 948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), and § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution).

3.6 *Laws relating to termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.*

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 48.415 (Grounds for involuntary termination of parental rights),

Grounds for termination of parental rights shall be one of the following:

....

(9m) Commission of a felony against a child

....

(am) Commission of a violation of s. 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) involving any child or a violation of the law of any other state or federal law, if that violation would be a violation of s. 948.051 involving any child if committed in this state.

³³ See *supra* note 21.

Legal Components:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*
 - 4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*
 - 4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*
 - 4.4 *Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
-

Legal Analysis:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*

Facilitators of trafficking and those who benefit financially may be charged with trafficking under Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child). Subsection (1) states, “Whoever knowingly recruits, entices, provides, obtains, harbors, transports, patronizes, or solicits or knowingly attempts to recruit, entice, provide, obtain harbor, transport, patronize, or solicit any child for the purpose of commercial sex acts, as defined in s. 940.302 (1)(a) is guilty of a Class C felony.” Subsection (2) states, “Whoever benefits in any manner from a violation of sub. (1) is guilty of a Class C felony if the person knows that the benefits come from an act described in sub. (1).” A conviction under either subsection is punishable as a Class C felony punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.051(1)(2), 939.50(3)(c).

- 4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*

A conviction of Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) carries a fine of \$100,000. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.051(1), 939.50(3)(c).

Facilitators may be subject to discretionary, criminal asset forfeiture under Wis. Stat. § 973.075, which provides for forfeiture of “[a]ll property, real or personal, including money, directly or indirectly derived from or realized through the commission of any crime,” and any vehicles used, among other purposes, “[t]o transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony” or vehicles used “[i]n the commission of a crime in violation of s. 944.30 [Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33 [Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping place of prostitution], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or 948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors].” Wis. Stat. § 973.075(1)(a), (b)(1m)(a), (c). Property may be seized, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.075(2)(d), when there is “. . . probable cause to believe that the property was derived from or realized through a crime, or was used in a crime under s. 948.07, or that the property is a vehicle which was used to transport any property or weapon used or to be used or received in the commission of any felony,” or pursuant to a court order or search warrant.

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. §973.075(2) “A law enforcement officer may seize property subject to this section upon process issued by any court of record having jurisdiction over the property.” Seizure without process is permissible under certain enumerated circumstances, but is not permissible for vehicles used in the commission of a violation of s. 944.30[Prostitution], 944.31 [Patronizing prostitutes], 944.32 [Soliciting prostitutes], 944.33

[Pandering], 944.34 [Keeping a place of prostitution] 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity], 948.06 [Incest with a child], 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], 948.10 [Exposing genitals, pubic area, or intimate parts], 948.12 [Possession of child pornography], or 948.14 [Registered sex offender and photographing minors]. Wis. Stat. §973.075(2). Distribution of forfeited property is governed by Wis. Stat. § 973.075(4), which states,

[T]he agency seizing the property may sell the property that is not required by law to be destroyed or transferred to another agency. The agency may retain any vehicle for official use or sell the vehicle. The agency seizing the property may deduct 50% of the amount received for administrative expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution reasonably incurred. The remainder shall be deposited in the school fund as the proceeds of the forfeiture. If the property forfeited under ss. 973.075 to 973.077 is money, all the money shall be deposited in the school fund.

To the extent that it applies to facilitators, a conviction under Wis. Stat. § 946.83(3) (Prohibited activities) of the Wisconsin Organized Crime Control Act, is punishable as a Class E felony by a maximum fine of \$50,000. Wis. Stat. §§ 946.84(1), 939.50(3)(e). Instead of the fine listed in Wis. Stat. § 939.50(3)(e), “any person convicted of engaging in conduct in violation of s. 946.83, through which he or she derived pecuniary value, or by which he or she caused personal injury or property damage or other loss, may be fined not to exceed 2 times the gross value gained or 2 times the gross loss caused, whichever is the greater, plus court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution, reasonably incurred.” Wis. Stat. § 946.84(2).

Additionally, violation of Wis. Stat. § 946.83 or Wis. Stat. § 946.85 shall be grounds for mandatory criminal forfeiture “of all real or personal property used in the course of, or intended for use in the course of, derived from or realized through conduct in violation of s. 946.83 or 946.85.” Wis. Stat. § 946.86(1). “Any injured person has a right or claim to forfeited property or the proceeds derived therefrom superior to any right or claim the state has under this section in the same property or proceeds.” Wis. Stat. § 946.86(4). In addition to criminal penalties and forfeiture, Wis. Stat. § 946.87(2)(a) (Civil remedies) provides for civil forfeiture to the state of “[a]ll property, real or personal, including money, used in the course of, intended for use in the course of, derived from, or realized through, conduct which has resulted in a conviction for violation of s. 946.83 or 946.85.”

Facilitators are subject to mandatory restitution orders pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 973.20(1r) (Restitution), which provides in part,

When imposing sentence or ordering probation for any crime, other than a crime involving conduct that constitutes domestic abuse under s. 813.12 (1) (am) or 968.075 (1) (a), for which the defendant was convicted, the court, in addition to any other penalty authorized by law, shall order the defendant to make full or partial restitution under this section to any victim of a crime considered at sentencing or, if the victim is deceased, to his or her estate, unless the court finds substantial reason not to do so and states the reason on the record.

Subsection (3)(a) states, “If a crime considered at sentencing resulted in bodily injury, the restitution order may require that the defendant,” among other things, “(a) Pay an amount equal to the cost of necessary medical and related professional services and devices relating to physical, psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.” In addition, subsection (4m) specifically provides restitution to minor victims of trafficking and states in part,

If the defendant violated . . . 948.051 [Trafficking of a child] . . . and sub. (3) (a) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount, not to exceed \$10,000, equal to the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment. The

\$10,000 limit under this subsection does not apply to the amount of any restitution ordered under sub. (3) or (5) for the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.

Also, Wis. Stat. § 973.20(4o) states,

If the defendant violated s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], and sub. (2) or (3) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount equal to any of the following:

- (a) The costs of necessary transportation, housing, and child care for the victim.
- (b) The greater of the following:
 - 1. The gross income gained by the defendant due to the services of the victim.
 - 2. The value of the victim's services as provided under the state minimum wage.
- (c) Any expenses incurred by the victim if relocation for personal safety is determined to be necessary by the district attorney.
- (d) The costs of relocating the victim to his or her city, state, or country of origin.

4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*

Wisconsin has no statute specifically related to sex tourism.

- 4.3.1 Recommendation: Enact a law prohibiting selling or offering to sell travel services that include or facilitate travel for the purpose of engaging in commercial sexual exploitation of a minor or prostitution of a minor in Wisconsin.

4.4 *Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child) provides penalties for promoting or selling images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE). Wis. Stat. § 948.05(1)(b) states, "Whoever . . . with knowledge of the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child . . . Records or displays in any way a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct." In addition, Wis. Stat. § 948.05(1m) states, "Whoever produces, performs in, profits from, promotes, imports into the state, reproduces, advertises, sells, distributes, or possesses with intent to sell or distribute, any recording of a child engaging in sexually explicit conduct may be penalized under sub. (2p) if the person knows the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct involving the child and if the person knows or reasonably should know that the child engaging in the sexually explicit conduct has not attained the age of 18 years." Convictions by those over 18 of the above provisions are punishable as Class C felonies by imprisonment up to 40 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(a), 939.50(3)(c). Also, "the court shall impose a bifurcated sentence" with a prison portion of no less than 5 years. If "the court finds that the best interests of the community will be served and the public will not be harmed," and "the person is no more than 48 months older than the child who is the victim of violation" a lesser sentence may be imposed. Wis. Stat. § 939.617(1), (2). If the actor is under 18, a conviction of either provision is punishable as a Class F felony punishable by imprisonment up to 12½ years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.05(2p)(b), 939.50(3)(f).

Wis. Stat. § 948.12(2m) states,

Whoever exhibits or plays a recording of a child engaged in sexually explicit conduct, if all of the following apply, may be penalized . . . :

- (a) The person knows that he or she has exhibited or played the recording.
- (b) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew the character and content of the sexually explicit conduct.

(c) Before the person exhibited or played the recording, he or she knew or reasonably should have known that the child engaged in sexually explicit conduct had not attained the age of 18 years.

A conviction under Wis. Stat. § 948.12(2m) is punishable as a Class D felony by imprisonment up to 25 years, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both, unless the defendant is under 18, in which case it is punishable as a Class I felony by imprisonment up to 3 ½ years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Wis. Stat. §§ 948.12(3)(a), (b), 939.50(3)(d), (i).

Wis. Stat. § 973.042(2) (Child pornography surcharge) provides,

If a court imposes a sentence or places a person on probation for a crime under s. 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child] or 948.12 [Possession of child pornography] and the person was at least 18 years of age when the crime was committed, the court shall impose a child pornography surcharge of \$500 for each image or each copy of an image associated with the crime. The court shall determine the number of images or copies of images associated with the crime by a preponderance of the evidence and without a jury.

Legal Components:

- 5.1 *Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.*
- 5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based upon the willingness of a minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.*
- 5.3 *State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*
- 5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*
- 5.5 *Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*
- 5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*
- 5.7 *Crime victims’ compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*
- 5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*
- 5.9 *Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.*
- 5.10 *Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.*
- 5.11 *Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.*

Legal Analysis:

- 5.1 *Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.³⁴*

Wisconsin’s core human trafficking offense likely includes all commercially sexually exploited children. Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) does not discuss the elements of force, fraud, or coercion related to the trafficking of a minor; however, such elements were expressly included within the trafficking statute applicable to adults.³⁵ Therefore, it can be presumed that the statute was written intentionally to exclude the requirement in cases of domestic minor sex trafficking.

Additionally, Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) provides criminal liability for buyers of sex with minors,³⁶ thus, buying sex with a person under the age of eighteen constitutes human trafficking. Furthermore, the offense of human trafficking under Wis. Stat. § 948.051 does not require that a trafficker or controlling third party be identified. Resultantly, Wisconsin’s human trafficking offense includes any child who is bought for sex, regardless of the presence of force, fraud, or coercion, whether or not a buyer exploited the child without the trafficker’s involvement, and regardless of whether the victim identifies a trafficker. Wis. Stat. § 948.051.

³⁴ See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, “Eliminating the Third Party Control Barrier to Identifying Juvenile Sex Trafficking Victims,” JuST Response Policy Paper (2015), http://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Policy-Paper_Eliminating-Third-Party-Control_Final1.pdf (discussing need to include all commercially sexually exploited children within sex trafficking definitions and corresponding need to include buyer conduct in core sex trafficking offenses regardless of whether victim is under control of a third party).

³⁵ See *supra* note 2.

³⁶ See *supra* Component 2.1.

- 5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based upon the willingness of minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.*

Wisconsin’s sex trafficking and CSEC offenses are silent with regard to the availability of a defense based on the minor’s willingness to engage in the commercial sex act.

- 5.2.1 Recommendation: Amend Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) and Wisconsin’s CSEC statutes to expressly prohibit a defense based on the willingness of the minor to engage in the commercial sexual act.

- 5.3 *State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*³⁷

Wisconsin’s prostitution law does not prohibit the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses; however, the law does distinguish between minors and adults to provide a diversion process for minors. Wis. Stat. § 944.30 (2m) (Prostitution) states,

If the person under sub. (1m) has not attained the age of 18 years and if the court determines that the best interests of the person are served and society will not be harmed, the court may enter a consent decree under . . . or a deferred prosecution agreement

Additionally, Wis. Stat. § 939.46(1m) (Coercion) states, “A victim of a violation of s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child] has an affirmative defense for any offense committed as a direct result of the violation of s. 940.302 (2) or 948.051 without regard to whether anyone was prosecuted or convicted for the violation of s. 940.302 (2) or 948.051. Although this provision provides child sex trafficking victims with an affirmative defense to prostitution-related charges, the victims are still subject to prosecution.

- 5.3.1 Recommendation: Amend state law to ensure that all minors are protected from criminalization for prostitution offenses.

- 5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*

System response to child engaged in commercial sex act

Under Wis. Stat. § 48.02 (Definitions), a juvenile sex trafficking victim will likely be identified as abused or neglected.³⁸ To aid in the identification and protection of these sexually exploited children, Wisconsin’s mandated reporter laws eliminate an exception that removes a health care provider’s duty to report suspected sexual abuse of a child under his or her care if a third party is exploiting the child. Specifically, Wis. Stat. § 48.981(2m) (Abused or neglected children and abused unborn children) provides,

-
(c) Except as provided under pars. (d) and (e), the following persons are not required to report as suspected or threatened abuse, as defined in s. 48.02 (1)(b), sexual intercourse or sexual contact involving a child:
1. A health care provider³⁹ who provides any health care service⁴⁰ to a child.

³⁷ For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see: <http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo>.

³⁸ See *infra* Components 5.5 and 5.6 for provisions concerning child abuse and neglect.

³⁹ “‘Health care provider’ means a physician, as defined under s. 448.01 (5), a physician assistant, as defined under s. 448.01 (6), or a nurse holding a certificate of registration under s. 441.06 (1) or a license under s. 441.10 (3).” Wis. Stat. § 48.981(2m)(b)(1).

....
4. A person who obtains information about a child who is receiving or has received health care services from a health care provider.
(d) Any person described under par. (c) 1. or 4. shall report as required under sub. (2) if he or she has reason to suspect any of the following:

....
5. That another participant in the sexual contact or sexual intercourse was or is exploiting the child.
(e) In addition to the reporting requirements under par. (d), a person described under par. (c) 1. or 4. shall report as required under sub. (2) if he or she has any reasonable doubt as to the voluntariness of the child's participation in the sexual contact or sexual intercourse.

However, a juvenile sex trafficking victim may be adjudicated delinquent⁴¹ for prostitution and other offenses committed pursuant to his or her victimization, but a delinquency adjudication for prostitution may be avoided under Wis. Stat. § 944.30 (2m) (Prostitution), which states,

If the person under sub. (1m) has not attained the age of 18 years and if the court determines that the best interests of the person are served and society will not be harmed, the court may enter a consent decree⁴² . . . or a deferred prosecution agreement

Regardless of whether the child is identified as abused, neglected, or delinquent, however, Wisconsin law does not require the provision of specialized services.

Summary

Wisconsin law does not mandate immunity for offenses committed as a result of the trafficking victimization, but a delinquency adjudication for prostitution may be avoided through a permissive diversionary process. Regardless, Wisconsin law does not provide an avenue to specialized services.

5.4.1 Recommendation: Amend Wisconsin's protective response for juvenile sex trafficking victims to include specialized services and a mandatory mechanism to prevent delinquency adjudications.

⁴⁰ “‘Health care service’ means family planning services, as defined in s. 253.07 (1) (b), 1995 stats, pregnancy testing, obstetrical health care or screening, diagnosis and treatment for a sexually transmitted disease.” Wis. Stat. § 48.981(2m)(b)(2).

⁴¹ Wis. Stat. § 938.02(3m) defines “delinquent” as “a juvenile who is 10 years of age or older who has violated any state or federal criminal law, except as provided in ss. 938.17 [Jurisdiction over traffic, boating, snowmobile, and all-terrain vehicle violations and over civil law and ordinance violations], 938.18 [Jurisdiction for criminal proceedings for juveniles 14 or older; waiver hearing] and 938.183 [Original adult court jurisdiction for criminal proceedings], or who has committed a contempt of court, as defined in s. 785.01(1), as specified in s. 938.355(6g).”

⁴² Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 938.32(1)(a) (Consent decree)

At any time after the filing of a petition for a proceeding relating to s. 938.12 or 938.13 and before the entry of judgment, the court may suspend the proceedings and place the juvenile under supervision in the juvenile's own home or present placement. The court may establish terms and conditions applicable to the parent, guardian, or legal custodian, and to the juvenile, including any of the conditions specified in subs. (1d), (1g), (1m), (1p), (1t), (1v), and (1x). The order under this section shall be known as a consent decree and must be agreed to by the juvenile; the parent, guardian, or legal custodian; and the person filing the petition under s. 938.25. If the consent decree includes any conditions specified in sub. (1g), the consent decree shall include provisions for payment of the services as specified in s. 938.361. The consent decree shall be in writing and be given to the parties.

5.5 *Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*⁴³

The definition of “abuse” within the Children’s Code Wis. Stat. § 48.02(1) (Definitions), includes both child sex trafficking and child sexual exploitation. Wis. Stat. § 48.02(1) defines “abuse” as,

....

(b) Sexual intercourse or sexual contact under s. 940.225 [Sexual assault], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], or 948.085 [Sexual assault of a child placed in substitute care].

(c) A violation of s. 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child].

(cm) A violation of s. 948.051 [Trafficking of a child].

(d) Permitting, allowing or encouraging a child to violate s. [Prostitution].

(e) A violation of s. 948.055 [Causing a child to view or listen to sexual activity].

(f) A violation of s. 948.10 [Exposing genitals or pubic area].

....

5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*

Wis. Stat. § 48.981(am) (Abused or neglected children and abused unborn children), which sets out the requirements for reporting neglect and abuse, states, for purposes of that section,

“Caregiver” means, with respect to a child who is the victim or alleged victim of abuse or neglect or who is threatened with abuse or neglect, any of the following persons:

1. The child’s parent, grandparent, great grandparent, step-parent, brother, sister, step-brother, stepsister, half-brother, or half-sister.
2. The child’s guardian.
3. The child’s legal custodian.
4. A person who resides or has resided regularly or intermittently in the same dwelling as the child.
5. An employee of a residential facility or residential care center for children and youth in which the child was or is placed.
6. A person who provides or has provided care for the child in or outside of the child’s home.
7. Any other person who exercises or has exercised temporary or permanent control over the child or who temporarily or permanently supervises or has supervised the child.
8. Any relative of the child other than a relative specified in subd.1.

However, where a perpetrator does not fall under the definition of “caregiver” pursuant to Wis. Stat § 48.981(am), Wis. Stat. § 48.981(3)(a) allows a referral of suspected instances of non-caregiver abuse to child welfare. Wis. Stat. § 48.981(3)(a)(2d) provides

The sheriff or police department may refer to the county department . . . a case reported to the sheriff or police department in which a person who is not a caregiver is suspected of abuse or of threatened abuse of a child.

Correspondingly, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 48.02(1) (Definitions), the definition of abuse in the Children’s Code does not require fault of a parent or caregiver.⁴⁴ Therefore, child victims of commercial sexual exploitation are eligible to receive child welfare protection and services irrespective of the perpetrator of the abuse.

⁴³ For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see:

<http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo>.

⁴⁴ See *supra* Component 5.5. for discussion of definition of “abuse.”

5.7 *Crime victims' compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*

Wis. Stat. § 949.03(1)(b) (Compensable acts) specifically includes the following CSEC, trafficking and sex offenses as offenses for which victims may be compensated: Wis. Stat. § 948.02 (Sexual assault of a child), § 948.025 (Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child), § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.06 (Incest with a child), § 948.07 (Child enticement), §948.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), § 948.09 (Sexual intercourse with a child 16 or older). Wis. Stat. § 949.03(1)(b).

However, Wis. Stat. § 949.08 (Limitations on awards) does not provide exceptions for minor victims of trafficking or other commercial sexual exploitation crimes from the limitations on awards. Wis. Stat. § 949.08(1) requires that “the application was made within 1 year after the date of the personal injury or death, and the personal injury or death was the result of an incident or offense which had been reported to the police within 5 days of its occurrence or, if the incident or offense could not reasonably have been reported within such period, within 5 days of the time when a report could reasonably have been made. The department may waive the one-year requirement under this subsection in the interest of justice.” In addition, Wis. Stat. § 949.08(2), (2m) state in part,

- (2) No award may be ordered if the victim:
 - (a) Engaged in conduct which substantially contributed to the infliction of the victim’s injury or death or in which the victim could have reasonably foreseen could lead to the injury or death. This does not apply to awards to victims under s. 949.03 (1) (a).
 - (b) Committed a crime which caused or contributed to the victim’s injury or death.
 - (d) Has not cooperated with appropriate law enforcement agencies.

.....

- (2m) If a claimant other than a victim has not cooperated with the department in the administration of the program, no award may be ordered for the claimant.

5.7.1 Recommendation: Amend Wis. Stat. § 949.08 (Limitations on awards) to make the listed limitations on awards inapplicable to victims of trafficking and CSEC crimes, with a good cause exception to the limitation in Wis. Stat. § 949.08(2)(d).

5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*

Wisconsin state law provides several pre-trial and trial procedures and protections for minors, including those specifically for victims of sex trafficking and exploitation. Furthermore, Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2) (Evidence and practice; civil rules applicable) provides special rules for the admission of evidence in cases involving certain sex offenses and crimes against children, including trafficking of a child under Wis. Stat. § 948.051. Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2)(b) (commonly called a “rape shield law”) provides,

If the defendant is accused of a crime under s. 940.225 [Sexual assault], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault against the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], . . . 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], . . . 948.09 [Sexual intercourse with a child age 16 or older], . . . or under s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking], if the court finds that the crime was sexually motivated, as defined in s. 980.01 (5), any evidence concerning the complaining witness’s prior sexual conduct⁴⁵ or opinions of the witness’s prior sexual conduct and reputation as to prior sexual conduct shall not be

⁴⁵ Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2)(a) states, “In this subsection, ‘sexual conduct’ means any conduct or behavior relating to sexual activities of the complaining witness, including but not limited to prior experience of sexual intercourse or sexual contact, use of contraceptives, living arrangement and life-style.”

admitted into evidence during the course of the hearing or trial, nor shall any reference to such conduct be made in the presence of the jury, except the following, subject to s. 971.31 (11):⁴⁶

1. Evidence of the complaining witness's past conduct with the defendant.
2. Evidence of specific instances of sexual conduct showing the source or origin of semen, pregnancy or disease, for use in determining the degree of sexual assault or the extent of injury suffered.
3. Evidence of prior untruthful allegations of sexual assault made by the complaining witness.

The court may order testimony of any child witness to be taken via closed-circuit television under Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m), if all of the following apply. First, the court must find that the “the presence of the defendant during the taking of the child’s testimony will result in the child suffering serious emotional distress such that the child cannot reasonably communicate” and that taking the child’s testimony in another room and “simultaneously televising the testimony in the courtroom by means of closed-circuit audiovisual equipment is necessary to minimize the trauma to the child of testifying in the courtroom setting and to provide a setting more amenable to securing the child witness’s uninhibited, truthful testimony.” Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m)(a)(1). Second, the trial in which the child witness may be called will start before the child turns 12 or before the child turns 16 if “the court finds that the interests of justice warrant that the child's testimony be taken in a room other than the courtroom and simultaneously televised in the courtroom by means of closed-circuit audiovisual equipment.” Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m)(a)(2). In determining “interests of justice,” the court may consider the following factors under Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m)(b), including,

1. The child’s chronological age, level of development and capacity to comprehend the significance of the events and to verbalize about them.
2. The child’s general physical and mental health.
3. Whether the events about which the child will testify constituted criminal or antisocial conduct against the child or a person with whom the child had a close emotional relationship and, if the conduct constituted a battery or a sexual assault, its duration and the extent of physical or emotional injury thereby caused.
4. The child’s custodial situation and the attitude of other household members to the events about which the child will testify and to the underlying proceeding.
5. The child’s familial or emotional relationship to those involved in the underlying proceeding.
6. The child’s behavior at or reaction to previous interviews concerning the events involved.
7. Whether the child blames himself or herself for the events involved or has ever been told by any person not to disclose them; whether the child’s prior reports to associates or authorities of the events have been disbelieved or not acted upon; and the child’s subjective belief regarding what consequences to himself or herself, or persons with whom the child has a close emotional relationship, will ensue from providing testimony.
8. Whether the child manifests or has manifested symptoms associated with posttraumatic stress disorder or other mental disorders, including, without limitation, reexperiencing the events, fear of their repetition, withdrawal, regression, guilt, anxiety, stress, nightmares, enuresis, lack of self-esteem, mood changes, compulsive behaviors, school problems, delinquent or antisocial behavior, phobias or changes in interpersonal relationships.

....

If the court orders a child’s testimony is taken by closed-circuit television, the court is directed to do several things, including, scheduling the testimony during a time when the child’s energy and attention span should be the greatest and on a date when the child’s recollection should be fresh, provide a room for the testimony that has adequate privacy, try to put the child at ease before questioning begins, and decide if the child understands

⁴⁶ Wis. Stat. § 971.31(11) states in part that “evidence which is admissible under s. 972.11 (2) must be determined by the court upon pretrial motion to be material to a fact at issue in the case and of sufficient probative value to outweigh its inflammatory and prejudicial nature before it may be introduced at trial.”

that “it is wrong to tell a lie and will testify truthfully if the child’s developmental level or verbal skills are such that administration of an oath or affirmation in the usual form would be inappropriate.” Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m)(bm).

Wis. Stat. § 972.11(2m)(c) restricts the persons who may be present during the child’s testimony to include only the camera operator, the parents or guardian of the child, and “[o]ne person designated by the attorney for the state and approved by the court and one person designated by either the defendant or the attorney for the defendant and approved by the court.”

Additionally, pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 950.045 (Accompaniment of victim advocate), victims of human trafficking, child sexual abuse, or sexual assault are entitled to have a victim advocate present in various pre-trial and trial procedures, including law enforcement interviews and court proceedings. Further, under Wis. Stat. § 905.045(2) (Domestic violence or sexual assault advocate-victim privilege), all communications between victims and victim advocates are considered confidential and therefore, such communications are prevented from being disclosed or obtained if they were made for the “purpose of providing counseling, assistance, or support services to the victim.”

Victims of human trafficking under Wis. Stat. § 940.302 may also be eligible to participate in Wisconsin’s Address Confidentiality Program administered by the Department of Justice (DOJ), pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 165.68 (Address confidentiality program). So long as a victim is a resident of Wisconsin, has been identified as a victim of human trafficking, fears for his or her safety, and has not disclosed his or her address to the offender, the DOJ is mandated to both assign a confidential mailing address to the victim and to prevent the disclosure of the victim’s address to any person, barring a court order to the contrary.

5.9 *Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.*

Wisconsin law allows child sex trafficking victims to petition for vacatur and expungement immediately and within a single proceeding, but limits relief to adjudications for prostitution. Specifically, Wis. Stat. § 973.015(2m) (Special disposition) states,

At any time after a person has been convicted, adjudicated delinquent, or found not guilty by reason of mental disease or defect for a violation of s. 944.30 [Prostitution], a court may, upon the motion of the person, vacate the conviction, adjudication, or finding, or may order that the record of the violation of s. 944.30 be expunged, if all of the following apply:

- (a) The person was a victim of trafficking for the purposes of a commercial sex act, as defined in s. 940.302 (1) (a), under s. 940.302 or 948.051 or under 22 USC 7101 to 7112.
- (b) The person committed the violation of s. 944.30 as a result of being a victim of trafficking for the purposes of a commercial sex act
-
- (d) The person made the motion with due diligence subject to reasonable concern for the safety of himself or herself, family members, or other victims of trafficking for the purpose of a commercial sex act or subject to other reasons consistent with the safety of persons.
-

Because relief is limited to adjudications for prostitution, however, a minor would not be able to vacate adjudications for other offenses related to trafficking victimization and would be subject to a waiting period in order to expunge those records. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 938.355(4m) (Dispositional orders),

A juvenile who has been adjudged delinquent under s. 48.12, 1993 stats., or s. 938.12 may, on attaining 17 years of age, petition the court to expunge the courts record of the juvenile’s adjudication. Subject to par. (b), the court may expunge the record if the court determines that the juvenile has satisfactorily

complied with the conditions of his or her dispositional order and that the juvenile will benefit from, and society will not be harmed by, the expungement.

Accordingly, a child sex trafficking victim must reach age 17 before other records may be expunged, which may subject the child to collateral consequences associated with having accessible delinquency records during that time.

5.9.1 Recommendation: Amend Wis. Stat. § 973.015(2m) (Special disposition) to allow child sex trafficking victims to vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for other offenses arising from their trafficking victimization.

5.10 *Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.*

Restitution may be available to victims of trafficking and CSEC crimes under Wis. Stat. § 973.20(1r) (Restitution), which provides in part, “When imposing sentence or ordering probation for any crime, other than a crime involving conduct that constitutes domestic abuse under s. 813.12(1)(am) or 968.075(1)(a), for which the defendant was convicted, the court, in addition to any other penalty authorized by law, shall order the defendant to make full or partial restitution under this section to any victim of a crime considered at sentencing or, if the victim is deceased, to his or her estate, unless the court finds substantial reason not to do so and states the reason on the record.” Wis. Stat. § 973.20(3)(a) states, “If a crime considered at sentencing resulted in bodily injury, the restitution order may require that the defendant,” among other things, “(a) Pay an amount equal to the cost of necessary medical and related professional services and devices relating to physical, psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.” In addition, Wis. Stat. § 973.20(5) states,

In any case, the restitution order may require that the defendant do one or more of the following:

- (a) Pay all special damages, but not general damages, substantiated by evidence in the record, which could be recovered in a civil action against the defendant for his or her conduct in the commission of a crime considered at sentencing.
- (b) Pay an amount equal to the income lost, and reasonable out-of-pocket expenses incurred, by the person against whom a crime considered at sentencing was committed resulting from the filing of charges or cooperating in the investigation and prosecution of the crime.
- (c) Reimburse any person or agency for amounts paid as rewards for information leading to the apprehension or successful prosecution of the defendant for a crime for which the defendant was convicted or to the apprehension or prosecution of the defendant for a read-in crime.
- (d) If justice so requires, reimburse any insurer, surety or other person who has compensated a victim for a loss otherwise compensable under this section.

Wis. Stat. § 973.20(4m) specifically provides restitution to minor victims of trafficking by stating,

If the defendant violated s. 940.225 [Sexual assault], 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child], 948.05 [Sexual exploitation of a child], 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], 948.06, 948.07 [Child enticement], 948.08 [Soliciting a child for prostitution], or 948.085 [Sexual assault of a child placed in substitute care] or s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking], if the court finds that the crime was sexually motivated, as defined in s. 980.01(5)⁴⁷ [Definitions],⁴⁸ and sub. (3) (a) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount, not to exceed \$10,000, equal to the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment. The \$10,000 limit under this subsection does not

⁴⁷ Wis. Stat. § 980.01 (5) defines “sexually motivated” to mean “that one of the purposes for an act is for the actor's sexual arousal or gratification or for the sexual humiliation or degradation of the victim.”

⁴⁸ See *supra* note 19.

apply to the amount of any restitution ordered under sub. (3) or (5) for the cost of necessary professional services relating to psychiatric and psychological care and treatment.

Finally, Wis. Stat. § 973.20(4o) states,

If the defendant violated s. 940.302 (2) [Human trafficking] or 948.051 [Trafficking of a child], and sub. (2) or (3) does not apply, the restitution order may require that the defendant pay an amount equal to any of the following:

- (a) The costs of necessary transportation, housing, and child care for the victim.
- (b) The greater of the following:
 - 1. The gross income gained by the defendant due to the services of the victim.
 - 2. The value of the victims services as provided under the state minimum wage.
- (c) Any expenses incurred by the victim to his or her city, state, or country of origin.
- (d) The costs of relocating the victim to his or her city, state, or country of origin.

Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) provides victims with a civil cause of action. Wis. Stat. § 948.051(3) states, “Any person who incurs an injury or death as a result of a violation of sub. (1) or (2) may bring a civil action against the person who committed the violation. In addition to actual damages, the court may award punitive damages to the injured party, not to exceed treble the amount of actual damages incurred, and reasonable attorney fees.”

In addition, if racketeering crimes are committed under Wis. Stat. § 946.83 (Prohibited activities), Wis. Stat. § 946.87(4) establishes a statutory cause of action stating in part, “Any person who is injured by reason of any violation of s. 946.83 or 946.85 has a cause of action for 2 times the actual damages sustained and, when appropriate, punitive damages. The person shall also recover attorney fees and costs of the investigation and litigation reasonably incurred.” Wis. Stat. § 946.87(4).

Furthermore, when defendants are subject to mandatory criminal asset forfeiture for a violation of Wis. Stat. § 946.83[Prohibited Activities] or Wis. Stat. § 946.85[Continuing criminal enterprise], “[a]ny injured person has a right or claim to forfeited property or the proceeds derived therefrom superior to any right or claim the state has under this section in the same property or proceeds.” Wis. Stat. § 946.86(4).

- 5.10.1 Recommendation: Amend Wis. Stat. § 973.20 (Restitution) to remove the limitations on mandatory restitution that apply to child victims to allow for full mandatory restitution in all child sex trafficking cases.

5.11 Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.

Under Wis. Stat. § 939.74(1) (Time limitations on prosecutions), the general statute of limitations for criminal prosecutions is 6 years for felonies and 3 years for misdemeanors. Wis. Stat. § 939.74(1). Wis. Stat. § 939.74(2) sets out one set of exceptions to the general statute of limitations. Prosecutions for violations of Wis. Stat. § 948.02(1) (Sexual assault of a child) and § 948.025(1)(a)–(d) (Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child), among other listed crimes, can be brought at any time. Wis. Stat. § 939.74(2)(a)(1). Prosecutions for violations of Wis. Stat. § 948.02(2) (Sexual assault of a child), § 948.025(1)(b) (Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child), § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), § 948.07(1)–(4) (Child enticement), and § 948.08 (Soliciting a child for prostitution), among other listed crimes, must be brought “before the victim reaches the age of 45 years.” Wis. Stat. §

939.74(2)(c).⁴⁹ Prosecutions for violations of Wis. Stat. § 948.07(5), (6) (Child enticement), among other listed crimes, must be brought “before the victim reaches the age of 26 years.” Wis. Stat. § 939.74(2)(c). Wis. Stat. § 939.74(2d)(c) provides an additional exception to the general statute of limitations. It states,

If, before the applicable time limitation under sub. (1) or (2) (am), (c), or (cm), or (d) for commencing prosecution of a felony under ch. 940 or 948 [Crimes against children], other than a felony under s. 940.225 (1) or a felony specified in sub. (2) (a), expires, the state collects biological material that is evidence of the identity of the person who committed the felony, identifies a deoxyribonucleic acid profile from the biological material, and compares the deoxyribonucleic acid profile to deoxyribonucleic acid profiles of known persons, the state may commence prosecution of the person who is the source of the biological material for the felony or a crime that is related to the felony or both within 12 months after comparison of the deoxyribonucleic acid profile relating to the felony results in a probable identification of the person or within the applicable time under sub. (1) or (2), whichever is latest.

With regard to civil actions, the statute of limitations is tolled for minor victims until 2 years after they reach the age of majority. Wis. Stat. § 893.16(1). Additionally, Wis. Stat. § 893.587 (Sexual assault of a child; limitation) states, “An action to recover damages for injury caused by an act that would constitute a violation of s. 948.02 [Sexual assault of a child], [or] 948.025 [Engaging in repeated acts of sexual assault of the same child] . . . shall be commenced before the injured party reaches the age of 35 years or be barred.” However, this extension of the statute of limitations does not apply to the civil cause of action in Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child), which would most likely fall under the 3 year limitation in Wis. Stat. § 893.54(1) (Injury to the person), which states that a 3 year statute of limitations applies for “action[s] to recover damages for injuries to the person.”

- 5.11.1 Recommendation: Eliminate the statute of limitations for both civil and criminal causes of action for human trafficking and CSEC offenses, allowing child victims to bring a case at any time.

⁴⁹ Senate Bill 536, Section 10 (Initial applicability) provides, “Notwithstanding section 990.06 [Construction of statutes] of the statutes, the treatment of section 939.74(2)(c) and (d) and (2d)(c) first applies to an act for which the time limit under section 939.74 of the statutes for prosecution has not expired as of the effective date of this subsection.”

Legal Components:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*
- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*
- 6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*
- 6.4 *Using a law enforcement decoy posing as a minor to investigate buying or selling of commercial sex acts is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*
- 6.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*
- 6.6 *State law requires reporting of missing children and recovered missing children.*

Legal Analysis:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*

Wis. Stat. § 165.86(2) (Law enforcement training) requires the state department of justice to

- (a) . . . supply the training required for all recruits in the state under the preparatory training standards and time limits set by the board and for law enforcement officers, jail officers and juvenile detention officers in this state.
- (b) Organize a program of training, which shall encourage utilization of existing facilities and programs through cooperation with federal, state, and local agencies and institutions presently active in this field. [T]he department shall cooperate in the creation and operation of other advanced and special courses, . . . that meet the curriculum standards recommended by the board

Specialized training on child abuse is directed through Wis. Stat. § 48.981(8)(a) (Abused or neglected children and abused unborn children), which states in part,

The department, the county departments, and a licensed child welfare agency under contract with the department in a county having a population of 500,000 or more to the extent feasible shall conduct continuing education and training programs for staff of the department, the county departments, licensed child welfare agencies under contract with the department or a county department, law enforcement agencies, and the tribal social services departments, persons and officials required to report, the general public, and others as appropriate

Although this training does not expressly include identification of or reporting on commercial sexual exploitation of children, this subject could be included with the scope of abuse and neglect.

- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*

Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 968.31(2) (Interception and disclosure of wire, electronic or oral communications prohibited),

It is not unlawful under ss. 968.28 to 968.37:

....

(b) For a person acting under color of law to intercept a wire, electronic or oral communication, where the person is a party to the communication or one of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to the interception.

(c) For a person not acting under color of law to intercept a wire, electronic or oral communication where the person is a party to the communication or where one of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to the interception unless the communication is intercepted for the purpose of committing any criminal or tortious act in violation of the constitution or laws of the United States or of any state or for the purpose of committing any other injurious act.

....

6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*

Wisconsin's wiretapping law permits wiretapping for investigations of suspected trafficking and CSEC crimes. Wis. Stat. § 968.28 (Application for court order to intercept communications) states,

The attorney general together with the district attorney of any county may approve a request of an investigative or law enforcement officer to apply to the chief judge of the judicial administrative district for the county where the interception is to take place for an order authorizing or approving the interception of wire, electronic or oral communications. The chief judge may under s. 968.30 grant an order authorizing or approving the interception of wire, electronic or oral communications by investigative or law enforcement officers having responsibility for the investigation of the offense for which the application is made. The authorization shall be permitted only if the interception may provide or has provided evidence of the commission of the offense of homicide, felony murder, kidnapping, commercial gambling, bribery, extortion, dealing in controlled substances or controlled substance analogs, a computer crime that is a felony under s. 943.70, sexual exploitation of a child under s. 948.05, trafficking of a child under s. 948.051, child enticement under s. 948.07, use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime under s. 948.075, or soliciting a child for prostitution under s. 948.08, or any conspiracy to commit any of the foregoing offenses.

6.4 *Using a law enforcement decoy posing as a minor to investigate buying or selling of commercial sex acts is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*

Wis. Stat. § 948.051 (Trafficking of a child) does not expressly prohibit a defense to the use of a law enforcement decoy, meaning that buyers charged for attempting to solicit or purchase sex with a minor under the child trafficking statute may not be prohibited from raising a defense based on the fact that an actual minor was not involved.

However, the language of Wis. Stat. § 948.075(1r) (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime) seems to contemplate online investigations using law enforcement decoys to investigate potential buyers. It states, "Whoever uses a computerized communication system to communicate with an individual who the actor believes or has reason to believe has not attained the age of 16 years with intent to have sexual contact or sexual intercourse with the individual in violation of s. 948.02(1) or (2) is guilty of a Class C felony." Wis. Stat. § 948.075(1r). However, subsection (3) requires that "[p]roof that the actor did an act, other than use a computerized communication system to communicate with the individual, to affect the actor's intent under sub. (1r) shall be necessary to prove that intent."

6.4.1 **Recommendation:** Add a provision to expressly prohibit a defendant from asserting a defense that the person engaged in prostitution was not, in fact, a minor.

6.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*

Case law supports the use of the Internet or electronic communications in investigating an offense under Wis. Stat. § 948.05 (Sexual exploitation of a child), § 958.075 (Use of a computer to facilitate a child sex crime), § 948.11 (Exposing a child to harmful material or harmful descriptions or narrations), § 948.12 (Possession of child pornography), and § 948.07⁵⁰ (Child enticement).

Additionally, Wis. Stat. § 165.505(2) (Internet crimes against children; administrative subpoena) states,

The attorney general or his or her designee may issue and cause to be served a subpoena . . . upon a provider of an electronic communication service or a remote computing service to compel the production of any of the items listed in sub. (4)⁵¹ if all of the following apply:

- (a) The information likely to be obtained is relevant to an ongoing investigation of an Internet crime against a child.
- (b) The attorney general or his or her designee has reasonable cause to believe that an Internet or electronic service account provided by an electronic communication service or a remote computing service has been used in the crime.

6.6 *State law requires reporting of missing children and recovered missing children.*

Wisconsin has developed a statewide reporting and response system for missing children, but does not require reporting of recovered missing children. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. §§ 48.78(2m) (Release of information when child is missing) and 938.78(2m) (Release of information when juvenile is missing), agencies responsible for the “placement, care, or supervision of a child” or juvenile are mandated to report all missing children in conformance with the federal Preventing Sex Trafficking and Strengthening Families Act of 2014. Under Wis. Stat. § 48.78(2m), agencies are required to:

- (1) Within 8 hours after making that determination, report that determination to a local enforcement agency for entry of that information into the national crime information databases, as defined in 28 USC 534(f)(3)(A).
- (2) Within 24 hours after making that determination, report that determination to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children, and other agencies that are involved in efforts to locate the missing child.

⁵⁰ In *State v. Robins*, 646 N.W. 2d 287, 288 (Wis. 2002) (footnote omitted), the Wisconsin Supreme Court stated,

This is a prosecution for attempted child enticement arising out of an internet ‘sting’ operation by the Department of Justice (DOJ). The primary issue is whether the child enticement statute is violated when there is no actual child victim, but, rather, an adult government agent posing online as a child We conclude that an attempted child enticement under Wis. Stat. § 948.07 (1999-2000) may be charged where the intervening extraneous factor that makes the offense an attempted rather than completed crime is the fact that unbeknownst to the defendant, the ‘victim’ is not a child at all, but an adult posing as a child Finally, because the child enticement statute regulates conduct rather than speech or expression, the First Amendment is not implicated by this prosecution.

⁵¹ Wis. Stat. § 165.505(4) states “a person who is duly served a subpoena issued under sub. (2) shall, if requested, provide the following information about the customer or subscriber:

- (a) Name.
- (b) Address.
- (c) Duration, including the start date and end date, of the assignment of any Internet protocol address to the customer or subscriber.

- (3) (a) Share information about a missing child reported under subdivisions 1 and 2 with law enforcement agencies, the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children, and other agencies that are involved in efforts to locate the missing child.
- (b) An agency that has responsibility for the placement, care, or supervision of a child may photograph the child and maintain the photograph in the statewide automated child welfare information system. A report under paragraph (a) 1 or 2 shall be accompanied by a recent photograph of the missing child, if available.
- (c) If permitted under Section 48.47(7g), an agency may use the statewide automated child welfare information system to provide electronic information to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children under paragraph (a)2 or 3.
- (d) The department of children and families shall provide guidance to agencies as to the scope of the children to whom this subsection applies. Notwithstanding Section 227.10(1), that guidance need not be promulgated as rules.
- (e) The department of children and families, the department of corrections, and the department of health services may promulgate rules to implement this subsection.

Additionally, Wis. Stat. § 165.785 (Crime alert network) provides that “the department [of justice] may develop, administer, and maintain an integrated crime alert network to provide information regarding known or suspected criminal activity, crime prevention, and missing or endangered persons to state agencies, law enforcement officers, and members of the private sector.” Wis. Stat. § 165.785(1).

- 6.6.1 Recommendation: Amend Wis. Stat. § 165.785 (Crime alert network) to mandate that law enforcement report missing and recovered children.

© January 31, 2012 Shared Hope International, American Center for Law and Justice. All rights reserved.
© November 29, 2012 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
© November 7, 2013 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
© November 6, 2014 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
© November 11, 2015 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
© November 17, 2016 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
© November 15, 2017 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.