

2018 ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

PENNSYLVANIA

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 1: CRIMINALIZATION OF DOMESTIC MINOR SEX TRAFFICKING

Legal Components:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*
- 1.2 *Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.*
- 1.3 *Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.*
- 1.4 *The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.*

Legal Analysis¹:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*

Pennsylvania criminalizes domestic minor sex trafficking without requiring proof of force, fraud, or coercion when the victim is a minor. Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011(b) (Trafficking in individuals) “[a] person commits a felony of the first degree if the person engages in any activity listed in subsection (a) that results in a minor’s being subjected to sexual servitude.” A felony of the first degree is punishable by a possible fine not to exceed \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 20 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 1101(2), 1103(1).

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011(a) states that an individual commits the offense of trafficking if the person:

- (1) recruits, entices, solicits, harbors, transports, provides, obtains or maintains an individual if the person knows or recklessly disregards that the individual will be subject to involuntary servitude;² or

¹ This report includes legislation enacted as of August 1, 2018.

² Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3012(A) (Involuntary servitude),

(2) knowingly benefits financially or receives anything of value from any act that facilitates any activity described in paragraph (1).

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3001 (Definitions), “Involuntary servitude” is defined as “Labor servitude or sexual servitude” and “sexual servitude” is defined as “Any sex act or performance involving a sex act for which anything of value is directly or indirectly given, promised to or received by any individual or which is performed or provided by any individual, and is induced or obtained from: (1) a minor” 18 Const. Stat. § 3001 defines “minor” as “an individual who is less than 18 years of age.”

1.2 *Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.*

The following laws criminalize CSEC in Pennsylvania:

1. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1) (Prostitution and related offenses) makes it a felony of the third degree to “knowingly promote prostitution of a minor.”³ The following constitutes promoting prostitution under subsection (b.1):

Promoting prostitution of minor.--A person who knowingly promotes prostitution of a minor commits a felony of the third degree. The following acts shall, without limitation of the foregoing, constitute promoting prostitution of a minor:

- (1) owning, controlling, managing, supervising or otherwise keeping, alone or in association with others, a house of prostitution or a prostitution business in which a victim is a minor;
- (2) procuring an inmate who is a minor for a house of prostitution or a place in a house of prostitution where a minor would be an inmate;
- (3) encouraging, inducing, or otherwise intentionally causing a minor to become or remain a prostitute;
- (4) soliciting a minor to patronize a prostitute;
- (5) procuring a prostitute who is a minor for a patron;
- (6) transporting a minor into or within this Commonwealth with intent to promote the engaging in prostitution by that minor, or procuring or paying for transportation with that intent;
- (7) leasing or otherwise permitting a place controlled by the actor, alone or in association with others, to be regularly used for prostitution of a minor or the promotion of prostitution of a minor, or failure to make reasonable effort to abate such use by ejecting the tenant, notifying law enforcement authorities or other legally available means; or
- (8) soliciting, receiving, or agreeing to receive any benefit for doing or agreeing to do anything forbidden by this subsection.

2. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) (Unlawful contact with minor) states,

Offense defined.--A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

Offense defined.--A person commits a felony of the first degree if the person knowingly, through any of the means described in subsection (b), subjects an individual to labor servitude or sexual servitude, except where the conduct is permissible under federal or state law other than this chapter.

³ Pursuant to 18 Pa. Const. Stat. § 5902(f), “[m]inor” is defined as “[a]n individual under 18 years of age.”

- (1) Any of the offenses enumerated in Chapter 31 (relating to sexual offenses).
- (2) Open lewdness as defined in section 5901 (relating to open lewdness).
- (3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).
- (4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to obscene and other sexual materials and performances).
- (5) Sexual abuse of children as defined in section 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
- (6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

Under subsection (b), “A violation of subsection (a) is: (1) an offense of the same grade and degree as the most serious underlying offense in subsection (a) for which the defendant contacted the minor; or (2) a felony of the third degree; whichever is greater.” Subsection (c) defines “contacts” as “[d]irect or indirect contact or communication by any means, method or device, including contact or communication in person or through an agent or agency, through any print medium, the mails, a common carrier or communication common carrier, any electronic communication system and any telecommunications, wire, computer or radio communications device or system.”

3. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5903(a)⁴ (Obscene and other sexual materials and performances) states it is illegal to “hire, employ, use or permit any minor child to do or assist in doing any act or thing mentioned in [subsection (a)].” These acts include the following:

(a) Offense defined.-- No person, knowing the obscene character of the materials or performances involved, shall:

-
- (3) (i)
(ii) design, copy, draw, photograph, print, utter, publish or in any manner manufacture or prepare any obscene materials in which a minor⁵ is depicted;
- (4) (i)
(ii) write, print, publish, utter or cause to be written, printed, published or uttered any advertisement or notice of any kind giving information, directly or indirectly, stating or purporting to state where, how, from whom or by what means any obscene materials can be purchased, obtained or had if the victim is a minor in which a minor is included;
. . . .
- (5) (i)
(ii) produce, present or direct any obscene performance or participate in a portion thereof that is obscene or that contributes to its obscenity if a minor is included;

Although not expressly commercial, the following laws could apply to commercial sexual exploitation of children in Pennsylvania:

⁴ In 1975, the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania held in *Commonwealth v. MacDonald*, 347 A.2d 290, 299 (Pa. 1975), “that section 5903(a) fails to satisfy the *Miller* standard and therefore may not constitutionally be applied unless and until it is amended to specifically define the sexual conduct whose depiction or description is to be regulated thereby.” The statute was subsequently amended and appears to have not been held unconstitutional since. *See, e.g., Commonwealth v. Bond*, 504 A.2d 869, 875 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1986); *Commonwealth v. Croll*, 480 A.2d 266, 268–69 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1984) (“Initially, appellant argues that the obscenity statute is unconstitutionally vague. This question has, however, been considered and decided adversely to appellant by this Court. *See Commonwealth v. Doe* Appellant’s argument was ably refuted by Judge Johnson in that case. Appellant concedes that the Pennsylvania Act was amended ‘with slavish adherence to’ the decision of the United States Supreme Court in *Miller v. California*”) (citations omitted).

⁵ Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5903(b), “minor” is defined as “an individual under 18 years of age.”

1. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320 (Sexual exploitation of children) makes it a felony of the second degree “if [a person] procures for another person a child under 18 years of age for the purpose of sexual exploitation.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320(a), (b). “Sexual exploitation” is defined as “[a]ctual or simulated sexual activity or nudity arranged for the purpose of sexual stimulation or gratification of any person.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320(c).
2. Producing images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE) is addressed in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(b)(1)–(2) (Sexual abuse of children), which states,

Photographing, videotaping, depicting on computer or filming sexual acts.

- (1) Any person who causes or knowingly permits a child under the age of 18 years to engage in a prohibited sexual act⁶ or in the simulation of such act commits an offense if such person knows, has reason to know or intends that such act may be photographed, videotaped, depicted on computer or filmed.
 - (2) Any person who knowingly photographs, videotapes, depicts on computer or films a child under the age of 18 years engaging in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such an act is guilty of a felony of the second degree commits an offense.
3. Pennsylvania’s corruption of a minor statute, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301, could apply to trafficking and states in subsection (a),

Offense defined.--

- (1) (i) Except as provided in subparagraph (ii), whoever, being of the age of 18 years and upwards, by any act corrupts or tends to corrupt the morals of any minor less than 18 years of age, or who aids, abets, entices or encourages any such minor in the commission of any crime, or who knowingly assists or encourages such minor in violating his or her parole or any order of court, commits a misdemeanor of the first degree.
- (ii) Whoever, being of the age of 18 years and upwards, by any course of conduct in violation of Chapter 31 (relating to sexual offenses) corrupts or tends to corrupt the morals of any minor less than 18 years of age, or who aids, abets, entices or encourages any such minor in the commission of an offense under Chapter 31 commits a felony of the third degree.
- (2) Any person who knowingly aids, abets, entices or encourages a minor younger than 18 years of age to commit truancy commits a summary offense. Any person who violates this paragraph within one year of the date of a first conviction under this section commits a misdemeanor of the third degree. A conviction under this paragraph shall not, however, constitute a prohibition under section 6105 (relating to persons not to possess, use, manufacture, control, sell or transfer firearms).

1.3 *Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.*

Pennsylvania’s prostitution law, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a) (Prostitution and related offenses) does not refer to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), Pennsylvania’s trafficking law, but certain protections under the human trafficking chapter acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization. While an affirmative defense to prostitution charges is provided under the trafficking in persons chapter, this affirmative defense requires force and coercion and does not refer to the human trafficking law to clarify that a

⁶ 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(g) defines “prohibited sexual act” as “[s]exual intercourse as defined in section 3101 (relating to definitions), masturbation, sadism, masochism, bestiality, fellatio, cunnilingus, lewd exhibition of the genitals or nudity if such nudity is depicted for the purpose of sexual stimulation or gratification of any person who might view such depiction.”

commercially sexually exploited minor is a victim of trafficking. Pursuant to 18 Pa. Const. Stat. § 3019(b) (Evidence and defenses to human trafficking),

Affirmative defense.--An individual who is charged with any violation under section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses) may offer the defense at trial that he engaged in the conduct charged because he was compelled to do so by coercion or the use of, or a threat to use, unlawful force against his person or the person of another, which a person of reasonable firmness in his situation would have been unable to resist.

However, there is no requirement to prove force, fraud or coercion for vacating prostitution convictions under 18 Pa. Const. Stat. § 3019(d)(1) which states in part, “An individual convicted under section . . . 5902 [Prostitution and related offenses] . . . committed as a direct result of being a victim of human trafficking may file a motion to vacate the conviction.”

1.4 *The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.*

Pennsylvania’s Corrupt Organizations statute is codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911 (Corrupt organizations) and may be applicable to traffickers and facilitators.

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911(b) states in part,

(1) It shall be unlawful for any person who has received any income derived, directly or indirectly, from a pattern of racketeering activity⁷ in which such person participated as a principal, to use or invest, directly or indirectly, any part of such income, or the proceeds of such income, in the acquisition of any interest in, or the establishment or operation of, any enterprise⁸

(2) It shall be unlawful for any person through a pattern of racketeering activity to acquire or maintain, directly or indirectly, any interest in or control of any enterprise.

(3) It shall be unlawful for any person employed by or associated with any enterprise to conduct or participate, directly or indirectly, in the conduct of such enterprise’s affairs through a pattern of racketeering activity.

(4) It shall be unlawful for any person to conspire to violate any of the provisions of subsections (1), (2) or (3) of this subsection.

“Racketeering activity” is defined in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911(h)(1)(i) and means all of the following:

An act which is indictable under any of the following provisions of this title:

Chapter 30 (relating to human trafficking)

Chapter 59 (relating to public indecency) [which includes 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses)].

Based on this definition of racketeering activity, acts of commercial sexual exploitation of children constitute predicate crimes under the racketeering law, making it available for combatting criminal enterprises engaged in domestic minor sex trafficking. Conviction under this statute is a first degree felony, which is punishable by a

⁷ A “pattern of racketeering activity” is defined as “a course of conduct requiring two or more acts of racketeering activity one of which occurred after the effective date of this section.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911(h)(4).

⁸ An “enterprise” is defined as “any individual, partnership, corporation, association or other legal entity, and any union or group of individuals associated in fact although not a legal entity, engaged in commerce and includes legitimate as well as illegitimate entities and governmental entities.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911(h)(3).

possible fine not to exceed \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 20 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 911(c), 1101(2) (Fines), 1103(1) (Sentence of imprisonment for felony).

Legal Components:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.*
- 2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*
- 2.3 *Solicitation laws differentiate between soliciting sex acts with an adult and soliciting sex acts with a minor under 18.*
- 2.4 *Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.*
- 2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*
- 2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*
- 2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*
- 2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*
- 2.9 *Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
- 2.10 *Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.*

Legal Analysis:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) can apply to buyers of commercial sex with a minor through the term “solicits” and, following federal precedent, through the term “obtains.”⁹ Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011(a)(1), a person commits the offense of trafficking if a person “recruits, entices, solicits, harbors, transports, provides, obtains or maintains an individual if the person knows or recklessly disregards that the individual will be subject to involuntary servitude” Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3001 (Definitions), “[i]nvoluntary servitude” is defined as “[l]abor servitude or sexual servitude,” and

⁹ See *United States v. Jungers*, 702 F.3d 1066 (8th Cir. 2013). In this case, the Eighth Circuit held that the federal sex trafficking law, 18 U.S.C. § 1591 (Sex trafficking of children or by force, fraud, or coercion) applies to buyers of sex with minors. Reversing a District of South Dakota ruling that Congress did not intend the string of verbs constituting criminal conduct under 18 U.S.C. § 1591(a)(1) (“recruits, entices, harbors, transports, provides, obtains, or maintains”) to reach the conduct of buyers (*United States v. Jungers*, 834 F. Supp. 2d 930, 931 (D.S.D. 2011)), the Eighth Circuit concluded that 18 U.S.C. § 1591 does not contain “a latent exemption for purchasers” because buyers can “engage in at least some of the prohibited conduct.” *Jungers*, 702 F. 3d 1066, 1072. Congress codified *Jungers* clarifying that the federal sex trafficking law is intended to apply to buyers in the Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act (JVTA) of 2015 Pub. L. No. 114-22, 129 Stat 227), enacted on May 29, 2015. The JVTA adds the terms “patronize” and “solicit” to the list of prohibited conduct and expressly states, “section 108 of this title amends section 1591 of title 18, United States Code, to add the words ‘solicits or patronizes’ to the sex trafficking statute making absolutely clear for judges, juries, prosecutors, and law enforcement officials that criminals who purchase sexual acts from human trafficking victims may be arrested, prosecuted, and convicted as sex trafficking offenders when this is merited by the facts of a particular case.” *Id.* at Sec. 109. The Eighth Circuit decision in *United States v. Jungers* and the federal sex trafficking law as amended by the Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act establish persuasive authority when state courts interpret the string of verbs constituting prohibited conduct in state sex trafficking laws (in particular the term “obtains”) to the extent such interpretation does not conflict with state case law.

“[s]exual servitude” is defined as “[a]ny sex act or performance involving a sex act for which anything of value is directly or indirectly given, promised to or received by any individual or which is performed or provided by any individual and is induced or obtained from . . . [a] minor.”

Additionally, buyers can be charged under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013 (Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude). Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013(a), a person commits this offense “if the person engages in any sex act or performance with another individual knowing that the act or performance is the result of the individual being a victim of human trafficking victim.” Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude is a felony of the second degree; a second degree felony is punishable by a fine up to \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3013(a), 1101(2), 1103(2).

2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*

A buyer in Pennsylvania could be charged with unlawful contact with a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor). Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a)(3),

A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

.....
(3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).¹⁰

Under this statute, a crime constitutes either “(1) an offense of the same grade and degree as the most serious underlying offense in subsection (a) for which the defendant contacted the minor; or (2) a felony of the third degree; whichever is greater.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(b). Since prostitution is generally a misdemeanor offense in Pennsylvania, the buyer could be guilty of a third degree felony under this statute. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a), (A.1).

Otherwise, buyers face penalties under age-neutral prostitution laws. Patronizing a prostitute is a crime that applies to those who patronize both minors and adults for commercial sexual purposes. Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(e), “[A] person commits the offense of patronizing prostitutes if that person hires a prostitute or any other person enters or remains in a house of prostitution for the purpose of engaging in sexual activity.” The crime is a third degree misdemeanor for the first or second offense, a second degree misdemeanor for the third offense, and a first degree misdemeanor for the fourth and subsequent offenses. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(e), (e.1)(1)–(3). Additionally, a buyer could be charged with criminal solicitation under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 902 (Criminal solicitation) if he attempts to patronize a prostitute under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a).

2.3 *Solicitation laws differentiate between soliciting sex acts with an adult and soliciting sex acts with a minor under 18.*

Pennsylvania law does not specifically differentiate between soliciting sex acts with a minor and soliciting sex acts with an adult. Although 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 902(a) (Criminal solicitation) could be used to prosecute a buyer who solicits a minor to engage in prostitution, that law fails to recognize solicitation of a minor for prostitution as more severe than solicitation of an adult.

¹⁰ A person is guilty of “prostitution” in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a) “if he or she: (1) is an inmate of a house of prostitution or otherwise engages in sexual activity as a business; or (2) loiters in or within view of any public place for the purpose of being hired to engage in sexual activity.”

Although not specific to solicitation, it is possible that those who solicit sex with a minor could be charged under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a)(3) (Unlawful contact with minor), a third degree felony that prohibits an individual from “contacting” a minor under 18 in order to engage in prostitution. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a)(3), (b).

2.3.1 Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 902(a) (Criminal solicitation) to differentiate soliciting sex acts with a minor and soliciting sex acts with an adult by providing heightened penalties when the victim is a minor under 18.

2.4 Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.

A buyer convicted of trafficking a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) will be guilty of a first degree felony with possible imprisonment up to 20 years and a fine up to \$25,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 1101(2), 1103(1). If, however, a defendant commits the offense of trafficking in persons while also committing “(1) 18 Pa.C.S. § 2901 (relating to kidnapping); (2) 18 Pa.C.S. § 3121 (relating to rape); or (3) 18 Pa.C.S. § 3123 (relating to involuntary deviate sexual intercourse),” then the maximum possible term of imprisonment increases to life imprisonment. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9720.2.

A buyer convicted of patronizing a victim of sexual servitude under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013 (Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude) will be guilty of a felony of the second degree; a second degree felony is punishable by and imprisonment up to 10 years and a possible fine up to \$25,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3013(a), 1101(2), 1103(2).

If convicted of unlawful contact with a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318 (Unlawful conduct with minor), which includes being in contact with a minor for prostitution, or if convicted of corruption of minors under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(ii) (Corruption of minors) involving sexual offenses codified in Chapter 31, then the buyer will be convicted of a felony of the third degree punishable by a fine up to \$15,000 and imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6318(a), (b), 6301(a)(1)(ii), 1101(3), 1103(3). Corruption of minors not involving the sexual offenses in Chapter 31, such as Chapter 59 offenses (Prostitution), is prohibited under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(i), and the buyer will be convicted of a first degree misdemeanor punishable by a fine up to \$10,000 and imprisonment up to 5 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6301(a)(1)(i), 1101(4), 1104(1) (Sentence of imprisonment for misdemeanors).

For “patronizing a prostitute,” regardless of the age of the prostituted person, the buyer is guilty of a third degree misdemeanor for the first and second offense with a possible fine of \$2,500 and a potential term of imprisonment not to exceed one year. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(1), 1101(6), 1104(3). A third offense is a second degree misdemeanor with a possible fine of \$5,000 and possible imprisonment up to 2 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(2), 1101(5), 1104(2). Fourth and subsequent offenses of patronizing a prostitute are first degree misdemeanors with a possible fine of \$10,000 and possible imprisonment up to 5 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(3), 1101(4), 1104(1).

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the buyer has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense¹¹ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). To the extent buyers can be prosecuted under

¹¹ Pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(2), “federal sex offense” is defined as

other federal CSEC laws,¹² a conviction is punishable by penalties ranging from a fine not to exceed \$250,000 to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.¹³

2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) (Unlawful contact with minor) can possibly be used to prosecute those who use the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit, or purchase commercial and non-commercial sex acts with minors. Under this provision,

Offense defined.--A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

- (1) Any of the offenses enumerated in Chapter 31 (relating to sexual offenses).
- (2) Open lewdness as defined in section 5901 (relating to open lewdness).
- (3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).
- (4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to obscene and other sexual materials and performances).
- (5) Sexual abuse of children as defined in section 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
- (6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

“Contacts” is defined in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(c) as:

[d]irect or indirect contact or communication by any means, method or device, including contact or communication in person or through an agent or agency, through any print medium, the mails, a common carrier or communication common carrier, any electronic communication system and any telecommunications, wire, computer or radio communications device or system.

A violation of 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) is “(1) an offense of the same grade and degree as the most serious underlying offense in subsection (a) for which the defendant contacted the minor; or (2) a felony of the third degree; whichever is greater.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(b). The statute gives concurrent jurisdiction to the

an offense under section 1591 [18 USCS § 1591] (relating to sex trafficking of children), 2241 [18 USCS § 2241] (relating to aggravated sexual abuse), 2242 [18 USCS § 2242] (relating to sexual abuse), 2244(a)(1) [18 USCS § 2244(a)(1)] (relating to abusive sexual contact), 2245 [18 USCS § 2245] (relating to sexual abuse resulting in death), 2251 [18 USCS § 2251] (relating to sexual exploitation of children), 2251A [18 USCS § 2251A] (relating to selling or buying of children), 2422(b) [18 USCS § 2422(b)] (relating to coercion and enticement of a minor into prostitution), or 2423(a) [18 USCS § 2423(a)] (relating to transportation of minors).

¹² 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (Selling or buying of children), 2251(a) (Sexual exploitation of children), 2423(a) (Transportation of a minor with intent for minor to engage in criminal sexual activity), 2422(a) (Coercion and enticement), 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors).

¹³ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 30 years to life and a fine), 2251(e) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 15–30 years and a fine), 2423(a) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 10 years to life and a fine), 2422(a) (conviction punishable by a fine, imprisonment up to 20 years, or both), 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

Attorney General and district attorney “when the person charged with a violation of this section contacts a minor through the use of a computer, computer system or computer network.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(b.1).

2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3018(c) (Evidence and defenses to human trafficking) states,

Victim’s age in sexual servitude.--Except as provided in section 3102 (relating to mistake as to age), evidence of a defendant's lack of knowledge of a person's age, or a reasonable mistake of age, is not a defense for a violation of this chapter involving the sexual servitude of a minor.

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3102 (Mistake as to age), however,

... whenever in this chapter the criminality of conduct depends on a child being below the age of 14 years, it is no defense that the defendant did not know the age of the child or reasonably believed the child to be the age of 14 years or older. When criminality depends on the child’s being below a critical age older than 14 years, it is a defense for the defendant to prove by a preponderance of the evidence that he or she reasonably believed the child to be above the critical age.

Furthermore, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 304 (Ignorance or mistake) states:

Ignorance or mistake as to a matter of fact, for which there is reasonable explanation or excuse, is a defense if: (1) the ignorance or mistake negatives the intent, knowledge, belief, recklessness, or negligence required a [sic] establish a material element of the offense; or (2) the law provides that the state of mind established by such ignorance or mistake constitutes a defense.

- 2.6.1. Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3102 (Mistake of age) to prohibit a mistake of age defense for all minors under 18 and amend CSEC statutes to prevent the defense from being raised.

2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*

Pennsylvania’s buyer-applicable trafficking laws do not stagger penalties based on a minor’s age and provide sufficiently high penalties. A conviction under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) is punishable as a felony of the first degree by imprisonment for up to 20 years, while a conviction under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013(a) (Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude) is punishable as a felony of the second degree by imprisonment for up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 3013(a), 1103(1), (2).

Similarly, Pennsylvania’s buyer-applicable CSEC law, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor) does not stagger penalties based on a minor’s age; however, penalties under this offense are not sufficiently high. A conviction under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a)(3) is punishable as a felony of the third degree by imprisonment for up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6318(b), 1103(3).

2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*

A buyer convicted of trafficking in individuals under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) faces a felony of the first degree with a possible fine up to \$25,000 in addition to imprisonment up to 20 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 1101(2), 1103(1). A buyer convicted of patronizing a victim of sexual servitude under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013 (Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude) faces a felony of the second degree, which is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years and a possible fine up to \$25,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3013(a), 1101(2), 1103(1).

If convicted of unlawful contact with a minor, which includes being in contact with a minor for prostitution, or corruption of minors, the buyer will be convicted of a felony of the third degree punishable by a fine up to \$15,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6318(b)(2) (Unlawful contact with minor), 6301 (Corruption of minors), 1101(3).

Fines for the misdemeanor offense of patronizing a prostitute pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses), range from \$2,500 for the first and second offense under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(1), 1101(6) to \$5,000 for a third offense under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(2), 1101(5) to \$10,000 for a fourth and subsequent offenses under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(e.1)(3), 1101(4).

A buyer prosecuted under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 faces mandatory civil asset forfeiture pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021 (Assert forfeiture), which states,

(a) General rule.--The following shall be subject to forfeiture to this Commonwealth, and no property right shall exist in them:

(1) All assets, foreign or domestic:

- (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 (relating to trafficking in individuals) or 3012 (relating to involuntary servitude),
- (ii) Affording a person a source of influence over the individual, entity or organization under subparagraph (i).
- (iii) Acquired or maintained by a person with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.
- (iv) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.

(2) All assets within this Commonwealth:

- (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
- (ii) Acquired or maintained with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
- (iii) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act which violates section 3011 or 3012

(b) Process and seizures.

(1) Property subject to forfeiture under this section may be seized by a law enforcement agency upon process issued by any court of common pleas having jurisdiction over the property.

.....

Distribution of forfeited property is governed by 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021(d), which states,

Transfer of property.--If property is forfeited under this section, the property shall be transferred to the custody of the district attorney if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has county or local jurisdiction, or the Attorney General if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has Statewide jurisdiction. The Attorney General or district attorney, where appropriate, may sell the property. The proceeds from a sale shall first be used to pay all proper expenses of the proceedings for forfeiture and sale, including expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs. The balance of the proceeds shall be distributed under subsection (m).

Buyers convicted of an offense under Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3013, however, would not be subject to asset forfeiture under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021.

Buyers who are convicted of human trafficking under Chapter 30 are subject to mandatory restitution. Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3020 (Restitution) a person found guilty of a violation of this chapter must pay restitution to the human trafficking victim. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3020(2)(i) states,

For the period during which the victim of human trafficking was engaged in involuntary servitude, the greater of the following:

- (A) The value of the victim's time during the period of involuntary servitude as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the laws of this Commonwealth.
- (B) The gross income or value to the defendant of the services of the victim.
- (C) The amount the victim was promised or the amount an individual in the position of the victim would have reasonably expected to earn. This clause shall not apply to the amount an individual would have reasonably expected to earn in an illegal activity.

A buyer convicted of a sexual crime other than trafficking of persons, is subject to mandatory restitution orders, under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a) (Restitution for injuries to person or property), which states, "Upon conviction for any crime wherein property has been stolen, converted or otherwise unlawfully obtained, or its value substantially decreased as a direct result of the crime, or wherein the victim suffered personal injury directly resulting from the crime, the offender shall be sentenced to make restitution in addition to the punishment prescribed therefor." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a) (Restitution for injuries to person or property). "Personal injury" is defined as "[a]ctual bodily harm, including pregnancy, directly resulting from the crime." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h). As a result, if the victim¹⁴ suffered "personal injury directly resulting from the crime," then the buyer could potentially be required to pay restitution for every crime related to trafficking. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a).

2.9 *Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(d) (Sexual abuse of children), "Any person who intentionally views or knowingly possesses or controls any book, magazine, pamphlet, slide, photograph, film, videotape, computer depiction or other material depicting a child under the age of 18 years engaging in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such act commits an offense." A first conviction is a third degree felony punishable by a possible fine up to \$15,000 and possible imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(i), 1101(3), 1103(3). Second and subsequent offenses of this provision are second degree felonies with possible fines up to \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(ii), 1101(2), 1103(2). However, pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(d.1)(3) (Grading), when a person commits an offense involving images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE) "and indecent contact with the child as defined in section 3101 is depicted, the grading of the offense shall be one grade higher"

In comparison, a federal conviction for possession of ICSE¹⁵ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.¹⁶ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.¹⁷

¹⁴ "Victim" is defined in the Crime Victim's Act, codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. The definition of victim included in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h) refers to "section 479.1 of the act of April 9, 1929 (P.L. 177, No. 175), known as the Administrative Code of 1929." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h). This statute has been repealed and replaced by the Crime Victim's Act, also known as "the act of November 24, 1998, P.L. 822, No. 111." *Restitution for injuries to person or property—18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106*, ONECLE, <http://law.onecle.com/pennsylvania/crimes-and-offenses/00.011.006.000.html> (last visited July 14, 2011); 1998 Pa. Laws 111; 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. See Component 5.1 for a definition of "victim" as defined in the Crime Victim's Act.

¹⁵ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2)–(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a), (b) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

2.10 Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.

Buyers convicted of trafficking in persons, unlawful contact with a minor, or possessing images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE) must register as sex offenders; however, those convicted of patronizing a minor for prostitution under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(e) (Prostitution and related offenses) are not required to register.

42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.13¹⁸ (Applicability) requires sexual offenders to “register with the Pennsylvania state police as provided in sections 9799.15 (relating to period of registration), 9799.19 (relating to initial registration) and 9799.25 (relating to verification by sexual offenders and Pennsylvania state police) and otherwise comply with the provisions of this subchapter.” 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.12¹⁹ (Definitions) defines “sexual offender” as “an individual who has committed a sexually violent offense” In turn, 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.12 defines “sexually violent offense” as “an offense specified in section 9799.14 (relating to sexual offenses and tier system) as a tier I, tier II or tier III sexual offense committed on or after December 20, 2012, for which the individual was convicted.”

Under 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.14 (Sexual offenses and tier system), tier I offenses include corruption of minors under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(II) and tier II offenses include trafficking of persons under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011, unlawful contact with a minor under § 6318, offenses involving obscene and other sexual materials and performances under § 5903(A)(3)(II), (4)(II), (5)(II) or (6), sexual abuse of children under § 6312(b), (c) and (d), and sexual exploitation of children under § 6320. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.14(b)(8), (c)(2)–(7).

Additionally, incarcerated buyers of commercial sex with minors will be required to attend “sexual offender treatment” under 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9718.1 (Sexual offender treatment), which requires those who commit a crime of “[p]rostitution, as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses), if the offense involved a minor under 18 years of age” or sexual exploitation of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320(a) to receive treatment. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9718.1(A)(5), (9).

¹⁶ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

¹⁷ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years, but if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(4), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 10–20 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

¹⁸ The text of 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. Stat. § 9799.13 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of House Bills 631 and 1952 during the 2017-2018 Regular Session of the Pennsylvania General Assembly (effective February 21, 2018 and June 12, 2018, respectively).

¹⁹ The text of 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. Stat. § 9799.12 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of House Bills 631 and 1952 during the 2017-2018 Regular Session of the Pennsylvania General Assembly (effective February 21, 2018 and June 12, 2018, respectively).

Legal Components:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*
- 3.2 *Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
- 3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit, or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*
- 3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*
- 3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*
- 3.6 *Laws relating to parental custody and termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for sole custody or termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.*

Legal Analysis:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*

Trafficking a minor under 18 is a first degree felony with a possible fine not to exceed \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 20 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 1101(2), 1103(1). If, however, a trafficker commits the offense of trafficking of persons while also committing “(1) 18 Pa.C.S. § 2901 (relating to kidnapping); (2) 18 Pa.C.S. § 3121 (relating to rape); or (3) 18 Pa.C.S. § 3123 (relating to involuntary deviate sexual intercourse),” then the maximum possible term of imprisonment increases to life imprisonment. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9720.2.

For the offense of promoting prostitution of a minor pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1) (Prostitution and related offenses), a trafficker is guilty of a third degree felony punishable by a fine up to \$15,000 and possible imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 1101(3), 1103(3).

A trafficker could be punished under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301 (Corruption of minors). Subsection (a)(1)(i), states, “Except as provided in subparagraph (ii), whoever, being of the age of 18 years and upwards, by any act corrupts or tends to corrupt the morals of any minor less than 18 years of age, or who aids, abets, entices or encourages any such minor in the commission of any crime, or who knowingly assists or encourages such minor in violating his or her parole or any order of court, commits a misdemeanor of the first degree.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(i). This crime is punishable by a possible fine of \$10,000 and possible imprisonment up to 5 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 1101(4), 1104(1). However, a trafficker age 18 or older who “by any course of conduct in violation of Chapter 31 (relating to sexual offenses) corrupts or tends to corrupt the morals of any minor less than 18 years of age, or who aids, abets, entices or encourages any such minor in the commission of an offense under Chapter 31” may be found guilty of a third degree felony. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(ii). This crime is punishable by a possible fine up to \$15,000 and possible imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6301(a)(1)(ii), 1101(3), 1103(3).

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) (Unlawful contact with minor) states,

Offense defined.--A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

-
- (3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).
- (4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to

- obscene and other sexual materials and performances).
- (5) Sexual abuse of children as defined in section 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
- (6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

Pursuant to subsection (b), “A violation of subsection (a) is: (1) an offense of the same grade and degree as the most serious underlying offense in subsection (a) for which the defendant contacted the minor; or (2) a felony of the third degree; whichever is greater.”

Subsection (c) defines “contacts” as “[d]irect or indirect contact or communication by any means, method or device, including contact or communication in person or through an agent or agency, through any print medium, the mails, a common carrier or communication common carrier, any electronic communication system and any telecommunications, wire, computer or radio communications device or system.”

Sexual exploitation of a child, which is defined as “procur[ing] for another person a child under 18 years of age for the purpose of sexual exploitation”²⁰ is a felony of the second degree punishable by a fine up to \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6320(a), (b), 1101(2), 1103(2).

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²¹ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1).

3.2 *Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(b), (c) (Sexual abuse of children) criminalizes the creation and distribution of images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE), stating,

- (b) Photographing, videotaping, depicting on computer or filming sexual acts.--
 - (1) Any person who causes or knowingly permits a child under the age of 18 years to engage in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such act commits an offense if such person knows, has reason to know or intends that such act may be photographed, videotaped, depicted on computer or filmed.
 - (2) Any person who knowingly photographs, videotapes, depicts on computer or films a child under the age of 18 years engaging in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such an act commits an offense.
- (c) Dissemination of photographs, videotapes, computer depictions and films.--Any person who knowingly sells, distributes, delivers, disseminates, transfers, displays or exhibits to others, or who possesses for the purpose of sale, distribution, delivery, dissemination, transfer, display or exhibition to others, any book, magazine, pamphlet, slide, photograph, film, videotape, computer depiction or other material depicting a child under the age of 18 years engaging in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such act commits an offense.

....

²⁰ 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320(c) defines “procure” as “[t]o obtain or make available for sexual exploitation” and “sexual exploitation” as “[a]ctual or simulated sexual activity or nudity arranged for the purpose of sexual stimulation or gratification of any person.”

²¹ See *supra* note 11 for the definition of “federal sex offense.”

(2) A first offense under this subsection is a felony of the third degree, and a second or subsequent offense under this subsection is a felony of the second degree.

Creating ICSE is a second degree felony punishable by a fine up to \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(1), 1101(2), 1103(2). For a first offense, disseminating or selling ICSE is a third degree felony punishable by a fine up to \$15,000 and possible imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(i), 1101(3), 1103(3). A subsequent offense is a second degree felony. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(ii).

Creating ICSE is also criminalized under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5903(a) (Obscene and other sexual materials and performances),²² which states:

Offenses defined.--No person, knowing the obscene character of the materials or performances involved, shall:

-
- (3) (i)
 - (ii) design, copy, draw, photograph, print, utter, publish or in any manner manufacture or prepare any obscene materials in which a minor is depicted;
 - (4) (i)
 - (ii) write, print, publish, utter or cause to be written, printed, published or uttered any advertisement or notice of any kind giving information, directly or indirectly, stating or purporting to state where, how, from whom or by what means any obscene materials can be purchased, obtained or had in which a minor is included;
 - (5) (i)
 - (ii) produce, present or direct any obscene performance or participate in a portion thereof that is obscene or that contributes to its obscenity if a minor is included;

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²³ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). Additionally, a federal conviction for distribution of ICSE²⁴ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²⁵ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²⁶

²² In 1975, the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania held in *Commonwealth v. MacDonald*, 347 A.2d 290, 299 (Pa. 1975), “that section 5903(a) fails to satisfy the *Miller* standard and therefore may not constitutionally be applied unless and until it is amended to specifically define the sexual conduct whose depiction or description is to be regulated thereby.” The statute was subsequently amended and appears to have not been held unconstitutional since. *See, e.g., Commonwealth v. Bond*, 504 A.2d 869, 875 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1986); *Commonwealth v. Croll*, 480 A.2d 266, 268–69 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1984) (“Initially, appellant argues that the obscenity statute is unconstitutionally vague. This question has, however, been considered and decided adversely to appellant by this Court. *See Commonwealth v. Doe* Appellant’s argument was ably refuted by Judge Johnson in that case. Appellant concedes that the Pennsylvania Act was amended ‘with slavish adherence to’ the decision of the United States Supreme Court in *Miller v. California*”) (citations omitted).

²³ *See supra* note 11 for the definition of “federal sex offense.”

²⁴ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

²⁵ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years

3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit, or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) (Unlawful contact with minor) can possibly be used to prosecute those who use the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice or recruit minors to engage in commercial and non-commercial sex acts. Under this provision,

Offenses defined.--A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

- (1) Any of the offenses enumerated in Chapter 31 (relating to sexual offenses).
- (2) Open lewdness as defined in section 5901 (relating to open lewdness).
- (3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).
- (4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to obscene and other sexual materials and performances).
- (5) Sexual abuse of children as defined in section 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
- (6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(c), “contacts” is defined as,

Direct or indirect contact or communication by any means, method or device, including contact or communication in person or through an agent or agency, through any print medium, the mails, a common carrier or communication common carrier, any electronic communication system and any telecommunications, wire, computer or radio communications device or system.

A violation of 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) (Unlawful contact with a minor) is “(1) an offense of the same grade and degree as the most serious underlying offense in subsection (a) for which the defendant contacted the minor; or (2) a felony of the third degree; whichever is greater.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(b).

The statute gives concurrent jurisdiction, which exists with the Attorney General and district attorney, “when the person charged with a violation of this section contacts a minor through the use of a computer, computer system or computer network.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(B.1).

3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*

If convicted of trafficking a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011(b) (Trafficking in individuals), a first degree felony, then traffickers can receive a fine up to \$25,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 1101(2). If convicted

and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

²⁶ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

of corruption of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(a)(1)(ii) or promoting prostitution of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1), both felonies of the third degree, then traffickers can receive a fine up to \$15,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6301(a)(1)(ii), 5902(b.1), 1101(3). If convicted of sexual exploitation of a child under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320 (Sexual exploitation of children), a second degree felony, then traffickers can receive a fine up to \$25,000. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6320(b), 1101(2).

Mandatory restitution for victims of trafficking is available through 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3020(2)(i) (Restitution), which states,

For the period during which the victim of human trafficking was engaged in involuntary servitude, the greater of the following:

- (A) The value of the victim's time during the period of involuntary servitude as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the laws of this Commonwealth.
- (B) The gross income or value to the defendant of the services of the victim.
- (C) The amount the victim was promised or the amount an individual in the position of the victim would have reasonably expected to earn. This clause shall not apply to the amount an individual would have reasonably expected to earn in an illegal activity.

Additionally, mandatory restitution is available for other crimes under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a) (Restitution for injuries to person or property) which states,

Upon conviction for any crime wherein property has been stolen, converted or otherwise unlawfully obtained, or its value substantially decreased as a direct result of the crime, or wherein the victim suffered personal injury directly resulting from the crime, the offender shall be sentenced to make restitution in addition to the punishment prescribed therefor.

Traffickers prosecuted under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) also face mandatory, civil asset forfeiture under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021 (Asset forfeiture). The statute states,

(a) General rule.--The following shall be subject to forfeiture to this Commonwealth, and no property right shall exist in them:

- (1) All assets, foreign or domestic:
 - (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 (relating to trafficking in individuals) or 3012 (relating to involuntary servitude),
 - (ii) Affording a person a source of influence over the individual, entity or organization under subparagraph (i).
 - (iii) Acquired or maintained by a person with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (iv) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.
- (2) All assets within this Commonwealth:
 - (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (ii) Acquired or maintained with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (iii) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.

.....
(b) Process and seizures

(1) Property subject to forfeiture under this section may be seized by a law enforcement agency upon process issued by any court of common pleas having jurisdiction over the property.

.....

Distribution of forfeited property is governed by 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021(d), which states,

Transfer of property.--If property is forfeited under this section, the property shall be transferred to the custody of the district attorney if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has county or local jurisdiction, or the Attorney General if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has Statewide jurisdiction. The Attorney General or district attorney, where appropriate, may sell the property. The proceeds from a sale shall first be used to pay all proper expenses of the proceedings for forfeiture and sale, including expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs. The balance of the proceeds shall be distributed under subsection (m).

3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*

Convictions under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) and CSEC require defendants to register as sex offenders. Specifically, 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.13²⁷ (Applicability) requires sexual offenders to “register with the Pennsylvania state police as provided in sections 9799.15 (relating to period of registration), 9799.19 (relating to initial registration) and 9799.25 (relating to verification by sexual offenders and Pennsylvania state police) and otherwise comply with the provisions of this subchapter.” 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.12²⁸ (Definitions) defines “sexual offender” as “an individual who has committed a sexually violent offense” In turn, 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.12 defines “sexually violent offense” as “an offense specified in section 9799.14 (relating to sexual offenses and tier system) as a tier I, tier II or tier III sexual offense committed on or after December 20,2012, for which the individual was convicted.”

Under 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.14 (Sexual offenses and tier system), tier I offenses include corruption of minors under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301(A)(1)(II), and tier II offenses include trafficking in individuals under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011(b), promoting prostitution of a minor under § 5902(b.1), offenses involving obscene and other sexual materials and performances under § 5903(A)(3)(II), (4)(II), (5)(II) OR (6), sexual abuse of children under § 6312(b) and (c), unlawful contact with minors under § 6318, sexual exploitation of children under § 6320. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9799.14(b)(8), (c)(1), (2)–(7).

An incarcerated trafficker may also be required to attend “sexual offender treatment” pursuant to 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9718.1 (Sexual offender treatment) if the trafficker is convicted of any prostitution offense (including promoting prostitution of a minor) under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1) or sexual exploitation of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320(a). 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9718.1(a)(5), (9).

3.6 *Laws relating to parental custody and termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for sole custody or termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.*

Two of Pennsylvania’s CSEC offenses are included as grounds for terminating parental rights; however, the offense must have been committed by the parent against one of the parent’s children. 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 2511(a) (Grounds for involuntary termination) states,

The rights of a parent in regard to a child may be terminated after a petition filed on any of the following grounds:

²⁷ See *supra* note 18.

²⁸ See *supra* note 19.

....
(2) The repeated and continued incapacity, abuse, neglect or refusal of the parent has caused the child to be without essential parental care, control or subsistence necessary for his physical or mental well-being and the conditions and causes of the incapacity, abuse, neglect or refusal cannot or will not be remedied by the parent.

....
(7) The parent is the father of a child conceived as a result of a rape or incest.

....
(9) The parent has been convicted of one of the following in which the victim was a child of the parent:

- (i) an offense under 18 Pa.C.S. Ch. 25 (relating to criminal homicide);
- (ii) a felony under 18 Pa.C.S. § 2702 (relating to aggravated assault);
- (iii) an offense in another jurisdiction equivalent to an offense in subparagraph (i) or (ii); or
- (iv) an attempt, solicitation or conspiracy to commit an offense in subparagraph (i), (ii) or (iii).

(10) The parent has been found by a court of competent jurisdiction to have committed sexual abuse against the child or another child of the parent . . . where the judicial adjudication is based on a finding of “sexual abuse or exploitation” as defined in section 6303(a) [Definitions].

....
Because the definition of “sexual abuse or exploitation” includes the CSEC offenses of prostitution under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902 and unlawful contact with a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318,²⁹ a conviction of either offense will result in the termination of a person’s parental rights provided that the offense was committed against one of the offender’s own children.

²⁹ See *infra* Component 5.5 for discussion of the definition of “sexual abuse or exploitation.”

Legal Components:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*
 - 4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*
 - 4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*
 - 4.4 *Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
-

Legal Analysis:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) applies to facilitators who benefit financially from facilitating sex trafficking. It states,

- (a) Offense defined.--A person commits a felony of the second degree if the person:
 - (1) recruits, entices, solicits, harbors, transports, provides, obtains or maintains an individual if the person knows or recklessly disregards that the individual will be subject to involuntary servitude; or
 - (2) knowingly benefits financially or receives anything of value from any act that facilitates any activity described in paragraph (1).
- (b) Trafficking in minors.--A person commits a felony of the first degree if the person engages in any activity listed in subsection (a) that results in a minor's being subjected to sexual servitude.

Trafficking in individuals is a first degree felony if the person trafficked is under 18, with a possible fine not to exceed \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 20 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 3011(b), 1101(2), 1103(2).

Facilitators may be charged under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses). Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1), promoting prostitution of a minor includes the following:

- (1) owning, controlling, managing, supervising or otherwise keeping, alone or in association with others, a house of prostitution or a prostitution business
-
- (7) leasing or otherwise permitting a place controlled by the actor, alone or in association with others, to be regularly used for prostitution of a minor or the promotion of prostitution of a minor, or failure to make reasonable effort to abate such use by ejecting the tenant, notifying law enforcement authorities, or other legally available means; or
- (8) soliciting, receiving, or agreeing to receive any benefit for doing or agreeing to do anything forbidden by this subsection.

Promoting prostitution of a minor is a felony of the third degree, which is punishable by a fine up to \$15,000 and possible imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5902(b.1), 1101(3), 1103(3).

Additionally, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3017 (Violation by business entities) provides that businesses and corporations are also liable. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3017 states,

Penalty.--Any business entity, including a corporation or unincorporated association, limited

liability partnership or company or other legal entity that knowingly aids or participates in any violation of this chapter [Prosecution of Human Trafficking], shall be subject to any of the following penalties:

- (1) A fine of not more than \$1,000,000.
- (2) Revocation of the business entity's
 - (i) charter, if it is organized under the laws of this Commonwealth; or
 - (ii) certificate of authority to do business in this Commonwealth, if the business entity is not organized under the laws of this Commonwealth.
- (3) Other relief as the court deems equitable, including forfeiture of assets or restitution as provided in this chapter

4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*

If convicted of trafficking of persons under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), facilitators will face asset forfeiture pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021 (Asset forfeiture), which states,

(a) General rule.--The following shall be subject to forfeiture to this Commonwealth, and no property right shall exist in them:

- (1) All assets, foreign or domestic:
 - (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 (relating to trafficking in individuals) or 3012 (relating to involuntary servitude),
 - (ii) Affording a person a source of influence over the individual, entity or organization under subparagraph (i).
 - (iii) Acquired or maintained by a person with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (iv) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act in this Commonwealth which violates section 3011 or 3012.
- (2) All assets within this Commonwealth:
 - (i) Of an individual, entity or organization engaged in planning or perpetrating an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (ii) Acquired or maintained with the intent and for the purpose of supporting, planning, conducting or concealing an act which violates section 3011 or 3012.
 - (iii) Derived from, involved in or used or intended to be used to commit an act which violates section 3011 or 3012

(b) Process and seizures

- (1) Property subject to forfeiture under this section may be seized by a law enforcement agency upon process issued by any court of common pleas having jurisdiction over the property.

....

Distribution of forfeited property is governed by 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3021(d), which states,

Transfer of property.--If property is forfeited under this section, the property shall be transferred to the custody of the district attorney if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has county or local jurisdiction, or the Attorney General if the law enforcement authority seizing the property has Statewide jurisdiction. The Attorney General or district attorney, where appropriate, may sell the property. The proceeds from a sale shall first be used to pay all proper expenses of the proceedings for forfeiture and sale, including expenses of seizure, maintenance of custody, advertising and court costs. The balance of the proceeds shall be distributed under subsection (m).

Additionally, facilitators who are convicted of trafficking are subject to mandatory restitution. Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3020(2)(i) (Restitution), the following are included for an order of restitution:

For the period during which the victim of human trafficking was engaged in involuntary servitude, the greater of the following:

- (A) The value of the victim's time during the period of involuntary servitude as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the laws of this Commonwealth.
- (B) The gross income or value to the defendant of the services of the victim.
- (C) The amount the victim was promised or the amount an individual in the position of the victim would have reasonably expected to earn. This clause shall not apply to the amount an individual would have reasonably expected to earn in an illegal activity.

A facilitator convicted of a crime other than trafficking of persons, is subject to mandatory restitution orders, under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a) (Restitution for injuries to person or property), which states,

Upon conviction for any crime wherein property has been stolen, converted or otherwise unlawfully obtained, or its value substantially decreased as a direct result of the crime, or wherein the victim suffered personal injury directly resulting from the crime, the offender shall be sentenced to make restitution in addition to the punishment prescribed therefor.

“Personal injury” is defined as “[a]ctual bodily harm, including pregnancy, directly resulting from the crime.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h). As a result, if the victim³⁰ suffered “personal injury directly resulting from the crime,” then the buyer could potentially be required to pay restitution for every crime related to trafficking. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a).

4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*

Pennsylvania has no provision related to sex tourism.

- 4.3.1 Recommendation: Enact a law that prohibits selling or offering to sell travel services that include or facilitate travel for the purpose of engaging in commercial sexual exploitation of a minor, if occurring in Pennsylvania.

4.4 *Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Facilitating images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE) is prohibited. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(c) (Sexual abuse of children) states, “Any person who knowingly sells, distributes, delivers, disseminates, transfers, displays or exhibits to others, or who possesses for the purpose of sale, distribution, delivery, dissemination, transfer, display or exhibition to others, any book, magazine, pamphlet, slide, photograph, film, videotape, computer depiction or other material depicting a child under the age of 18 years engaging in a prohibited sexual act or in the simulation of such act commits an offense.” A first conviction is a felony of the third degree punishable by a fine up to \$15,000 and a term of imprisonment up to 7 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(i), 1101(3), 1103(3). A subsequent conviction is a felony of the second degree punishable by a fine up to \$25,000 and possible imprisonment up to 10 years. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 6312(d.1)(2)(ii), 1101(2), 1103(2).

³⁰ “Victim” is defined in the Crime Victim’s Act, codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. The definition of victim included in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h) refers to “section 479.1 of the act of April 9, 1929 (P.L. 177, No. 175), known as the Administrative Code of 1929.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h). This statute has been repealed and replaced by the Crime Victim’s Act, also known as “the act of November 24, 1998, P.L. 822, No. 111.” *Restitution for injuries to person or property—18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106*, ONECLE, <http://law.onecle.com/pennsylvania/crimes-and-offenses/00.011.006.000.html> (last visited July 14, 2011); 1998 Pa. Laws 111; 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. See Component 5.1 for a definition of “victim” as defined in the Crime Victim’s Act.

Promoting ICSE is also criminalized under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5903(a)(4) (Obscene and other sexual materials and performances),³¹ which states,

Offenses defined.--No person, knowing the obscene character of the materials or performances involved, shall:

....

(4) (i)

(ii) write, print, publish, utter or cause to be written, printed, published or uttered any advertisement or notice of any kind giving information, directly or indirectly, stating or purporting to state where, how, from whom or by what means any obscene materials can be purchased, obtained or had in which a minor is included

4.4.1 Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(c) (Sexual abuse of children) to increase the penalty to reflect the seriousness of the offense.

³¹ See *supra* note 22.

Legal Components:

- 5.1 *Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.*
- 5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based on the willingness of a minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.*
- 5.3 *State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*
- 5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*
- 5.5 *Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*
- 5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*
- 5.7 *Crime victims’ compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*
- 5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*
- 5.9 *Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.*
- 5.10 *Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.*
- 5.11 *Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.*

Legal Analysis:

- 5.1 *Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.*³²

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), Pennsylvania’s human trafficking offense, includes all commercial sexual exploitation of minors. Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011, force, fraud, or coercion is not required when the victim is a minor.³³ In addition, the human trafficking law applies to buyers; thus, buying commercial sex with a person who is under the age of eighteen constitutes human trafficking, and third party control is not required to establish the offense.³⁴ 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011. Consequently, Pennsylvania’s human trafficking offense includes when any child is bought or sold for sex, regardless of whether force, fraud, or coercion is used, regardless of whether a buyer exploited the youth without a trafficker’s involvement, and regardless of whether the victim identifies a trafficker. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011.

- 5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based on the willingness of a minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.*

While 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3018(b) (Evidence and defenses to human trafficking) prohibits a defense based on consent to an employment contract in labor servitude, defendants charged with subjecting a minor to sexual servitude under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals) or patronizing a victim of sexual servitude

³² See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, “Eliminating the Third Party Control Barrier to Identifying Juvenile Sex Trafficking Victims,” JuST Response Policy Paper (2015), http://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Policy-Paper_Eliminating-Third-Party-Control_Final1.pdf (discussing need to include all commercially sexually exploited children within sex trafficking definitions and corresponding need to include buyer conduct in core sex trafficking offenses regardless of whether victim is under control of a third party).

³³ See *supra* discussion in Component 1.1.

³⁴ See *supra* discussion of buyer applicability in Component 2.1.

under § 3013 (Patronizing a victim of sexual servitude) are not prohibited from raising the willingness of the minor to engage in the commercial sex act as a defense to prosecution.

- 5.2.1 Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3018 (Evidence and defenses to human trafficking) and § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), as well as Pennsylvania’s CSEC laws, to specifically prohibit a defense based on the minor’s willingness to engage in the commercial sex act.

5.3 *State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*³⁵

Pennsylvania’s prostitution statute, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a) (Prostitution and related offenses), is age-neutral and thus allows for the arrest and prosecution of a minor for the offense of prostitution. Specifically, “A person is guilty of prostitution if he or she: (1) is an inmate of a house of prostitution or otherwise engages in sexual activity as a business; or (2) loiters in or within view of any public place for the purpose of being hired to engage in sexual activity.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a).

- 5.3.1 Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(a) (Prostitution and related offenses) to ensure that all minors are protected from criminalization for prostitution offenses.³⁶

5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*

Pennsylvania law does not provide juvenile sex trafficking victims with a statutory avenue to services that are responsive to the unique trauma and harms associated with trafficking victimization. Further, state law does not provide a mandatory mechanism to prevent delinquency adjudications for offenses committed pursuant to the victimization.³⁷

- 5.4.1 Recommendation: Enact a protective response for juvenile sex trafficking victims that provides an avenue to specialized services and a mandatory mechanism to prevent delinquency adjudications.

5.5 *Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*³⁸

Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of child abuse within Pennsylvania’s child protection statutes. Pursuant to 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6303(b.1) (Definitions),

The term “child abuse” shall mean intentionally, knowingly or recklessly doing any of the following:

.....

³⁵ For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see: <http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo>.

³⁶ See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, “Seeking Justice: Legal approaches to eliminate criminal liability for child sex trafficking victims” (2018), https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/ANALYSIS-OF-STATUTORY-APPROACHES_ver7.pdf (discussing need to eliminate a minor’s criminal liability for prostitution and other offenses committed pursuant to trafficking victimization and to establish a statutory avenue to specialized services).

³⁷ If services are provided, however, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3054 (Appropriate implementation for minor human trafficking victims) states,

Best interest standard. The provision of services to a minor human trafficking victim by the Commonwealth or by any institution or person established or licensed by the Commonwealth shall be carried out in a manner that is in the best interest of the minor and appropriate to the particular situation.

³⁸ For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see: <http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo>.

- (4) Causing sexual abuse or exploitation of a child through any act or failure to act.

- (6) Creating a likelihood of sexual abuse or exploitation of a child through any recent act or failure to act.

- (10) Engaging a child in a severe form of trafficking in persons or sex trafficking, as those terms are defined under section 103 of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (114 Stat. 1466, 22 U.S.C. § 7102).

Further, commercial sexual exploitation of a child is included in the definition of “sexual abuse or exploitation” under 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6303(a), which states,

- (1) The employment, use, persuasion, inducement, enticement or coercion of a child to engage in or assist another individual to engage in sexually explicit conduct which includes, but is not limited to the following:

- (iv) Actual or simulated sexual activity for the purpose of producing visual depiction, including photographing, videotaping, computer depicting or filming.³⁹
- (2) The employment, use, persuasion, inducement, enticement or coercion of a child to engage in or assist another individual to engage in simulation of sexually explicit conduct for the purpose of producing visual depiction, including photographing, videotaping, computer depicting and filming.
- (3) Any of the following offenses committed against a child:
 - (i) Rape, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3121 (relating to rape).
 - (ii) Sexual assault, as defined in 18 Pa. C.S. § 3122.1 (relating to statutory sexual assault).
 - (iii) Involuntary deviate sexual intercourse, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3123 (relating to involuntary deviate sexual intercourse)
 - (iv) Sexual assault, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3124.1 (relating to sexual assault).
 - (v) Institutional sexual assault, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3124.2 (relating to institutional sexual assault).
 - (vi) Aggravated indecent assault, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3125 (relating to aggravated indecent assault
 - (vii) Indecent assault, as defined in 518 Pa.C.S. § 3126 (relating to indecent assault).
 - (viii) Indecent exposure, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 3127 (relating to indecent exposure).
 - (ix) Incest, as defined in 18 Pa. C.S. § 4302 (relating to incest).
 - (x) Prostitution, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses)
 - (xi) Sexual abuse, as defined in 18 Pa. C.S. 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
 - (xii) Unlawful contact with a minor, as defined in 18 Pa. C.S. § 6318 (relating to unlawful contact with minor).
 - (xiii) Sexual exploitation, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children)

5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*

The definition of “perpetrator” is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare. 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6303(a) (Definitions) defines “perpetrator” as

³⁹ However, 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6303(a)(1)(iv) further explains that subsection (1) “does not include consensual activities between a child who is 14 years of age or older and another person 14 who is 14 years of age or older and whose age is within four years of the child's age.”

A person who has committed child abuse as defined in this section. The following shall apply:

- (1) The term includes only the following:
 - (i) A parent of the child.
 - (ii) A spouse or former spouse of the child's parent.
 - (iii) A paramour or former paramour of the child's parent.
 - (iv) A person 14 years of age or older and responsible for the child's welfare⁴⁰ or having direct contact with children as an employee of child-care services, a school or through a program, activity or service.
 - (v) An individual who is 14 years of age or older who resides in the same home as the child.
 - (vi) An individual who is 18 years of age or older who does not reside in the same home as the child but is related within the third degree of consanguinity or affinity by birth or adoption to the child.
 - (vii) An individual 18 years of age or older who engages a child in severe forms of trafficking in person or sex trafficking, as those terms are defined under section 103 of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (114 Stat. 1466, 22 U.S.C. § 7102).

....

Accordingly, a child sex trafficking victim may be identified as an abused child regardless of the perpetrator of the abuse. As such, the definition of "perpetrator" will not prevent a child sex trafficking victim from accessing the protection of child welfare.

5.7 *Crime victims' compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*

A sexually exploited child will likely qualify as a victim for crime victims' compensation in Pennsylvania. Specifically, "persons eligible for compensation" include "a direct victim." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.701(a)(1) (Persons eligible for compensation). For purposes of this statute, a "direct victim" is defined in part as "[a]n individual against whom a crime has been committed or attempted and who as a direct result of the criminal act or attempt suffers physical or mental injury, death or the loss of earnings under this act." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103 (Definitions). For purposes of this statute, a "crime" is "[a]n act which was committed: (1) In this Commonwealth by a person, including a juvenile, without regard to legal exemption or defense which would constitute a crime under the following: . . . (ii) 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. (relating to crimes and offenses)." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. Since the crimes of trafficking of persons under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking of individuals), promoting prostitution of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1) (Prostitution and related offenses), and sexual exploitation of children under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320 (Sexual exploitation of children) all fall within Title 18 (Crimes and offenses), then commercially sexually exploited minors are covered under Pennsylvania's Crime Victims Act.

However, if the commercially sexually exploited child is regarded as "criminally responsible for the crime upon which a claim is based or an accomplice," then the child may be ineligible for compensation. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.701(b). Additionally, a victim may be ineligible for crime victims' compensation if the case was not immediately reported to the police under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.707(a) (Awards), which states,

Requirements.--No award shall be made unless it is determined by a preponderance of the evidence that:

....

⁴⁰ The term "person responsible for the child's welfare" includes "a person who provides permanent or temporary care, supervision, mental health diagnosis or treatment, training or control of a child in lieu of parental care, supervision and control." 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6303.

(3) The crime was promptly reported to the proper authorities. In no case may an award be made if the record shows that the report was made more than 72 hours after the occurrence of the crime unless:

- (i) the victim is under 18 years of age at the time of the occurrence of the crime and the alleged offender is the victim's parent or a person responsible for the victim's welfare, an individual residing in the same home as the victim or a paramour of the victim's parent; or
- (ii) the Office of Victims' Services finds the delay to have been justified, consistent with bureau regulations.

Also, to receive an award, the Office of Victims' Services in the Pennsylvania Commission on Crime and Delinquency must determine that "[t]he direct victim, intervenor or claimant has fully cooperated with all law enforcement agencies and the Office of Victims' Services unless the Office of Victims' Services finds the noncompliance to have been justified consistent with Office of Victims' Services regulations." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.707(a)(4). Due to the trauma victims of commercial sexual exploitation have undergone, they frequently do not immediately cooperate with the police, and thus victims could become ineligible for funds.

Even if the victim clears the hurdles to obtain victims' compensation, the commercially sexually exploited minor could have the amount of the award reduced if the Office of Victims' Services determines that "the direct victim or intervenor, because of conduct, contributed to the infliction of the injury." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.707(f)(1). This provision, however, does include a provision stating that "[i]f the crime involved is rape or sexual assault, the conduct of the direct victim shall not be considered." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.707(f)(2).

5.7.1 Recommendation: Amend the crime victims' compensation rules to stipulate an exemption for child sex trafficking victims from the ineligibility factors contained in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.701(b) (Persons eligible for compensation) and § 11.707 (Awards) for minor victims of sexual offenses under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses), § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor), § 6301 (Corruption of minors), § 6320 (Sexual exploitation of children), § 6312 (Sexual abuse of children), and § 5903(A)(6) (Obscene and other sexual materials and performances).

5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*

Child victims under 16 are entitled to certain victim-friendly criminal justice procedures. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5982 (Definitions). 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5985(a) (Testimony by contemporaneous alternative method)⁴¹ states that the court may allow "the testimony of the child victim or child material witness be taken under oath or affirmation in a room other than the courtroom and transmitted by a contemporaneous alternative method" or "may order that the child victim's or child material witness's testimony be recorded for presentation in court by any method that accurately captures and preserves the visual images, oral communications and other information presented during such testimony" under 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5984.1(a) (Recorded testimony).⁴²

⁴¹ In 1994, the Pennsylvania Supreme Court held 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5985 violated the confrontation clause of Art. 1 § 9 of the Pennsylvania Constitution. *Commonwealth v. Loudon*, 638 A.2d 953 (Pa. 1994). The statute was subsequently amended in 1996 and in 2004. It does not appear that a case has either upheld or overturned the statute since the amendments. In 1998, a proposed amendment to the Pennsylvania Constitution allowing the legislature to enact laws regarding the manner of children's testimony was held to violate the state constitution. *Commonwealth v. Wilson*, 707 A.2d 1114, 1121 n.2 (Pa. 1998) (Newman, J., dissenting) (citing *Bergdoll v. Kane*, 694 A.2d 1155 (Pa. 1997)); *See* Pa. Const., art. XI, § 1 (explaining that two amendments may not be proposed in one question on the ballot). It has not been re-proposed since. The Pennsylvania Supreme Court stated of 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5985 in 1998, "[I]t is apparent that the use of videotaped depositions and closed-circuit television as testimony continues to be an unresolved issue." *Id.*

⁴² 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5984.1(b) states,

Additionally, “in a prosecution involving a child victim of sexual or physical abuse, unless the court otherwise orders, the name of the child victim shall not be disclosed by officers or employees of the court to the public, and any records revealing the name of the child victim will not be open to public inspection.” 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5988(a) (Victims of sexual or physical abuse).

Specific protections are specifically given to minor human trafficking victims under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3054(b) (Appropriate implementation for minor human trafficking victims) which states,

Special procedures. Special procedures shall be developed to accommodate minor witnesses during the investigation and prosecution of violations of this chapter, including:

- (1) The presence of the parent, legal guardian, foster parent or attorney during all testimony and court proceedings, if it is in the best interest of the minor.
- (2) Reuniting the minor with family members, whether within or without the United States, whenever safe, possible and in the best interest of the minor.
- (3) Formally investigate the home situation of a minor who became a human trafficking victim after running away or being cast out of the minor's home or foster care.

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3019 (Victim protection during prosecution) provides specific confidentiality protections to human trafficking victims during the trial process. Subsection (a) states, “an officer or employee of the court may not disclose the identity of the human trafficking victim to the public. Any record revealing the name of the human trafficking victim shall not be open to public inspection” Additionally, 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6339 (Confidentiality of reports) provides for the confidentiality of reports, information, and photographs “concerning alleged instances of child abuse in the possession of the department or a county agency”⁴³

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3018(a) (Evidence and defenses to human trafficking),

General rule.--Evidence of the following facts or conditions shall not constitute a defense in a prosecution for a violation under this chapter, nor shall the evidence preclude a finding of a violation under this chapter:

- (1) Specific instances of past sexual conduct of the victim of human trafficking, opinion evidence of the alleged victim's past sexual conduct and reputation evidence of the alleged victim's past sexual conduct shall not be admissible in a prosecution under this chapter, except evidence of the alleged victim's past sexual conduct with the defendant shall be admissible where consent of the alleged victim is at issue and the evidence is otherwise admissible under the rules of evidence. A defendant who proposes to offer evidence of the alleged victim's past sexual conduct under this paragraph shall file a written motion and offer of proof at the time of trial. If, at the time of trial, the court determines that the motion and offer of proof are sufficient on their faces, the court shall order an in camera hearing and shall make findings on the record as to the relevance and admissibility of the proposed evidence under the standards of this paragraph.

Determination.--Before the court orders the child victim or the child material witness to testify by recorded testimony, the court must determine, based on evidence presented to it, that testifying either in an open forum in the presence and full view of the finder of fact or in the defendant's presence will result in the child victim or child material witness suffering serious emotional distress that would substantially impair the child victim's or child material witness's ability to reasonably communicate.

⁴³ Reports, information, and photographs of this nature will only be made available to certain individuals acting in their official capacities, including law enforcement officers who are investigating “[s]evere forms of trafficking in persons or sex trafficking, as those terms are defined under section 103 of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (114 Stat. 1466, 22 U.S.C. § 7102).

(2) The age of the victim of human trafficking with respect to the age of consent to sex or legal age of marriage.

5.9 *Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.*

Pennsylvania law does not provide a mechanism for minors to vacate delinquency adjudications related to trafficking victimization, and juvenile records may only be expunged after a waiting period.

Regarding record expungement, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9123(a) (Juvenile records) states,

Expungement of juvenile records.--Notwithstanding the provisions of section 9105 (relating to other criminal justice information) and except upon cause shown, expungement of records of juvenile delinquency cases wherever kept or retained shall occur after 30 days' notice to the district attorney, whenever the court upon its motion or upon the motion of a child or the parents or guardian finds:

- (1) a complaint is filed which is not substantiated or the petition which is filed as a result of a complaint is dismissed by the court;
- (2) six months have elapsed since the final discharge of the person from supervision under a consent decree and no proceeding seeking adjudication or conviction is pending;
- (3) five years have elapsed since the final discharge of the person from commitment, placement, probation or any other disposition and referral and since such final discharge, the person has not been convicted of a felony, misdemeanor or adjudicated delinquent and no proceeding is pending seeking such conviction or adjudication; or
- (4) the individual is 18 years of age or older, the attorney for the Commonwealth consents to the expungement and a court orders the expungement after giving consideration to the following factors:
 - (i) the type of offense;
 - (ii) the individual's age, history of employment, criminal activity and drug or alcohol problems;
 - (iii) adverse consequences that the individual may suffer if the records are not expunged; and
 - (iv) whether retention of the record is required for purposes of protection of the public safety.

Because 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 9123(a) mandates a waiting period, however, child sex trafficking victims may face collateral consequences associated with having accessible delinquency records during that time.

Regarding vacatur, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3019 (Victim protection during prosecution) states,

.....
(d) Motion to vacate conviction.

- (1) An individual convicted under section 3503 (relating to criminal trespass), 5503 (relating to disorderly conduct), 5506 (relating to loitering and prowling at night time), 5507 (relating to obstructing highways and other public passages) or 5902 [relating to prostitution], or an offense for simple possession of a controlled substance committed as a direct result of being a victim of human trafficking may file a motion to vacate the conviction.

.....
(g) Conviction vacated.--If the motion under subsection (d) is granted, the court shall vacate the conviction, strike the adjudication of guilt and order the expungement of the record of the criminal proceedings. The court shall issue an order to expunge all records and files related to the moving party's arrest, citation, investigation, charge, adjudication of guilt, criminal proceedings and probation for the offense.

However, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3019(d) applies specifically to “convictions,” and 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6354 (Effect of adjudication) states, “[a]n order of disposition or other adjudication in a proceeding under this chapter [Juvenile Matters] is not a conviction of crime” Accordingly, a delinquency adjudication cannot be vacated and related records cannot be expunged under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3019.

5.9.1 Recommendation: Amend 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3019 (Victim protection during prosecution) to allow child sex trafficking victims to vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from to trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.

5.10 *Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.*

If the perpetrator is prosecuted as a trafficker under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), the commercially sexually exploited victim will be entitled to restitution. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3020(2)(i) (Restitution) states,

For the period during which the victim of human trafficking was engaged in involuntary servitude, the greater of the following:

- (A) The value of the victim's time during the period of involuntary servitude as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the laws of this Commonwealth.
- (B) The gross income or value to the defendant of the services of the victim.
- (C) The amount the victim was promised or the amount an individual in the position of the victim would have reasonably expected to earn. This clause shall not apply to the amount an individual would have reasonably expected to earn in an illegal activity.

Additionally, a commercially sexually exploited child victim could receive restitution “for any crime wherein property has been stolen, converted or otherwise unlawfully obtained, or its value substantially decreased as a direct result of the crime, or wherein the victim⁴⁴ suffered personal injury directly resulting from the crime.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(a) (Restitution for injuries to person or property). “Personal injury” is defined as “[a]ctual bodily harm, including pregnancy, directly resulting from the crime.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h).

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3023 (Cumulative remedies) states, “Any remedies under this chapter shall be in addition to any other criminal penalties or forfeitures authorized under the laws of this Commonwealth.”

Domestic minor sex trafficking victims can also bring a claim for civil damages⁴⁵ under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3051 (Civil causes of action) which states,

⁴⁴ “Victim” is defined in the Crime Victim’s Act, codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. The definition of victim included in 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h) cites “section 479.1 of the act of April 9, 1929 (P.L. 177, No. 175), known as the Administrative Code of 1929.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106(h). This statute has been repealed and replaced by the Crime Victim’s Act, also known as “the act of November 24, 1998, P.L. 822, No. 111.” *Restitution for injuries to person or property—18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 1106*, ONECLE, <http://law.onecle.com/pennsylvania/crimes-and-offenses/00.011.006.000.html> (last visited July 14, 2011); 1998 Pa. Laws 111; 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.103. See Component 5.1 for a definition of “victim” as defined in the Crime Victim’s Act.

⁴⁵ Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3051(j),

Nondefenses.--It shall not be a defense to an action under this section that the following occurred:

- (1) The victim of the sex trade and the defendant had a consensual sexual relationship.
- (2) The defendant is related to the victim of the sex trade by blood or marriage.
- (3) The defendant has lived with the victim of the sex trade in any formal or informal household arrangement.

- (a) General rule.--
- (1) An individual who is a victim of human trafficking may bring a civil action against any person that participated in the human trafficking of the individual in the court of common pleas of the county where the individual resides or where any of the alleged violations of this chapter occurred.
 - (2) An individual who is a victim of the sex trade may bring a civil action in the court of common pleas of the county where the individual resides against a person that:
 - (i) recruits, profits from or maintains the victim in any sex trade act;
 - (ii) abuses or causes bodily harm to the victim in any sex trade act; and
 - (iii) knowingly advertises or publishes advertisements for purposes of recruitment into sex trade activity.
-
- (c) Damages.--The court may award any of the following forms of relief:
- (1) Actual damages.
 - (2) Compensatory damages.
 - (3) Punitive damages.
 - (4) Injunctive relief.
 - (5) Any other appropriate relief.
- (d) Attorney fees and costs.--A prevailing plaintiff who is a victim of human trafficking shall be awarded reasonable attorney fees and costs.
- (e) Treble damages.--Treble damages shall be awarded to a victim of human trafficking on proof of actual damages where the defendant's acts were willful and malicious.

5.11 Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.

18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3051(h)–(i) (Civil causes of action) extends the time for human trafficking victims to bring a civil action against an offender. § 3051(h)–(i) states,

- (h) Statute of limitations.--
- (1) An action may be brought under this section by an individual who was the victim of human trafficking while an adult within five years of the last act against that individual that constitutes an offense under this chapter.

-
- (4) The victim of the sex trade was paid or otherwise compensated for sex trade activity.
 - (5) The victim of the sex trade engaged in sex trade activity prior to any involvement with the defendant.
 - (6) The victim of the sex trade continued to engage in sex trade activity following any involvement with the defendant.
 - (7) The victim of the sex trade made no attempt to escape, flee or otherwise terminate the contact with the defendant.
 - (8) The victim of the sex trade consented to engage in sex trade activity.
 - (9) The victim of the sex trade engaged in only a single incident of sex trade activity.
 - (10) There was no physical contact involved in the sex trade activity.
 - (11) As a condition of employment, the defendant required the victim of the sex trade to agree not to engage in prostitution.
 - (12) The defendant's place of business was posted with signs prohibiting prostitution or prostitution-related activities.
 - (13) The victim of the sex trade has been convicted or charged with prostitution or prostitution-related offenses.
 - (14) The victim of labor trafficking made no attempt to escape, flee or otherwise terminate the contact with the defendant.

- (2) An action may be brought under this section by an individual who was a victim of human trafficking while a minor for any offense committed against the victim while the victim was under 18 years of age until that victim reaches 30 years of age.
- (i) Estoppel.--A defendant is estopped from asserting a defense of the statute of limitations when the expiration of the statute is due to intentional conduct by the defendant knowingly inducing or coercing the plaintiff to delay the filing of the action.

For other civil actions, a commercially sexually exploited minor must bring the action against the offender in a definitive time, but that length of time could be extended under 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5533(b) (Infancy, insanity, or imprisonment) in cases where force is involved. Specifically, 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5533(b) states in part,

- (1) (i) If an individual entitled to bring a civil action is an unemancipated minor at the time the cause of action accrues, the period of minority shall not be deemed a portion of the time period within which the action must be commenced. Such person shall have the same time for commencing an action after attaining majority as is allowed to others by the provisions of this subchapter.
- (ii) As used in this paragraph, the term “minor” shall mean any individual who has not yet attained 18 years of age.
- (2) (i) If an individual entitled to bring a civil action arising from childhood sexual abuse is under 18 years of age at the time the cause of action accrues, the individual shall have a period of 12 years after attaining 18 years of age in which to commence an action for damages regardless of whether the individual files a criminal complaint regarding the childhood sexual abuse.
- (ii) For the purposes of this paragraph, the term “childhood sexual abuse” shall include, but not be limited to, the following sexual activities between a minor and an adult, provided that the individual bringing the civil action engaged in such activities as a result of forcible compulsion or by threat of forcible compulsion which would prevent resistance by a person of reasonable resolution:
- (A) sexual intercourse, which includes penetration, however slight, of any body part or object into the sex organ of another;
- (B) deviate sexual intercourse, which includes sexual intercourse per os or per anus; and
- (C) indecent contact, which includes any touching of the sexual or other intimate parts of the person for the purpose of arousing or gratifying sexual desire in either person.⁴⁶

This cause of action requires “forcible compulsion;” however, that term is defined broadly.

With respect to criminal statutes of limitation, “major sexual offenses” have a statute of limitations of 12 years, and the list of offenses includes sexual abuse of children under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312 (Sexual abuse of children) but does not include other commercial sexual exploitation offenses. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5552(B.1) (Other offenses). The general limit is two years. 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5552(a). However, the time period for bringing criminal actions is extended for “[a]ny sexual offense committed against a minor who is less than 18 years of age any time up to the later of the period of limitation provided by law after the minor has reached 18 years of age or the date the minor reaches 50 years of age.” 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5552(c)(3). For purposes of this provision, “sexual offense” includes corruption of minors under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6301, sexual abuse of children under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6312(b), and sexual exploitation of children under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6320. Under subsection (b), the prosecution of “major offenses”

⁴⁶ 18 Pa. Con. Stat. § 3101 (Relating to definitions) defines “forcible compulsion” for 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5533(b) as “[c]ompulsion by use of physical, intellectual, moral, emotional or psychological force, either express or implied. The term includes, but is not limited to, compulsion resulting in another person’s death, whether the death occurred before, during or after sexual intercourse.”

“must be commenced within five years” from the time the crime was committed. For the purposes of this provision, “major offense” includes promoting prostitution of a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(b.1), criminal attempt under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 901, criminal solicitation under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 902, and corrupt organizations under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911. While some commercial sexual exploitation offenses, such as sexual exploitation of a minor, are included in these lists, notably absent are the trafficking of persons statute codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011 and the living off prostitutes and patronizing prostitution provisions codified at 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5902(d), (e).

- 5.11.1 Recommendation: Amend 42 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5552(B.1) (Other offenses) to eliminate the statute of limitations for commencing prosecutions of trafficking in persons and CSEC offenses.

Legal Components:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*
- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*
- 6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*
- 6.4 *Using a law enforcement decoy to investigate buying or selling commercial sex is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*
- 6.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*
- 6.6 *State law requires reporting of missing children and located missing children.*

Legal Analysis:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*

Pennsylvania law authorizes training on human trafficking under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3031(3) (Grants), which states,

Subject to the availability of funds, the commission shall make grants to State agencies, units of local government and nongovernmental agencies to:

. . . .

- (3) Ensure protection of victims of human trafficking, including training of first responders.

The term “first responders” is likely broad enough to include law enforcement officers.

Additionally, training on the sexual assault collection program pursuant to 35 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 10172.3 (Sexual assault evidence collection program), crime victims’ compensation program pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 11.212 (Responsibilities of state and local law enforcement agencies), and training on electronic surveillance techniques pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5724 (Training) are required and might include aspects related to domestic minor sex trafficking.

- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*

Pennsylvania law requires both parties to consent to audiotaping. Those who intentionally intercept wire, electronic, or oral communications are guilty of felonies of the third degree. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5703 (Interception, disclosure or use of wire, electronic or oral communications). An exception exists “where all parties to the communication have given prior consent to such interception.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5704(4) (Exceptions to prohibition of interception and disclosure of communications).

Notably, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5704 also provides an exception for offenses related to corrupt organizations under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911, trafficking in individuals under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 3011, and unlawful contact with a minor under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. §§ 5704(2), 5708(1). 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5704(2) states,

It shall not be unlawful and no prior court approval shall be required under this chapter for:

. . . .

(2) Any investigative or law enforcement officer or any person acting at the direction or request of an investigative or law enforcement officer to intercept a wire, electronic or oral communication involving suspected criminal activities, including, but not limited to, the crimes enumerated in section 5708⁴⁷ (relating to order authorizing interception of wire, electronic or oral communications), where:

(i) (Deleted by amendment).

(ii) one of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to such interception.

However, no interception under this paragraph shall be made unless the Attorney General or a deputy attorney general designated in writing by the Attorney General, or the district attorney, or an assistant district attorney designated in writing by the district attorney, of the county wherein the interception is to be made, has reviewed the facts and is satisfied that the consent is voluntary and has given prior approval for the interception . . . ;

(iii) the investigative or law enforcement officer meets in person with a suspected felon and wears a concealed electronic or mechanical device capable of intercepting or recording oral communications. However, no interception under this subparagraph may be used in any criminal prosecution except for a prosecution involving harm done to the investigative or law enforcement officer. This subparagraph shall not be construed to limit the interception and disclosure authority provided for in this subchapter; or

(iv) the requirements of this subparagraph are met. If an oral interception otherwise authorized under this paragraph will take place in the home of a nonconsenting party, then, in addition to the requirements of subparagraph (ii), the interception shall not be conducted until an order is first obtained from the president judge, or his designee who shall also be a judge, of a court of common pleas, authorizing such in-home interception, based upon an affidavit by an investigative or law enforcement officer that establishes probable cause for the issuance of such an order. No such order or affidavit shall be required where probable cause and exigent circumstances exist. For the purposes of this paragraph, an oral interception shall be deemed to take place in the home of nonconsenting party only if both the consenting and nonconsenting parties are physically present in the home at the time of the interception.

6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).*

Certain specified law enforcement officers may make a written application for “an order authorizing the interception of a wire, electronic or oral communication by the investigative or law enforcement officers or agency having responsibility for an investigation involving suspected criminal activities when such interception may provide evidence of the commission of any of the following offenses, or may provide evidence aiding in the apprehension of the perpetrator or perpetrators of any of the following offenses,” which includes 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911 (Corrupt organizations), § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses) (“where such offense is dangerous to life, limb or property and punishable by imprisonment for more than one year”), and § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor). 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5708(1), (2) (Order authorizing interception of wire, electronic or oral communications).

In emergency situations for the same offenses, 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5713(a) (Emergency situations) would apply. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5713(a) states,

⁴⁷ Crimes falling under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5708 include 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 911 (Corrupt organizations), § 3011 (Trafficking in individuals), § 5902 (Prostitution and related offenses) (“where such offense is dangerous to life, limb or property and punishable by imprisonment for more than one year”), and § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor). 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5708(1), (2).

Whenever, upon informal application by the Attorney General or a designated deputy attorney general authorized in writing by the Attorney General or a district attorney or an assistant district attorney authorized in writing by the district attorney of a county wherein the suspected criminal activity has been, is or is about to occur, a judge determines there are grounds upon which an order could be issued pursuant to this chapter, and that an emergency situation exists with respect to the investigation of an offense designated in section 5708 (relating to order authorizing interception of wire, electronic or oral communications), and involving conspiratorial activities characteristic of organized crime or a substantial danger to life or limb, dictating authorization for immediate interception of wire, electronic or oral communications before an application for an order could with due diligence be submitted to him and acted upon, the judge may grant oral approval for such interception without an order, conditioned upon the filing with him, within 48 hours thereafter, of an application for an order which, if granted, shall recite the oral approval and be retroactive to the time of such oral approval. Such interception shall immediately terminate when the communication sought is obtained or when the application for an order is denied, whichever is earlier. In the event no application for an order is made, the content of any wire, electronic or oral communication intercepted shall be treated as having been obtained in violation of this subchapter.

6.4 *Using a law enforcement decoy to investigate buying or selling commercial sex is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*

Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor), a defendant would not be able to assert a defense to prosecution based on the use of a law enforcement decoy posing as a minor. 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a) states,

A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

.....
(3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).

(4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to obscene and other sexual materials and performances)

.....
(6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

6.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*

Pennsylvania's statutes allow using the Internet or electronic communications for investigations in certain offenses related to human trafficking under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318 (Unlawful contact with minor). This statute gives concurrent jurisdiction to the attorney general and district attorney to prosecute when "any crime arising out of the activity prohibited by this section when the person charged with a violation of this section contacts a minor through the use of a computer, computer system or computer network." 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(B.1). Under 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(a),

A person commits an offense if he is intentionally in contact with a minor, or a law enforcement officer acting in the performance of his duties who has assumed the identity of a minor, for the purpose of engaging in an activity prohibited under any of the following, and either the person initiating the contact or the person being contacted is within this Commonwealth:

.....
(3) Prostitution as defined in section 5902 (relating to prostitution and related offenses).

(4) Obscene and other sexual materials and performances as defined in section 5903 (relating to obscene and other sexual materials and performances)

.....
(6) Sexual exploitation of children as defined in section 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of children).

Therefore, because 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(B.1) allows prosecution by various levels of state government, this section allows undercover officers to use computers for investigations. Pursuant to 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 6318(c) defines “contacts” as:

Direct or indirect contact or communication by any means, method or device, including contact or communication in person or through an agent or agency, through any print medium, the mails, a common carrier or communication common carrier, any electronic communication system and any telecommunications, wire, computer or radio communications device or system.

6.6 *State law requires reporting of missing children and located missing children.*

Law enforcement and county agencies must report missing or abducted children. Pursuant to 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5702(b) (County responsibilities): “A county agency shall report to law enforcement and to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children as soon as practicable but no later than 24 hours after receiving information about a child⁴⁸ who is missing from the child’s residence or is abducted.” Upon receiving the report, “law enforcement shall enter the information into the National Crime Information Center database.” 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5703 (Law enforcement responsibilities).

Law enforcement officers are also required “[t]o make an entry into the Missing Persons File through the Commonwealth Law Enforcement Assistance Network (CLEAN) in accord with Pennsylvania State Police policy and procedures immediately upon receipt of sufficient identification information on the missing child.” 18 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 2908(a)(3) (Missing children). Subsection (a)(1) also requires that law enforcement agencies “investigate a report of a missing child immediately upon receipt of the report regardless of the age of the missing child or the circumstances surrounding the disappearance of the child. In no case shall law enforcement agencies impose a mandatory waiting period prior to commencing the investigation of a missing child.” Under subsection (a)(4), law enforcement shall, “insure timely cancellation of any entry made pursuant to this section where the missing child has returned or is located.”

Additionally, county agencies must report instances of suspected or confirmed child sex trafficking. Pursuant to 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5702(a):

A county agency shall report to law enforcement as soon as practicable, but in no case later than 24 hours after receiving information about a child who:

- (1) The county agency has reasonable cause to suspect of being at risk of being a sex trafficking victim; or
- (2) The county agency identifies as being a sex trafficking victim.

⁴⁸ For the purpose of this chapter only, 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. Stat. § 5701 defines “child” as:

An individual who is under 21 years of age and meets one of the following:

- (1) The county agency is conducting an assessment of the need for services.
- (2) The county agency is conducting an investigation of suspected child abuse of the child under chapter 63 (relating to child protective services).
- (3) The county agency is providing services to the child.

Although 23 Pa. Cons. Stat. § 5702(a) is not specifically applicable to missing children, such reports could allow law enforcement to track and identify missing children who become victims of sex trafficking.

© January 26, 2012 Shared Hope International, American Center for Law and Justice. All rights reserved.

© November 29, 2012 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 7, 2013 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 6, 2014 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 11, 2015 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 17, 2016 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 15, 2017 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 14, 2018 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.