

2018 ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

OKLAHOMA

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 1: CRIMINALIZATION OF DOMESTIC MINOR SEX TRAFFICKING

Legal Components:

PROTECTED

INNOCENCE Challenge

- 1.1 The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.
- 1.2 Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.
- 1.3 Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.
- 1.4 The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.

Legal Analysis¹:

1.1 The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.

Oklahoma's human trafficking law distinguishes between the sex trafficking of adults and children. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) states, "It shall be unlawful to knowingly engage in human trafficking." "Human trafficking" is defined as "modern-day slavery that includes, but is not limited to, extreme exploitation² and the denial of freedom or liberty of an individual for purposes of deriving benefit from that individual's commercial sex act or labor." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(4). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6) additionally defines "human trafficking for commercial sex" in part as,

b. recruiting, enticing, harboring, maintaining, transporting, providing, purchasing, or obtaining, by any means, a minor³ for purposes of engaging the minor in a commercial sex act, or c. benefiting, financially or by receiving anything of value, from participating in a venture that has engaged in an act of trafficking for commercial sex.

¹ This report includes legislation enacted as of August 1, 2018.

² Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) does not define "extreme exploitation."

³ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(8) defines "minor" as "an individual under eighteen (18) years of age."

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(2) defines "commercial sex" as "any form of commercial sexual activity such as sexually explicit performances, prostitution, participation in the production of pornography, performance in a strip club, or exotic dancing or display."

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 5 years or for life, a fine not to exceed \$100,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). If the victim is under the age of 18, however, a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for at least 15 years or for life, a fine not to exceed \$250,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C).⁴

1.2 Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.

Oklahoma has several statutes that specifically criminalize CSEC, including the following:

- 1. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.—soliciting or procuring—residing or being in place for prohibited purpose—aiding, abetting or participating—child prostitution) states,
 - A. It shall further be unlawful:
 - 1. To engage in prostitution,⁵ lewdness,⁶ or assignation;

"Violent crime" means any of the following felony offense except the following, or offenses and any attempts to commit or conspiracy or solicitation to commit the following crimes:

ss. child pornography or aggravated child pornography as defined in Section 1021.2, 1021.3, 1024.1 or 1040.12a of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes,

tt. child prostitution as defined in Section 1030 of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes,

xx. human trafficking as provided for in Section 748 of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes

. . . .

Electric Monitoring Programs are also unavailable for violent crimes. Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).

The text of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of House Bill 2286 during the 2nd Regular Session of Oklahoma's 56th Legislature (effective November 1, 2018).

⁵ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1030(1) (Definitions) defines "prostitution" as,

a. the giving or receiving of the body for sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, masturbation, anal intercourse or lewdness with any person not his or her spouse, in exchange for money or any other thing of value, or

b. the making of any appointment or engagement for sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, masturbation, anal intercourse or lewdness with any person not his or her spouse, in exchange for money or any other thing of value.

⁶ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1030(6) defines "lewdness" as,

a. any lascivious, lustful or licentious conduct,

b. the giving or receiving of the body for indiscriminate sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, masturbation, anal intercourse, or lascivious, lustful or licentious conduct with any person not his or her spouse, or c. any act in furtherance of such conduct or any appointment or engagement for prostitution.

⁴ Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(xx) lists human trafficking as a violent crime. According to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8), a person convicted of a violent crime is not eligible "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571,

2. To solicit, induce, entice, or procure another to commit an act of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, with himself or herself;

3. To reside in, enter, or remain in any house, place, building, or other structure, or to enter or remain in any vehicle, trailer, or other conveyance with the intent of committing an act of prostitution, lewdness, or assignation; or

4. To aid, abet, or participate in the doing of any of the acts prohibited in paragraph 1, 2 or 3 of this subsection.

B. Any prohibited act described in paragraph 1, 2, 3 or 4 of subsection A of this section committed with a person under eighteen (18) years of age shall be deemed child prostitution, as defined in Section 1030 [Definitions] of this title,⁷ and shall be punishable as provided in Section 1031 of this title.

C. In any prosecution of a person sixteen (16) or seventeen (17) years of age for an offense described in subsection A of this section, there shall be a presumption that the actor was coerced into committing such offense by another person in violation of the human trafficking provisions set forth in Section 748 of this title.

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years and a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions. Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(tt), "child prostitution" is a violent crime for which "community sentences" are not available without consent from the district attorney and for which Electric Monitoring Programs are unavailable. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8);⁸ Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(tt); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).⁹

2. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(A) (Child under 18 years of age—Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment) makes it a crime to

 Offer, or offer to secure, a child under eighteen (18) years of age for the purpose of prostitution, or for any other lewd or indecent act, or procure or offer to procure a child for, or a place for a child as an inmate in, a house of prostitution or other place where prostitution is practiced;
 Receive or to offer or agree to receive any child under eighteen (18) years of age into any house, place, building, other structure, vehicle, trailer, or other conveyance for the purpose of prostitution, lewdness, or assignation, or to permit any person to remain there for such purpose; or
 Direct, take, or transport, or to offer or agree to take or transport, or aid or assist in transporting, any child under eighteen (18) years of age to any house, place, building, other structure, vehicle, trailer, or other conveyance, or to any other person with knowledge or having reasonable cause to believe that the purpose of such directing, taking, or transporting is prostitution, lewdness, or assignation.

A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 1–10 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1087(B)(1), 64(B).¹⁰ Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(B)(2) states, "Any owner, proprietor, keeper, manager, conductor, or other person who knowingly permits any violation of this section in any house, building, room, or other premises or any conveyances under his control or of which he has possession shall, upon conviction for the first offense, be guilty of a misdemeanor" punishable by imprisonment in a county jail for

⁷ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1030(2) defines "child prostitution" as "prostitution or lewdness as defined in this section with a person under eighteen (18) years of age, in exchange for money or any other thing of value."

⁸ See supra note 4.

⁹ See supra note 4 for definition of violent crime, in part.

¹⁰ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 64(B), "Upon a conviction for any felony punishable by imprisonment in any jail or prison, in relation to which no fine is prescribed by law, the court or a jury may impose a fine on the offender not exceeding Ten Thousand Dollars (\$ 10,000.00) in addition to the imprisonment prescribed."

6 months to 1 year and a fine of \$500–\$5,000, with subsequent convictions punishable as felonies by imprisonment for 1–10 years, a fine of \$5,000–\$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(B)(2).

3. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(A) (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment) provides,

No person shall:

1. By promise, threats, violence, or by any device or scheme, including but not limited to the use of any controlled dangerous substance prohibited pursuant to the provisions of the Uniform Controlled Dangerous Substances Act, cause, induce, persuade, or encourage a child under eighteen (18) years of age to engage or continue to engage in prostitution or to become or remain an inmate of a house of prostitution or other place where prostitution is practiced;

2. Keep, hold, detain, restrain, or compel against his will, any child under eighteen (18) years of age to engage in the practice of prostitution or in a house of prostitution or other place where prostitution is practiced or allowed; or

3. Directly or indirectly keep, hold, detain, restrain, or compel or attempt to keep, hold, detain, restrain, or compel a child under eighteen (18) years of age to engage in the practice of prostitution or in a house of prostitution or any place where prostitution is practiced or allowed for the purpose of compelling such child to directly or indirectly pay, liquidate, or cancel any debt, dues, or obligations incurred, or said to have been incurred by such child.

A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 1–25 years and a fine of \$5,000–\$25,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(B)(1). Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(B)(2) states,

Any owner, proprietor, keeper, manager, conductor, or other person who knowingly permits a violation of this section in any house, building, room, tent, lot or premises under his control or of which he has possession, upon conviction for the first offense, shall be guilty of a misdemeanor punishable by imprisonment in the county jail for a period of not less than six (6) months nor more than one (1) year, and by a fine of not more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$ 5,000.00).

Subsequent convictions are punishable as felonies by imprisonment for 1-10 years and a fine of \$5,000-\$25,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(B)(2).

4. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A) (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography) states, "Any person who shall procure or cause the participation of any minor under the age of eighteen (18) years in any child pornography¹¹ or who knowingly possesses, procures, or manufactures, or causes to be sold or

¹¹ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.1(A) (Definitions), "child pornography," as it is used in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1021, 1021.1, through 1021.4, Sections 1022 through 1024, and 1040.8 through 1040.24, is defined as

any visual depiction or individual image stored or contained in any format on any medium including, but not limited to, film, motion picture, videotape, photograph, negative, undeveloped film, slide, photographic product, reproduction of a photographic product, play or performance wherein a minor under the age of eighteen (18) years is engaged in any act with a person, other than his or her spouse, of sexual intercourse which is normal or perverted, in any act of anal sodomy, in any act of sexual activity with an animal, in any act of sadomasochistic abuse including, but not limited to, flagellation or torture, or the condition of being fettered, bound or otherwise physically restrained in the context of sexual conduct, in any act of fellatio or cunnilingus, in any act of excretion in the context of sexual conduct, in any lewd exhibition of the uncovered genitals in the context of masturbation or other sexual conduct, or where the lewd exhibition of the viewer, or wherein a person under the age of eighteen (18) years observes such acts or exhibitions. Each visual depiction or individual image shall constitute a separate item and multiple copies of the same identical material shall each be counted as a separate item.

distributed any child pornography shall be guilty, upon conviction, of a felony" A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A). Additionally, "Persons convicted under this section shall not be eligible for a deferred sentence." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571, a violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A) is a violent crime, for which "community sentences" are not available without consent from the district attorney and for which Electric Monitoring Programs are unavailable. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(ss); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).¹²

- 5. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A) (Guardians—Parents—Custodians—Consent to participation of minors in child pornography) makes it a crime if "[a]ny parent, guardian or individual having custody of a minor under the age of eighteen (18) years... knowingly permits or consents to the participation of a minor in any child pornography...." A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both, with no eligibility for a deferred sentence. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A) is a violent crime, and "community sentences" are not available without consent from the district attorney and for which Electric Monitoring Programs are unavailable. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(ss); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).¹³
- 6. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5(H)–(J) (Child abuse—Child neglect—Child sexual abuse—Child sexual exploitation—Enabling—Penalties) states,

H. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in child sexual exploitation shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections not exceeding life imprisonment, or by imprisonment in a county jail not exceeding one (1) year, or by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00), or both such fine and imprisonment except as provided in subsection I of this section for a child victim under twelve (12) years of age. Except for persons sentenced to life or life without parole, any person sentenced to imprisonment for two (2) years or more for a violation of this subsection shall be required to serve a term of post-imprisonment supervision pursuant to subparagraph f of paragraph 1 of subsection A of Section 991a of Title 22 of the Oklahoma Statutes under conditions determined by the Department of Corrections. The jury shall be advised that the mandatory post-imprisonment supervision shall be in addition to the actual imprisonment. As used in this subsection, "child sexual exploitation" means the willful or malicious sexual exploitation which includes but is not limited to allowing, permitting, or encouraging a child under eighteen (18) years of age to engage in prostitution or allowing, permitting, encouraging or engaging in the lewd, obscene or pornographic photographing, filming, or depicting of a child under eighteen (18) years of age by another.

I. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in sexual exploitation of a child under twelve (12) years of age shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections for not less than twenty-five (25) years nor more than life imprisonment, and by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00).

J. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in enabling child sexual exploitation shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections not exceeding life imprisonment, or by imprisonment in a county jail not exceeding one (1) year, or by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00), or both such fine and imprisonment. As used in this subsection, "enabling child sexual exploitation" means the causing, procuring or permitting of a willful or malicious act of child sexual exploitation, which includes but is not limited to allowing, permitting, or encouraging a child under

¹² See supra note 4 for definition of violent crime, in part.

¹³ See supra note 4 for definition of violent crime, in part.

eighteen (18) years of age to engage in prostitution or allowing, permitting, encouraging or engaging in the lewd, obscene or pornographic photographing, filming, or depicting of a child under eighteen (18) years of age by another. As used in this subsection, "permit" means to authorize or allow for the care of a child by an individual when the person authorizing or allowing such care knows or reasonably should know that the child will be placed at risk of sexual exploitation as proscribed by this subsection.

7. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(A), (B) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor) states,

A. It is unlawful for any person to facilitate, encourage, offer or solicit sexual conduct with a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology,¹⁴ or to engage in any communication for sexual or prurient interest with any minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology

B. A person is guilty of violating the provisions of this section if the person knowingly transmits any prohibited communication by use of any technology defined herein, or knowingly prints, publishes or reproduces by use of any technology described herein any prohibited communication, or knowingly buys, sells, receives, exchanges, or disseminates any prohibited communication or any information, notice, statement, website, or advertisement for communication with a minor or access to any name, telephone number, cell phone number, e-mail address, Internet address, text message address, place of residence, physical characteristics or other descriptive or identifying information of a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor.

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(D).

Several other sexual offenses, while not expressly commercial in nature, may also be applicable in cases involving the commercial sexual exploitation of a child. Some of those statutes are as follows:

1. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A), (B) (Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors) states,

A. Every person who willfully and knowingly either:

1. Lewdly exposes his or her person or genitals in any public place, or in any place where there are present other persons to be offended or annoyed thereby . . . ;

2. Procures, counsels, or assists any person to expose such person, or to make any other exhibition of such person to public view or to the view of any number of persons, for the purpose of sexual stimulation of the viewer;

3. Writes, composes, stereotypes, prints, photographs, designs, copies, draws, engraves, paints, molds, cuts, or otherwise prepares, publishes, sells, distributes, keeps for sale, knowingly downloads on a computer, or exhibits any obscene material or child pornography; or

¹⁴ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(A) states,

For purposes of this subsection, "by use of any technology" means the use of any telephone or cell phone, computer disk (CD), digital video disk (DVD), recording or sound device, CD-ROM, VHS, computer, computer network or system, Internet or World Wide Web address including any blog site or personal web address, e-mail address, Internet Protocol address (IP), text messaging or paging device, any video, audio, photographic or camera device of any computer, computer network or system, cell phone, any other electrical, electronic, computer or mechanical device, or any other device capable of any transmission of any written or text message, audio or sound message, photographic, video, movie, digital or computer-generated image, or any other communication of any kind by use of an electronic device.

4. Makes, prepares, cuts, sells, gives, loans, distributes, keeps for sale, or exhibits any disc record, metal, plastic, or wax, wire or tape recording, or any type of obscene material or child pornography, shall be guilty, upon conviction, of a felony

B. Every person who:

1. Willfully solicits or aids a minor child to perform; or

2. Shows, exhibits, loans, or distributes to a minor child any obscene material or child pornography for the purpose of inducing said minor to participate in, any act specified in paragraphs 1, 2, 3 or 4 of subsection A of this section shall be guilty of a felony

A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 30 days to 10 years, a fine of 500-20,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A)(4). A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(B) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 10–30 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(B)(2), 64(B). If the victim is under the age of 12, however, a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(B) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 25 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(B) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 25 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(B)(2), 64(B). In addition, a person convicted under this statute is not eligible for a deferred sentence. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(C).

 Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A)¹⁵ (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16) (Second version),

It is a felony for any person to knowingly and intentionally:

1. Make any oral, written or electronically or computer-generated lewd or indecent proposal to any child under sixteen (16) years of age, or other individual the person believes to be a child under sixteen (16) years of age, for the child to have unlawful sexual relations or sexual intercourse with any person; or

2. Look upon, touch, maul, or feel the body or private parts of any child under sixteen (16) years of age in any lewd or lascivious manner by any acts against public decency and morality, as defined by law; or

3. Ask, invite, entice, or persuade any child under sixteen (16) years of age, or other individual the person believes to be a child under sixteen (16) years of age, to go alone with any person to a secluded, remote, or secret place, with the unlawful and willful intent and purpose then and there to commit any crime against public decency and morality, as defined by law, with the child; or 4. In any manner lewdly or lasciviously look upon, touch, maul, or feel the body or private parts of any child under sixteen (16) years of age in any indecent manner or in any manner relating to sexual matters or sexual interest; or

5. In a lewd and lascivious manner and for the purpose of sexual gratification:

a. urinate or defecate upon a child under sixteen (16) years of age, or force or require a child to defecate or urinate upon the body or private parts of another, or for the purpose of sexual gratification,

b. ejaculate upon or in the presence of a child,

c. cause, expose, force or require a child to look upon the body or private parts of another person,

d. force or require any child under sixteen (16) years of age or other individual the person believes to be a child under sixteen(16) years of age, to view any obscene materials, child pornography or materials deemed harmful to minors as such terms are defined by Sections 1024.1 and 1040.75 of this title,

e. cause, expose, force or require a child to look upon sexual acts performed in the presence of the child, or

¹⁵ The text of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of Senate Bill 1005 during the 2nd Regular Session of Oklahoma's 56th Legislature (effective November 1, 2018).

f. force or require a child to touch or feel the body or private parts of the child or another person.

A first conviction¹⁶ under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 3–20 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). If the victim is under the age of 12, however, a first conviction is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 25 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). Second convictions are punishable by the same penalties, but the offender "shall not be eligible for probation, suspended or deferred sentence." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A). In addition to not being eligible for probation, suspension or a deferred sentence, third and subsequent convictions are punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § \$1123(A), 64(B). Government for 10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A), 64(B). Additionally, a conviction under this statute by a person who has two prior convictions for any violation or attempted violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(A) (Rape in the first degree—Second degree), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), or § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or proseile is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life or life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A), 64(B). If committed by a "parent or person responsible for the child's health" and the victim is 16–17 years of age, a violation is punishable by up to 10 years imprisonment and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1

3. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1111(A)(1)¹⁷ (Rape defined) states,

Rape is an act of sexual intercourse involving vaginal or anal penetration accomplished with a male or female who is not the spouse of the perpetrator and who may be of the same or the opposite sex as the perpetrator under any of the following circumstances:

1. Where the victim is under sixteen (16) years of age

. . . .

9. Where the victim is nineteen (19) years of age or younger and is in the legal custody of a state agency, federal agency or tribal court and engages in sexual intercourse with a foster parent or foster parent applicant; or

10. Where the victim is at least sixteen (16) years of age but less than eighteen (18) years of age and the perpetrator of the crime is a person responsible for the child's health, safety or welfare \ldots .

A conviction under this statute is rape in the first degree if, among other things, the victim is under the age of 14 and the offender is either over 18 years of age or force or threat of force was used in the commission of the crime. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1111(A)(1), 1114(A)(1), (A)(5). Rape, in the absence of the factors listed in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(A) is rape in the second degree. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(B).

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1115 (Punishment for rape in first degree) (Second version),¹⁸a first conviction for rape in the first degree is punishable as a felony by death or imprisonment for 5 years to life

¹⁶ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A), "The provisions of this subsection shall not apply unless the accused is at least three (3) years older than the victim, except when accomplished by the use of force or fear." ¹⁷ The text of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1111 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by

the enactment of Senate Bill 1005 during the 2nd Regular Session of Oklahoma's 56th Legislature (effective November 1, 2018).

¹⁸ Two different versions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1115 are currently in effect. The first version was amended by 2002 Okla. Sess. Laws 455, § 5, and the second version was amended by 2009 Okla. Sess. Laws 234, § 241. Although the differences between these two current versions are not substantive, the second version does include additional penalties for subsequent convictions, and, therefore, is the only version referenced throughout this report. This report also recommends that the first version (2002 Okla. Sess. Laws 455, § 5) be repealed, and any additional recommendations solely be applied to the second version (2009 Okla. Sess. Laws 234, § 241).

without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1115, 64(B). Second convictions are punishable by the same penalties, but the offender "shall not be eligible for any form of probation." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1115. Additionally, a conviction under this statute by a person who has two prior convictions for any violation or attempted violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(A) (Rape in first degree—Second degree), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), § 1123 (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16), or § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse) is punishable as a felony and "shall be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections for life or life without parole" and face a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1115, 64(B). In contrast, pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1116 (Rape in second degree a felony) rape in the second degree is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 1–15 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1116, 64(B) Rape in the first and second degree are listed as violent crimes for which "community sentences" are not available without consent from the district attorney and for which Electric Monitoring Programs are unavailable. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(aa), (bb); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).¹⁹

4. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1111.1 (Rape by instrumentation) provides,

A. Rape by instrumentation is an act within or without the bonds of matrimony in which any inanimate object or any part of the human body, not amounting to sexual intercourse is used in the carnal knowledge of another person without his or her consent and penetration of the anus or vagina occurs to that person.

B. Provided, further, that at least one of the circumstances specified in Section 1111 [Rape defined] of this title has been met

C. Provided, further, that at least one of the circumstances specified in Section 1111 of this title has been met; further, where the victim is nineteen (19) years of age or younger and in the legal custody of a state agency, federal agency or tribal court and engages in conduct prohibited by this section of law with a foster parent or foster parent applicant.

If the victim is under 14 years of age, a conviction under this statute is rape in the first degree. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, \$ 1114(A)(1). If the victim is 14 years of age or older, however, a conviction is rape in the second degree. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(B). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1115 (Punishment for rape in first degree) (Second version), a first conviction for rape in the first degree is punishable as a felony by death or imprisonment for 5 years to life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1115, 64(B). Second convictions are punishable by the same penalties, but the offender "shall not be eligible for any form of probation." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1115. Rape by instrumentation is listed as violent crime for which "community sentences" are not available without consent from the district attorney and for which Electric Monitoring Programs are unavailable. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57, § 571(2)(cc); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A). Additionally, a conviction under this statute by a person who has two prior convictions for any violation or attempted violation of Okla, Stat. Ann. tit, 21, § 1114(A) (Rape in first degree—Second degree), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), § 1123 (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16), or § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse) is punishable as a felony and "shall be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections for life or life without parole" and face a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1115, 64(B). In contrast, pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1116 (Rape in second degree a felony), rape in the second degree is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 1–15 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1116, 64(B).

5. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5(E)–(G) (Child abuse—Child neglect—Child sexual abuse—Child sexual exploitation—Enabling—Penalties) states,

¹⁹ See supra note 4 for definition of violent crime, in part.

E. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in child sexual abuse shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections not exceeding life imprisonment, or by imprisonment in a county jail not exceeding one (1) year, or by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00), or both such fine and imprisonment, except as provided in Section 51.1a of [Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes] or as otherwise provided in subsection F of this section for a child victim under twelve (12) years of age . . . As used in this section, "child sexual abuse" means the willful or malicious sexual abuse,²⁰ which includes but is not limited to rape, incest, and lewd or indecent acts or proposals, of a child under eighteen (18) years of age by another.

F. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in sexual abuse to a child under twelve (12) years of age shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections for not less than twenty-five (25) years nor more than life imprisonment, and by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00).

G. Any parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in enabling child sexual abuse shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment in the custody of the Department of Corrections not exceeding life imprisonment, or by imprisonment in a county jail not exceeding one (1) year, or by a fine of not less than Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) nor more than Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00), or both such fine and imprisonment²¹

1.3 Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to acknowledge the intersection of prostitution with trafficking victimization.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(C) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.), refers to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking). The statute stipulates "In any prosecution of a person sixteen (16) or seventeen (17) years of age for an offense described in subsection A of this section, there shall be a presumption that the actor was coerced into committing such offense by another person in violation of the human trafficking provisions set forth in Section 748 of this title." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(C).

In the event of prosecution, however, the law does offer all minors an affirmative defense. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(C). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(D) (Human trafficking), "[i]t is an affirmative defense to prosecution for a criminal offense that, during the time of the alleged commission of the offense, the defendant was a victim of human trafficking."

²⁰ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(2)(b) (Definitions),

[&]quot;Sexual abuse" includes but is not limited to rape, incest, and lewd or indecent acts or proposals made to a child, as defined by law, by a person responsible for the health, safety, or welfare of the child.

²¹ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5(G) goes on to state,

As used in this subsection, "enabling child sexual abuse" means the causing, procuring or permitting of a willful or malicious act of child sexual abuse, which includes but is not limited to rape, incest, and lewd or indecent acts or proposals, of a child under the age of eighteen (18) by another. As used in this subsection, "permit" means to authorize or allow for the care of a child by an individual when the person authorizing or allowing such care knows or reasonably should know that the child will be placed at risk of sexual abuse as proscribed by this subsection.

1.4 The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute child sex trafficking crimes.

Oklahoma's laws related to racketeering are codified at Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1403(A)–(D) (Participation in pattern of racketeering activity or collection of unlawful debt prohibited) which states,

A. No person employed by or associated with any enterprise²² shall conduct or participate in, directly or indirectly, the affairs of the enterprise through a pattern of racketeering activity²³ or the collection of an unlawful debt.

B. No person, through a pattern of racketeering activity or through the collection of an unlawful debt, shall acquire or maintain, directly or indirectly, any interest in or control of any enterprise or real property.

C. No person who has received any proceeds derived, directly or indirectly, from a pattern of racketeering activity, or through the collection of any unlawful debt, in which the person participated as a principal, shall use or invest, directly or indirectly, any part of the proceeds or any proceeds derived from the investment or use of any of those proceeds in the acquisition of any right, title, or interest in real property or in the establishment or operation of any enterprise

D. No person shall attempt to violate or conspire with others to violate the provisions of subsection A, B or C of this section.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1402(10) (Definitions) defines "racketeering activity" as "engaging in, attempting to engage in, conspiring to engage in, or soliciting, coercing, or intimidating another person to engage in any conduct which is chargeable or indictable as constituting a felony violation of," among other offenses, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking), § 866 (Elements of offense), § 867 (Trafficking in children a felony), § 1021 (Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors), § 1021.2 (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography), § 1087 (Child under 18 years of age—Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment), § 1088 (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment), § 1123 (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16).

²³ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1402(5),

"Pattern of racketeering activity" means two or more occasions of conduct:

- a. that include each of the following:
 - (1) constitute racketeering activity,
 - (2) are related to the affairs of the enterprise,
 - (3) are not isolated, and
 - (4) are not so closely related to each other and connected in point of time and place that they constitute a single event, and
- b. where each of the following is present:
 - (1) at least one of the occasions of conduct occurred after November 1, 1988,

(2) the last of the occasions of conduct occurred within three (3) years, excluding any period of imprisonment served by any person engaging in the conduct, of a prior occasion of conduct, and(3) for the purposes of Section 1403 of this title each of the occasions of conduct constituted a felony pursuant to the laws of this state.

²² Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1402(2) (Definitions) defines "enterprise" to include,

[[]A]ny individual, sole proprietorship, partnership, corporation, trust, governmental entity, or other legal entity, or any union, association, unincorporated association or group of persons, associated in fact although not a legal entity, involved in any lawful or unlawful project or undertaking or any foreign organization that the United States Secretary of State has designated a foreign terrorist organization pursuant to Title 8 U.S.C.A., Section 1189.

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1404(A), (B) (Penalties for violating § 1403), a conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment for at least 10 years, which "shall not be eligible for a deferred sentence, probation, suspension, work furlough, or release from confinement on any other basis until the person has served one-half (1/2) of the sentence," and, if the offender "derived pecuniary value, or . . . caused personal injury, or property damage or other loss," a possible "fine that does not exceed three times the gross value gained or three times the gross loss caused, whichever is greater, plus court costs and the costs of investigation and prosecution reasonably incurred, less the value of any property ordered forfeited pursuant to the provisions of subsection A of Section 1405 of this title"

Lastly, offenders convicted of violating the racketeering statute are subject to asset forfeiture. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1405(A) (Criminal forfeiture procedures) states that a person convicted of racketeering under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1403 must "forfeit to the state . . . any real or personal property used in the course of, intended for use in the course of, derived from, or realized through" the course of the illegal conduct. Also, traffickers who violate Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 1409(A), (B).

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 2: CRIMINAL PROVISIONS FOR DEMAND

Legal Components:

- 2.1 The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.
- 2.2 Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.
- 2.3 Solicitation laws differentiate between soliciting sex acts with an adult and soliciting sex acts with a minor under 18.
- 2.4 Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.
- 2.5 Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.
- 2.6 No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.
- 2.7 Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.
- 2.8 Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.
- 2.9 Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.
- 2.10 Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.

Legal Analysis:

2.1 The state sex trafficking law can be applied to buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) may be applied to buyers of commercial sex with minors. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) states, "It shall be unlawful to knowingly engage in human trafficking." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b) defines "human trafficking for commercial sex," in part, as "purchasing . . . by any means, a minor for purposes of engaging the minor in a commercial sex act." This language could extend to a buyer who purchases a victim of domestic minor sex trafficking in order to engage in commercial sex with the victim. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(2) defines "commercial sex" as "any form of commercial sexual activity such as sexually explicit performances, prostitution, participation in the production of pornography, performance in a strip club, or exotic dancing or display."

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8) (Definitions), a person convicted of a violent offense, which includes the offense "human trafficking as provided in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748]" is not eligible for Electric Monitoring Programs or "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571(2)(xx); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).

2.2 Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.

Oklahoma's CSEC law expressly prohibits buying sex with minors under the age of 18. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) makes it illegal for a person "[t]o solicit, induce, entice, or procure another to commit an act of . . . prostitution" If the victim is under 18 years of age, a violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) is deemed "child prostitution"²⁴ and punishable in accordance with Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031 (Punishment for violations). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) is punishable as a felony by

²⁴ See supra note 7.

imprisonment up to 10 years and a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions

Several sexual offenses could be used to prosecute certain buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor but do not specifically criminalize the commercial sexual exploitation of a child and do not refer to the human trafficking statute.²⁵

2.3 Solicitation laws differentiate between soliciting sex acts with an adult and soliciting sex acts with a minor under 18.

Oklahoma's solicitation law differentiates between soliciting sex with an adult and soliciting sex with a minor under the age of 18. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) makes it illegal for a person to "solicit... another to commit an act of ... prostitution" If the victim is a minor under 18 years of age, a violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) is deemed "child prostitution"²⁶ and is punishable in accordance with Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031 (Punishment for violations). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B).

2.4 Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.

If the victim is under the age of 18, a buyer convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) is guilty of a felony punishable by imprisonment for at least 15 years or for life, a fine not to exceed \$250,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). A buyer convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) for purchasing sex with a minor under 18 years of age is guilty of a felony punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years and a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C).

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the buyer has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²⁷ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). To the extent buyers can be prosecuted under other federal CSEC laws,²⁸ a conviction is punishable by penalties ranging from a fine not to exceed \$250,000 to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²⁹

an offense under section 1591 [18 USCS § 1591] (relating to sex trafficking of children), 2241 [18 USCS § 2241] (relating to aggravated sexual abuse), 2242 [18 USCS § 2242] (relating to sexual abuse), 2244(a)(1) [18 USCS § 2244(a)(1)] (relating to abusive sexual contact), 2245 [18 USCS § 2245] (relating to sexual abuse resulting in death), 2251 [18 USCS § 2251] (relating to sexual exploitation of children), 2251A [18 USCS § 2251] (relating to sexual exploitation of children), 2251A [18 USCS § 2251A] (relating to selling or buying of children), 2422(b) [18 USCS § 2422(b)] (relating to coercion and enticement of a minor into prostitution), or 2423(a) [18 USCS § 2423(a)] (relating to transportation of minors).

²⁸ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (Selling or buying of children), 2251(a) (Sexual exploitation of children), 2423(a) (Transportation of a minor with intent for minor to engage in criminal sexual activity), 2422(a) (Coercion and enticement), 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors).
²⁹ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 30 years to life and a fine), 2251(e) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 15–30 years and a fine), 2423(a) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 10 years to life and a fine), 2422(a) (conviction punishable by a fine, imprisonment up to 20 years,

²⁵ See supra Component 1.2.

²⁶ See supra note 7.

²⁷ Pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(2), "federal sex offense" is defined as

2.5 Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.

While not expressly commercial, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(A), (B) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor) makes it illegal for a person to use the Internet or electronic communications to "facilitate, encourage, offer or solicit sexual conduct with a minor." Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a states,

A. It is unlawful for any person to facilitate, encourage, offer or solicit sexual conduct with a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology,³⁰ or to engage in any communication for sexual or prurient interest with any minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology

B. A person is guilty of violating the provisions of this section if the person knowingly transmits any prohibited communication by use of any technology defined herein, or knowingly prints, publishes or reproduces by use of any technology described herein any prohibited communication, or knowingly buys, sells, receives, exchanges, or disseminates any prohibited communication or any information, notice, statement, website, or advertisement for communication with a minor or access to any name, telephone number, cell phone number, e-mail address, Internet address, text message address, place of residence, physical characteristics or other descriptive or identifying information of a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor.

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(D).

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A)(1) (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16) prohibits a person from making "any oral, written or electronically or computer-generated lewd or indecent proposal to any child under sixteen (16) years of age ... for the child to have unlawful sexual relations or sexual intercourse with any person." A first conviction³¹ under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 3–20 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla, Stat. Ann. tit, 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). If the victim is under the age of 12, however, a first conviction is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 25 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). Second convictions are punishable by the same penalties, but the offender "shall not be eligible for probation, suspended or deferred sentence." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A). In addition to not being eligible for probation, suspension or a deferred sentence, third and subsequent convictions are punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). Additionally, a conviction under this statute by a person who has two prior convictions for any violation or attempted violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(A) (Rape in the first degree—Second degree), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), or § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). If committed by a "parent or person responsible for the child's health" and the victim is 16–17 years of age, a violation is punishable by up to 10 years imprisonment and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(G), ³² 64(B).

³¹ See supra note 16.

³² See supra note 15.

or both), 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

³⁰ See supra note 14 for the definition of "by any use of any technology."

2.6 No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(F) (Human trafficking) expressly prohibits an offender from asserting a mistake of age defense. It states, "[l]ack of knowledge of the age of the victim shall not constitute a defense to the activity prohibited by this section with respect to human trafficking of a minor." However, none of Oklahoma's buyer-applicable CSEC offenses contain a similar prohibition.

2.6.1 Recommendation: Amend Oklahoma's CSEC laws to prohibit a defendant from asserting a defense based on age mistake.

2.7 Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.

Oklahoma's buyer-applicable trafficking and CSEC laws do not stagger penalties based on a minor's age; both provide sufficiently high penalties. A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) is punishable by imprisonment for a minimum of 15 years or for life. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.—soliciting or procuring—residing or being in place for prohibited purpose—aiding, abetting or participating—child prostitution) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for up to 10 years. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations).

2.8 Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.

Buyers convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) or Oklahoma's CSEC laws are subject to fines ranging from \$2,500–\$250,000. Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C), if the victim is a minor under the age of 18, a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) is punishable by a possible fine not to exceed \$250,000. Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) is punishable by a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions.

Additionally, buyers are subject to mandatory restitution orders. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C) (Human trafficking) provides, "The court shall also order the defendant to pay restitution³³ to the victim³⁴ as provided in Section 991f [Restitution] of Title 22 [Criminal procedure] of the Oklahoma Statutes." Buyers convicted of other crimes that cause injury to the victim are also required to make restitution under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1) (Restitution), which provides,

³³ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(A)(1) (Restitution) defines "restitution" as "the sum to be paid by the defendant to the victim of the criminal act to compensate that victim for up to three times the amount of the economic loss suffered as a direct result of the criminal act of the defendant." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(A)(3) defines "economic loss" as,

[[]A]ctual financial detriment suffered by the victim consisting of medical expenses actually incurred, damage to or loss of real and personal property and any other out-of-pocket expenses, including loss of earnings, reasonably incurred as the direct result of the criminal act of the defendant. No other elements of damage shall be included as an economic loss for purposes of this section.

 $^{^{34}}$ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(A)(2) defines a "victim" as "any person, partnership, corporation or legal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of another person."

Upon conviction for any crime wherein property has been stolen, converted or otherwise unlawfully obtained, or its value substantially decreased as a direct result of the crime, or wherein the crime victim suffered injury, loss of income, or out-of-pocket loss, the individuals criminally responsible shall be sentenced to make restitution. Restitution may be ordered in addition to the punishments prescribed by law.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 68 (Conviction does not work forfeiture) prohibits asset forfeiture unless it "is expressly imposed by law." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(A)(1) (Seizure and forfeiture proceedings— Vehicles, airplanes, vessels, etc. used in attempt or commission of certain crimes) expressly authorizes equipment and vehicle forfeiture for violations of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking), tit. 21, § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.), or tit. 21, § 1030 (Definitions), but limiting language in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(A)(1) makes the forfeiture provisions for the CSEC offenses inapplicable to buyers. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(A)(1) specifically provides,

Any commissioned peace officer of this state is authorized to seize any equipment, vehicle, airplane, vessel or any other conveyance that is used in the commission of . . . any human trafficking offense in violation of Section 748 [Human trafficking] of this title, or used by any defendant when such vehicle or other conveyance is used in any manner by a prostitute, pimp or panderer to facilitate or participate in the commission of any prostitution offense in violation of Sections . . . 1029 [Engaging in prostitution, etc.] or 1030 [Definitions] of this title; provided, however, that the vehicle or conveyance of a customer or anyone merely procuring the services of a prostitute shall not be included.

Buyers may, however, face asset forfeiture under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(B), (9)–(12) which states,

In addition to the property described in subsection A of this section, the following property is also subject to forfeiture pursuant to this section:

9. All property used in the commission of, or in any manner to facilitate, a violation of Section 1040.12a [Aggravated possession of child pornography] of this title;

10. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used or intended to be used, in any manner or part, to commit a violation of paragraph 1 of subsection A of Section 1021 [Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors] of this title, where the victim of the crime is a minor child, subsection B of Section 1021 of this title, Section 1021.2 [Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography] of this title, paragraph 1 of subsection A of Section 1111 [Rape defined] of this title, or paragraphs 2 and 3 of subsection A of Section 1123 [Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16] of this title;

11. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used in any manner or part, to commit any violation of the provisions set forth in Section 748 [Human trafficking] of this title;

12. Any and all property used in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of a human trafficking offense in violation of Section 748 of this title, and all property, including monies, real estate, or any other tangible assets or property of or derived from or used by a prostitute, pimp or panderer in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of any prostitution offense in violation of Sections 1028 [Setting up or operating place of prostitution], 1029 [Engaging in prostitution, etc.] or 1030 [Definitions] of this title; provided, however, any monies, real estate or any other tangible asset or property of a customer or anyone merely procuring the services of a prostitute shall not be included.

Forfeiture actions under this section are discretionary and civil in nature. "Forfeiture actions under this section may be brought by the district attorney in the proper county of venue as petitioner." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §

1738(C). Procedure governing forfeiture proceedings and the disposition of property forfeited are detailed in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738.

Additional contraband may be seized, incident to a criminal arrest, pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.3 (Seizure of evidentiary copy of obscene material or all copies of explicit child pornography), which authorizes the seizure of "all copies of explicit child pornography found in the possession or under the control of" a person arrested for a violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.2 (Purchase, procurement or possession of child pornography).

2.9 Buying and possessing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.2 (Purchase, procurement or possession of child pornography) makes it illegal for a person to buy or possess images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.2 states, "It shall be unlawful for any person to buy, procure, or possess child pornography³⁵ in violation of Sections 1024.1 [Definitions] through 1024.4 [Destruction of obscene material or child pornography upon conviction]" A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.2. Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2 (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography) makes it a crime if a person "knowingly" possesses ICSE. A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years without the possibility of a deferred sentence, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A). Lastly, "[a]ny person who, with knowledge of its contents, possesses one hundred (100) or more separate materials depicting child pornography shall be, upon conviction, guilty of aggravated possession of child pornography." A conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment up to 1ife and a fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.12a(A).

In comparison, a federal conviction for possession of ICSE³⁶ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³⁷ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³⁸

2.10 Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are required to register as sex offenders.

Pursuant to Oklahoma's Sex Offenders Registration Act,³⁹ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 582(A) (Persons and crimes to which act applies) states that a person "residing, working or attending school within the State of Oklahoma" with any of the following convictions after November 1, 1989 must register as a sex offender:

³⁵ See supra note 11 for the definition of "child pornography."

 $^{^{36}}$ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2)–(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a), (b) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

³⁷ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is "subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1)," imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is "subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2)," imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).
³⁸ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years, but if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the setures, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years, but if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).
³⁹ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, §§ 581–590.2.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) "if the offense involved human trafficking for commercial sex," § 1021.2 (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography), § 1024.2 (Purchase, procurement or possession of child pornography), § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) "if the offense involved child prostitution," § 1040.8 (Publication, distribution or participation in preparation of obscene material or child pornography—Unsolicited mailings) "if the offense involved child pornography," § 1040.12a (Aggravated possession of child pornography—Penalties—Definitions), § 1040.13a (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor), § 1111.1 (Rape by instrumentation), § 1114 (Rape in the first degree—Second degree), or § 1123 (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16).

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 3: CRIMINAL PROVISIONS FOR TRAFFICKERS

Legal Components:

- 3.1 Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.
- 3.2 Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.
- 3.3 Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.
- *3.4 Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*
- 3.5 Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.
- 3.6 Laws relating to parental custody and termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for sole custody or termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.

Legal Analysis:

3.1 Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.

If the victim is under the age of 18, a trafficker's conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking)⁴⁰ is punishable by imprisonment for at least 15 years or for life, a fine not to exceed \$250,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). Traffickers may be convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.)⁴¹ for aiding or abetting a person to "solicit, induce, entice, or procure" a minor under the age of 18 to commit an act of prostitution. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2), (4), (B). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years and a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions.

A trafficker convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(A)(1), (A)(2) (Child under 18 years of age— Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment),⁴² a felony, may be punished by imprisonment for 1–10 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1087(B)(1), 64(B). While a trafficker convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(A)(2), (A)(3) (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment), also a felony,⁴³ may be punished by imprisonment for 1–25 years and a fine of \$5,000–\$25,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(B)(1). Additionally, a trafficker may be convicted of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(B) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor), which is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(D).

Although not specifically oriented towards sexual exploitation, a trafficker may be prosecuted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 866(A)(1)(a) (Elements of offense) for the "acceptance, solicitation, offer, payment or transfer of any compensation, in money, property or other thing of value, at any time, by any person in connection with the acquisition or transfer of the legal or physical custody or adoption of a minor child⁴⁴ A first conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 1–3 years and a possible fine not to exceed

⁴⁰ See supra Component 1.1 for the specific provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B).

⁴¹ See supra Component 1.2 for the specific provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029.

⁴⁶ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087.

⁴³ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088.

⁴⁴ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 865(2), "Child' means an unmarried or unemancipated person under the age of eighteen (18) years."

10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 867(A), 64(B). A subsequent conviction, however, is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 3 years, with no suspension of judgment or sentence permitted, and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 867(B), 64(B).

Additionally, "[a]ny parent or other person who shall willfully or maliciously engage in sexual exploitation of a child under twelve (12) years of age shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment" for at least 25 years and by a fine of \$500–\$5,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5(I) (Child sexual abuse). Furthermore, "[a]ny parent or other person who shall willfully of maliciously engage in enabling child sexual exploitation shall, upon conviction, be punished by imprisonment . . ." for life in the Department of corrections or up to one year in a county jail, a possible fine of \$500–\$5,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5(J).⁴⁵

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8) (Definitions), a person convicted of a violent crime, which includes the offenses of "child prostitution as defined in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1030] and "human trafficking as provided in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748]" is not eligible for Electric Monitoring Programs or "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571(2)(tt), (xx); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).⁴⁶

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act $(TVPA)^{47}$ for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense⁴⁸ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1).

3.2 Creating and distributing images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.

Oklahoma prohibits the creation and distribution of images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A)(4) (Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors) makes it a crime if a person "[m]akes, prepares, [or] . . . distributes . . . child pornography."⁴⁹ A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 30 days to 10 years, a fine of \$500–\$20,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021(A). Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A) (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography)⁵⁰makes it a crime if a person "procure[s] or cause[s] the participation of any minor under the age of eighteen (18) years in any child pornography or . . . knowingly . . . manufactures, or causes to be sold or distributed any child pornography" A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years without the possibility of a deferred sentence, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A).

Similarly, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.8(A) (Publication, distribution or participation in preparation of obscene material or child pornography—Unsolicited mailings) provides,

No person shall knowingly photograph, act in, pose for, model for, print, sell, offer for sale, give away, exhibit, publish, offer to publish, or otherwise distribute, display, or exhibit any book, magazine, story,

⁴⁵ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provision of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.5.

⁴⁶ See supra note 4.

⁴⁷ Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Pub. L. No. 106-386, 114 Stat. 1464, 1466 (codified in scattered sections of 18 and 22 U.S.C.).

⁴⁸ See supra note 27.

⁴⁹ See supra note 11.

⁵⁰ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A).

pamphlet, paper, writing, card, advertisement, circular, print, picture, photograph, motion picture film, electronic video game or recording, image, cast, slide, figure, instrument, statue, drawing, presentation, or other article which is obscene material or child pornography, as defined in Section 1024.1 of this title

A conviction under this offense for distributing $ICSE^{51}$ is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine of not less than \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.8(C).

A person who is a parent, guardian, or has custody of a child under the age of 18, may also be prosecuted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A) (Guardians—Parents—Custodians—Consent to participation of minors in child pornography) if the person "knowingly permits or consents to the participation of a minor in any child pornography" A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both, and is not eligible for a deferred sentence. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.3(A).

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8) (Definitions), a person convicted of a violent crime, which includes the offenses of "child pornography or aggravated child pornography as defined in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1021.2, 1021.3, 1024.1 or 1040.12a]" is not eligible for Electric Monitoring Programs or "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571(2)(ss); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).⁵²

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense⁵³ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). Additionally, a federal conviction for distribution of ICSE⁵⁴ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.⁵⁵ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.⁵⁶

⁵¹ See supra note 11.

⁵² See supra note 4.

⁵³ See supra note 27.

 $^{^{54}}$ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

⁵⁵ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is "subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1)," imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is "subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2)," imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

⁵⁶ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

3.3 Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.

Although not expressly commercial, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(A), (B) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor) makes it illegal for a person to use the Internet or electronic communications to "facilitate, encourage, offer or solicit sexual conduct with a minor." Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(A), (B) states,

A. It is unlawful for any person to facilitate, encourage, offer or solicit sexual conduct with a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology, or to engage in any communication for sexual or prurient interest with any minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor, by use of any technology⁵⁷....

B. A person is guilty of violating the provisions of this section if the person knowingly transmits any prohibited communication by use of any technology defined herein, or knowingly prints, publishes or reproduces by use of any technology described herein any prohibited communication, or knowingly buys, sells, receives, exchanges, or disseminates any prohibited communication or any information, notice, statement, website, or advertisement for communication with a minor or access to any name, telephone number, cell phone number, e-mail address, Internet address, text message address, place of residence, physical characteristics or other descriptive or identifying information of a minor, or other individual the person believes to be a minor.

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(D).

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A)(1) (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16) prohibits a person from making "any oral, written or electronically or computer-generated lewd or indecent proposal to any child under sixteen (16) years of age." A first conviction⁵⁸ under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for 3–20 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). If the victim is under the age of 12, however, a first conviction is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 25 years and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). Second convictions are punishable by the same penalties, but the offender "shall not be eligible for probation, suspended or deferred sentence." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(A). In addition to not being eligible for probation, suspension or a deferred sentence, third and subsequent convictions are punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). Additionally, a conviction under this statute by a person who has two prior convictions for any violation or attempted violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1114(A) (Rape in the first degree—Second degree), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), or § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for life or life without the possibility of parole and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1123(A), 64(B). If committed by a "parent or person responsible for the child's health" and the victim is 16–17 years of age, a violation is punishable by up to 10 years imprisonment and a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1123(G),⁵⁹ 64(B).

3.4 Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.

Traffickers convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking) or Oklahoma's CSEC laws are subject to fines ranging from \$2,500–\$250,000. A trafficker convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking), if the victim is under the age of 18, is subject to a possible fine not to exceed \$250,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) is punishable

⁵⁷ See supra note 14.

⁵⁸ See supra note 16.

⁵⁹ See supra note 15.

by a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions.

Although traffickers convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(A) (Child under 18 years of age— Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment) are not expressly required to pay a fine, they are subject to a possible fine not to exceed \$10,000 pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 64(B). Additionally, traffickers convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(A) (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment) are subject to a fine of \$5,000–\$25,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1088(B)(1).

Additionally, the court shall require a convicted trafficker to make restitution. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C) (Human trafficking) provides, "The court shall also order the defendant to pay restitution⁶⁰ to the victim⁶¹ as provided in Section 991f [Restitution] of Title 22 [Criminal procedure] of the Oklahoma Statutes." Additionally, traffickers who are convicted of other crimes that cause injury to the victim are also required to make restitution under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1) (Restitution).

Although Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 68 (Conviction does not work forfeiture) prohibits asset forfeiture unless it "is expressly imposed by law," Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(A)(1) (Seizure and forfeiture proceedings— Vehicles, airplanes, vessels, etc. used in attempt or commission of certain crimes) authorizes equipment and vehicle forfeiture for violations of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) or § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.). Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(B)(10)–(12) states,

In addition to the property described in subsection A of this section, the following property is also subject to forfeiture pursuant to this section:

10. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used or intended to be used, in any manner or part, to commit a violation of paragraph 1 of subsection A of Section 1021 [Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors] of this title, where the victim of the crime is a minor child, . . . Section 1021.2 [Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography] of this title . . . ;

11. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used in any manner or part, to commit any violation of the provisions set forth in Section 748 [Human trafficking] of this title; and

12. Any and all property used in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of a human trafficking offense in violation of Section 748 of this title, and all property, including monies, real estate, or any other tangible assets or property of or derived from or used by a prostitute, pimp or panderer in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of any prostitution offense in violation of Sections 1028 [Setting up or operating place of prostitution], 1029 [Engaging in prostitution, etc.] or 1030 [Definitions] of this title; provided, however, any monies, real estate or any other tangible asset or property of a customer or anyone merely procuring the services of a prostitute shall not be included.

Forfeiture actions under this section are discretionary and civil in nature. "Forfeiture actions under this section may be brought by the district attorney in the proper county of venue as petitioner." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(C). Procedure governing forfeiture proceedings and the disposition of property forfeited are detailed in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738.

Lastly, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.54(A) (Seizure and forfeiture of equipment used in certain offenses relating to obscene material or child pornography) authorizes asset forfeiture for "any equipment which is used,

⁶⁰ See supra note 33.

⁶¹ See supra note 34.

or intended for use in the preparing, photographing, printing, selling, exhibiting, publishing, distributing, displaying, advertising, filming, copying, recording, or mailing of . . . child pornography, as defined in subsection A of Section 1024.1 [Definitions] of this title."

3.5 Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.

Pursuant to Oklahoma's Sex Offenders Registration Act,⁶² Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 582(A) (Persons and crimes to which act applies) states that a person "residing, working or attending school within the State of Oklahoma" with any of the following convictions or a conviction of an attempt to commit the following crimes must register as a sex offender: Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) "if the offense involved human trafficking for commercial sex," § 1021.2(A) (Minors-Procuring for participation in pornography), § 1021.3(A) (Guardians—Parents—Custodians—Consent to participation of minors in child pornography), § 1024.2 (Purchase, procurement or possession of child pornography), § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) "if the offense involved child prostitution," § 1040.8 (Publication, distribution or participation in preparation of obscene material or child pornography—Unsolicited mailings) "if the offense involved child pornography," § 1040.12a(A) (Aggravated possession of child pornography—Penalties—Definitions), § 1040.13a (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor), § 1087 (Child under 18 years of age—Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment), or § 1088 (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment). Additionally, traffickers "currently serving a sentence or any form of probation or parole for a crime or an attempt to commit a crime provided for in Section 843.5 [Child sexual abuse] of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes if the offense involved sexual abuse or sexual exploitation as those terms are defined in Section 1-1-105 of Title 10A of the Oklahoma Statutes" are required to register as sex offenders. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 582(A).

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 582(A) does not require traffickers convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1028 (Setting up or operating place of prostitution) to register as sex offenders.

3.6 Laws relating to parental custody and termination of parental rights include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as grounds for sole custody or termination in order to prevent traffickers from exploiting their parental rights as a form of control.

A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) is not included as a ground for terminating parental rights under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-4-904(B)(8) (Termination of parental rights in certain situations). Instead, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-4-904(B) provides,

The court may terminate the rights of a parent to a child based upon the following legal grounds:

8. A finding that the parent has been convicted in a court of competent jurisdiction in any state of any of the following acts:

- a. permitting a child to participate in pornography,
- b. rape, or rape by instrumentation,
- c. lewd molestation of a child under sixteen (16) years of age,
- d. child abuse⁶³ or neglect,
- e. enabling child abuse or neglect,

9. A finding that the parent has abused or neglected the child or a sibling of the child or failed to protect the child or a sibling of the child from abuse or neglect that is heinous or shocking;10. A finding that the parent has previously abused or neglected the child or a sibling of the child or

⁶² Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, §§ 581–590.2.

⁶³ See infra Component 5.5 for the definition of "abuse."

failed to protect the child or a sibling of the child from abuse or neglect and the child or a sibling of the child has been subjected to subsequent abuse;

11. A finding that the child was conceived as a result of rape perpetrated by the parent whose rights are sought to be terminated;

12. A finding that the parent whose rights are sought to be terminated is incarcerated, and the continuation of parental rights would result in harm to the child based on consideration of . . . [several listed] factors

. . . .

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 4: CRIMINAL PROVISIONS FOR FACILITATORS

Legal Components:

- 4.1 The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.
- 4.2 Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.
- 4.3 Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.
- 4.4 Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.

Legal Analysis:

4.1 The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.

Oklahoma's state human trafficking law applies to facilitators who benefit financially from sex trafficking, as well as to facilitators who assist or enable trafficking by harboring or transporting a victim of human trafficking. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(c) (Human trafficking)⁶⁴ states that "human trafficking for commercial sex" means "benefiting, financially or by receiving anything of value, from participating in a venture that has engaged in an act of trafficking for commercial sex." Additionally, "human trafficking for commercial sex" applies to a facilitator who harbors or transports "by any means, a minor for purposes of engaging the minor in a commercial sex act." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b). If the victim is a minor under the age of 18, a conviction for "human trafficking for commercial sex" is punishable as a felony by imprisonment for at least 15 years or for life, a fine not to exceed \$250,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C).

Several of Oklahoma's CSEC laws may also be used to prosecute facilitators. Facilitators may be convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(4) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.)⁶⁵ for aiding or abetting the acts set out in tit. 21, § 1029(A)(1)–(3). If the victim is under the age of 18, a conviction is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years and a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(B), 1031(C).

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8) (Definitions), a person convicted of a violent crime, which includes the offenses of "child prostitution as defined in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1030] and "human trafficking as provided in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748]" is not eligible for Electric Monitoring Programs or "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571(2)(tt), (xx); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).⁶⁶

Facilitators may also be prosecuted under either Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(B)(2) (Child under 18 years of age—Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment) or tit. 21, § 1088(B)(2) (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment).⁶⁷ An offender's first conviction under either of these statutes is punishable as a misdemeanor by 6 months to 1 year imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$5,000,⁶⁸ while subsequent convictions are punishable

⁶⁴ See supra Component 1.1 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(c).

⁶⁵ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029.

⁶⁶ See supra note 4.

⁶⁷ See supra Component 1.2 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1087(B)(2), 1088(B)(2).

⁶⁸ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(B)(2) also has a mandatory minimum fine of \$500.

as felonies by imprisonment for 1–10 years, a fine of \$5,000–\$25,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1087(B)(2), 1088(B)(2).

4.2 Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.

Facilitators convicted under Oklahoma's laws relating to human trafficking and the commercial sexual exploitation of children are subject to fines ranging from \$500–\$25,000. A facilitator convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(B) (Human trafficking), if the victim is under the age of 18, is subject to a possible fine not to exceed \$250,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1031(C) (Punishment for violations), a conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(4), (B) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) is punishable by a fine not to exceed \$5,000 for a first conviction, \$10,000 for a second conviction, or \$15,000 for third and subsequent convictions.

Facilitators convicted under either Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1087(B)(2) or § 1088(B)(2) are subject to a possible fine of \$500-\$5,000 for a first conviction, and a possible fine of \$5,000-\$25,000 for a subsequent conviction.

Additionally, facilitators are subject to mandatory orders of restitution for human trafficking offenses. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C) (Human trafficking) states, "The court shall also order the defendant to pay restitution⁶⁹ to the victim⁷⁰ as provided in Section 991f [Restitution] of Title 22 [Criminal procedure] of the Oklahoma Statutes." Facilitators convicted of other crimes that caused injury to the victim, shall be subject to make restitution under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1) (Restitution).⁷¹

Although Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 68 (Conviction does not work forfeiture) prohibits asset forfeiture unless it "is expressly imposed by law," Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(A)(1) (Seizure and forfeiture proceedings— Vehicles, airplanes, vessels, etc. used in attempt or commission of certain crimes) authorizes the forfeiture of assets "used in any manner to facilitate or participate in the commission of any human trafficking offense in violation of" Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) or tit. 21, § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.). Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(B)(10)–(12) states,

In addition to the property described in subsection A of this section, the following property is also subject to forfeiture pursuant to this section:

10. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used or intended to be used, in any manner or part, to commit a violation of paragraph 1 of subsection A of Section 1021 [Indecent exposure—Indecent exhibitions—Obscene material or child pornography—Solicitation of minors] of this title, where the victim of the crime is a minor child, ... Section 1021.2 [Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography] of this title

11. All conveyances, including aircraft, vehicles or vessels, monies, coins and currency, or other instrumentality used in any manner or part, to commit any violation of the provisions set forth in Section 748 [Human trafficking] of this title; and

12. Any and all property used in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of a human trafficking offense in violation of Section 748 of this title, and all property, including monies, real estate, or any other tangible assets or property of or derived from or used by a prostitute, pimp or panderer in any manner or part to facilitate, participate or further the commission of any prostitution offense in violation of Sections 1028 [Setting up or operating place of prostitution], 1029 [Engaging in prostitution, etc.] or 1030 [Definitions] of this title; provided,

⁶⁹ See supra note 33.

⁷⁰ See supra note 34.

⁷¹ See supra Component 2.8 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1).

however, any monies, real estate or any other tangible asset or property of a customer or anyone merely procuring the services of a prostitute shall not be included.

Forfeiture actions under this section are discretionary and civil in nature. "Forfeiture actions under this section may be brought by the district attorney in the proper county of venue as petitioner." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738(C). Procedure governing forfeiture proceedings and the disposition of property forfeited are detailed in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1738.

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.54(A) (Seizure and forfeiture of equipment used in certain offenses relating to obscene material or child pornography) authorizes asset forfeiture for "any equipment which is used, or intended for use in the preparing, photographing, printing, selling, exhibiting, publishing, distributing, displaying, advertising, filming, copying, recording, or mailing of . . . child pornography, as defined in subsection A of Section 1024.1 [Definitions] of this title."

4.3 Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.

Oklahoma has no law specifically addressing sex tourism.

- 4.3.1 Recommendation: Enact a law that prohibits selling or offering to sell travel services that include or facilitate travel for the purpose of engaging in commercial sexual exploitation of a minor or prostitution of a minor, if sale or travel occurs in Oklahoma.
- 4.4 Promoting and selling images of child sexual exploitation carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A) (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography) prohibits a person from knowingly selling or distributing images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE).⁷² A conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not to exceed \$25,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A). Additionally, "Persons convicted under this section shall not be eligible for a deferred sentence." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A).

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8) (Definitions), a person convicted of a violent crime, which includes the offenses of "child pornography or aggravated child pornography as defined in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, §§ 1021.2, 1021.3, 1024.1 or 1040.12a]" is not eligible for Electric Monitoring Programs or "for a community sentence or community punishment unless the district attorney or an assistant district attorney for the district in which the offender's conviction was obtained consents thereto." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 988.2(A)(8); Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571(2)(ss); Okla. Stat. Ann. Tit. 57 § 510.9(A).⁷³

Additionally, a facilitator who advertises ICSE may be convicted under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.8(A) (Publication, distribution or participation in preparation of obscene material or child pornography—Unsolicited mailings), which states in part,

No person shall knowingly photograph, act in, pose for, model for, print, sell, offer for sale, give away, exhibit, publish, offer to publish, or otherwise distribute, display, or exhibit any book, magazine, story, pamphlet, paper, writing, card, advertisement, circular, print, picture, photograph, motion picture film, electronic video game or recording, image, cast, slide, figure, instrument, statue, drawing, presentation, or other article which is obscene material or child pornography

A conviction under this statute for advertising or promoting ICSE is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 20 years, a fine not less than \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.8(C). In addition, a person that

⁷² See supra note 11.

⁷³ See supra note 4

"possesses one hundred (100) or more separate materials depicting child pornography shall be, upon conviction, guilty of aggravated possession of child pornography," in violation of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.12a(A) (Aggravated possession of child pornography—Penalties—Definitions). A conviction under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.12a(A) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to life and a fine not to exceed \$10,000. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.12a(A).

Lastly, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13 (Acts prohibited—Felony) specifically prohibits the commercial distribution of ICSE. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13 states,

Every person who, with knowledge of its contents, sends, brings, or causes to be sent or brought into this state for sale or commercial distribution, or in this state prepares, sells, exhibits, commercially distributes, gives away, offers to give away, or has in his possession with intent to sell, to commercially distribute, to exhibit, to give away, or to offer to give away any obscene material or child pornography or gives information stating when, where, how, or from whom, or by what means obscene material or child pornography can be purchased or obtained, upon conviction, is guilty of a felony

A conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13.

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 5: PROTECTIVE PROVISIONS FOR THE CHILD VICTIMS

Legal Components:

- 5.1 Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.
- 5.2 The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based on the willingness of a minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.
- 5.3 State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.
- 5.4 State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.
- 5.5 Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.
- 5.6 The definition of "caregiver" or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.
- 5.7 Crime victims' compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).
- 5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*
- 5.9 Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.
- 5.10 Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.
- 5.11 Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.

Legal Analysis:

5.1 Victims under the core child sex trafficking offense include all commercially sexually exploited children.⁷⁴

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) includes all commercial sexual exploitation of minors. Under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b), when the victim is a minor, means of force, fraud, or coercion are not required.⁷⁵ In addition, the human trafficking law applies to buyers; thus, buying commercial sex with a person who is under the age of eighteen constitutes human trafficking.⁷⁶ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b), (B). Finally, the offense of human trafficking under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b), (B) does not require that a trafficker or controlling third party be identified. Consequently, Oklahoma's human trafficking offense includes any child who is bought for sex, regardless of whether force, fraud, or coercion is used, regardless of whether a buyer exploited the youth without a trafficker's involvement, and regardless of whether the victim identifies a trafficker. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(A)(6)(b), (B).

5.2 The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based on the willingness of a minor under 18 to engage in the commercial sex act.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) prohibits a defendant from asserting a defense based on the willingness of the minor to engage in the commercial sex act. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(E) states, "The consent of the victim to the activity prohibited by this section [human trafficking] shall not constitute a defense."

⁷⁴ See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, "Eliminating the Third Party Control Barrier to Identifying Juvenile Sex Trafficking Victims," JuST Response Policy Paper (2015), <u>http://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Policy-Paper_Eliminating-Third-Party-Control_Final1.pdf</u> (discussing need to include all commercially sexually exploited children within sex trafficking definitions and corresponding need to include buyer conduct in core sex trafficking offenses regardless of whether victim is under control of a third party).

⁷⁵ See supra discussion in Component 1.1.

⁷⁶ See supra discussion of buyer applicability in Component 2.1.

5.3 State law prohibits the criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.⁷⁷

Oklahoma law prohibits the criminalization of juvenile sex trafficking victims for prostitution and nonviolent misdemeanors. Although Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(1) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) is age-neutral, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § $748.2(E)^{78}$ (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action) states that a "minor shall not be subject to delinquency proceedings for prostitution or other nonviolent misdemeanor offenses committed as a direct result of being a victim of human trafficking" Further, "[i]t shall be an affirmative defense to delinquency or criminal prosecution for any misdemeanor or felony offense that the offense was committed during the time of and as the direct result of the minor being the victim of human trafficking." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E).

- 5.3.1 Recommendation: Clarify Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E) (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action) to specify that all minors shall be protected from criminal or delinquency charges for prostitution-related offenses.⁷⁹
- 5.4 State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.

System response to child engaged in commercial sex act

Oklahoma law provides a juvenile sex trafficking victim with a non-punitive avenue to services. Upon identifying a minor as a juvenile sex trafficking victim who is in need of immediate protection, a law enforcement officer must assume protective custody of the child, immediately notify the Department of Human Services (DHS),⁸⁰ and transfer the child to DHS's emergency custody. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E)⁸¹ (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E) provides,

Any peace officer or employee of a district court, juvenile bureau or Office of Juvenile Affairs who has reasonable suspicion that a minor may be a victim of human trafficking and is in need of immediate protection shall assume protective custody over the minor and immediately notify the Department of Human Services [DHS]. The minor shall be transferred to the emergency custody of [DHS] While in custody of [DHS], the minor shall be provided with any necessary emergency social services which include, but shall not be limited to, medical examination or treatment, or a mental health assessment.

Law enforcement and [DHS] shall conduct a joint investigation into the claim.

⁸¹ See supra note 78.

⁷⁷ For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see: http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo.

⁷⁸ The text of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of Senate Bill 1005 during the 2nd Regular Session of Oklahoma's 56th Legislature (effective November 1, 2018).

⁷⁹ See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, "Seeking Justice: Legal approaches to eliminate criminal liability for child sex trafficking victims" (2018), https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/ANALYSIS-OF-STATUTORY-APPROACHES_ver7.pdf (discussing need to eliminate a minor's criminal liability for prostitution and other offenses committed pursuant to trafficking victimization and to establish a statutory avenue to specialized services).

⁸⁰ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 70, § 1210.163 (School employee required to report suspicion of child abuse or neglect) contains a similar reporting provision, which requires a school employee to refer suspected cases of child sex trafficking and CSEC to the Department of Human Services and local law enforcement.

The text of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 70, § 1210.163 cited here and elsewhere in this report includes amendments made by the enactment of Senate Bill 1150 during the 2nd Regular Session of Oklahoma's 56th Legislature (effective July 1, 2018).

The minor shall remain in the custody of [DHS] until the investigation has been completed, but for no longer than two (2) judicial days, for the show-cause hearing. [DHS] may release the minor to the custody of a parent or legal guardian if it determines the minor will not be subject to further exploitation. If no such determination is made, the minor shall be subject to the deprived child provisions of the Oklahoma Children's Code and made eligible for appropriate child welfare services.

The minor shall not be subject to juvenile delinquency proceedings for prostitution or other nonviolent misdemeanor offenses committed as a result of being a victim of human trafficking. It shall be an affirmative defense to delinquency or criminal prosecution for any misdemeanor or felony offense that the offense was committed during the time of and as the direct result of the minor being a victim of human trafficking.

Identified victims of juvenile sex trafficking are entitled to a range of services and protections in accordance with Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(A), which states,

A human trafficking victim shall:

- 1. Be house in an appropriate shelter as soon as practicable;
- 2. Not be detained in facilities inappropriate to their status as crime victims;
- 3. Not be jailed, fined, or otherwise penalized due to having been trafficked;
- 4. Receive prompt medical care, mental health care, food, and other assistance, as necessary;

5. Have access to legal assistance, information about their rights, and translation services, as necessary; and

6. Be provided protection if the safety of the victim is at risk or if there is a danger of additional harm by recapture of the victim by a trafficker, including:

- a. Taking measures to protect trafficked persons and their family members form intimidation and threats of reprisals, and
- b. Ensuring that the names and identifying information of trafficked persons and their family members are not disclosed to the public.

However, these services are not required to be specialized to the needs of juvenile sex trafficking victims.

Summary

A juvenile sex trafficking victim is not subject to delinquency proceedings for prostitution; instead, Oklahoma law provides for a range of general services and protections.

- 5.4.1 Recommendation: Amend Oklahoma's protective response for juvenile sex trafficking victims to include specialized services.
- 5.5 Child sex trafficking is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.⁸²

Child sex trafficking is not identified as a type of abuse and neglect within Oklahoma's child protection statutes; however, Oklahoma's definition of "abuse" expressly includes the sexual exploitation of a child. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(2) (Definitions) states,

"Abuse" means harm or threatened harm to the health, safety, or welfare of a child by a person responsible for the child's health, safety, or welfare, including but not limited to non-accidental physical or mental injury, sexual abuse, or sexual exploitation

⁸² For more information regarding recent federal legislation impacting this component see: http://go.sharedhope.org/stateimpactmemo.

a. "Harm or threatened harm to the health or safety of a child" means any real or threatened physical, mental, or emotional injury or damage to the body or mind that is not accidental including but not limited to sexual abuse, sexual exploitation, neglect, or dependency.

b. "Sexual abuse" includes but is not limited to rape, incest, and lewd or indecent acts or proposals made to a child, as defined by law, by a person responsible for the health, safety, or welfare of the child.

c. "Sexual exploitation" includes but is not limited to allowing, permitting, encouraging, or forcing a child to engage in prostitution, as defined by law, by any person eighteen (18) years of age or older or by a person responsible for the health, safety, or welfare of a child, or allowing, permitting, encouraging, or engaging in the lewd, obscene, or pornographic, as defined by law, photographing, filming, or depicting of a child in those acts by a person responsible for the health, safety, and welfare of the child.

Further, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E)⁸³ (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action) clarifies that child welfare can provide services in trafficking cases, stating,

Any peace officer or employee of a district court, juvenile bureau or Office of Juvenile Affairs who has reasonable suspicion that a minor may be a victim of human trafficking and is in need of immediate protection shall assume protective custody over the minor and immediately notify the Department of Human Services [DHS]. The minor shall be transferred to the emergency custody of [DHS] While in custody of [DHS], the minor shall be provided with any necessary emergency social services which include, but shall not be limited to, medical examination or treatment, or a mental health assessment The Department may release the minor to the custody of a parent or legal guardian if it determines the minor will not be subject to further exploitation. If no such determination is made, the minor shall be subject to the deprived child provisions of the Oklahoma Children's Code and made eligible for appropriate child welfare services

5.6 The definition of "caregiver" or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(2) (Definitions), the definition of "abuse" requires fault by a "person responsible for the child's health, safety, or welfare." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(52) defines "[p]erson responsible for a child's health, safety, or welfare" to include "a parent; a legal guardian; custodian; a foster parent; a person eighteen (18) years of age or older with whom the child's parent cohabitates or any other adult residing in the home of the child" This definition is not broad enough to include all non-familial trafficking cases.

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E)⁸⁴ (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims— Right to civil action), which applies specifically to cases of juvenile sex trafficking, requires a child to be in an out of home placement in order to be eligible for appropriate child welfare services, stating,

Any peace officer or employee of a district court, juvenile bureau or Office of Juvenile Affairs who has reasonable suspicion that a minor may be a victim of human trafficking and is in need of immediate protection shall assume protective custody over the minor and immediately notify the Department of Human Services. The minor shall be transferred to the emergency custody of the Department While in custody of the Department, the minor shall be provided necessary emergency social services which include, but shall not be limited to, medical examination or treatment, or a mental health assessment The Department may release the minor to the custody of a parent or legal guardian if it determines the minor will not be subject to further exploitation. If no such determination is made, the

⁸³ See supra note 78.

minor shall be subject to the deprived child provisions of the Oklahoma Children's Code and made eligible for appropriate child welfare services⁸⁵

5.6.1 Recommendation: Amend Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(E) (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action) to allow for child welfare intervention in all juvenile sex trafficking cases regardless of the child's relationship to the perpetrator and regardless of whether the child can be safely returned home.

5.7 Crime victims' compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).

Commercially sexually exploited children may be eligible to receive compensation under the Oklahoma Crime Victims Compensation Act,⁸⁶ but certain ineligibility factors may prevent some victims from receiving compensation. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.5(A) (Powers of board relating to claims for compensation— Office and staff support) states, "The Crime Victims Compensation Board shall award compensation for economic loss⁸⁷ arising from criminally injurious conduct⁸⁸ if satisfied by a preponderance of the evidence that the requirements for compensation have been met."

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(A)(1) (Award of compensation—Criteria—Amount—Denial, withdrawal or reduction—Reconsideration) prohibits the Crime Victims Compensation Board ("Board") from awarding compensation unless a claim is filed within 1 year of the date of the injury occurred, unless "good cause" exists for the failure to file, in which case the Board may extend the deadline to 2 years from the date of the injury. The Board may only extend the deadline beyond 2 years in child assault cases. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(A)(1). Additionally, if "the victim . . . is a child under eighteen (18) years of age, the Board may use the date the criminal incident was disclosed to a responsible adult, when establishing whether or not the claim was timely filed." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(A)(1). Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(A)(4), victim compensation is prohibited if the criminally

⁸⁵ Notably, the definition of "dependency" under Ok. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(20) does not require that fault, abuse or neglect occur at the hands of a "caregiver" or person responsible for care or similar term.⁸⁵ Instead, Ok. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 1-1-105(20), (21) provides,

20. "Dependency" means a child who is homeless or without proper care or guardianship through no fault of his or her parent, legal guardian, or custodian;

21. "Deprived child" means a child:

- a. who is for any reason destitute, homeless, or abandoned,
- b. who does not have the proper parental care or guardianship,
- c. who has been abused, neglected, or is dependent,
-

⁸⁶ See supra Component 5.1 for the definition of "victim."

⁸⁷ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.3(9) (Definitions) defines "economic loss" as "monetary detriment consisting only of allowable expense, work loss, replacement services loss and, if injury causes death, economic loss and replacement services loss of a dependent, but shall not include noneconomic loss." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.3(10) defines "noneconomic detriment" as "pain, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment and nonpecuniary damage."

⁸⁸ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.3(5)(a) defines "criminally injurious conduct" as,

[A] misdemeanor or felony which occurs or is attempted in this state, or against a resident of this state in a state that does not have an eligible crime victims' compensation program as such term is defined in the federal Victims of Crime Act of 1984, Public Law 98-473, that results in bodily injury, threat of bodily injury or death to a victim which:

(1) may be punishable by fine, imprisonment or death, or

(2) if the act is committed by a child, could result in such child being adjudicated a delinquent child.

⁸⁴ See supra note 78.

injurious conduct was not reported to law enforcement within 72 hours of the crime's occurrence, unless "the Board finds there was good cause for the failure to report within that time."

Additionally, an award of compensation may be reduced based on the "degree of responsibility for the cause of the injury or death attributable to the victim as determined by the Board." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(B)(2). Lastly, if the Board determines that "the claimant or victim has not fully cooperated with appropriate law enforcement agencies, [it] may deny, withdraw or reduce an award of compensation." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142.10(C).

5.7.1 Recommendation: Amend the Crime Victims Compensation Act to create exceptions from the listed criteria that do not contain a good cause exception for commercially sexually exploited children.

5.8 Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.

Human trafficking victims are expressly provided certain victim-friendly criminal justice procedures and protections under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(A) (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action). Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(A) states,

Human trafficking victims shall:

- 1. Be housed in an appropriate shelter as soon as practicable;
- 2. Not be detained in facilities inappropriate to their status as crime victims;
- 3. Not be jailed, fined, or otherwise penalized due to having been trafficked;
- 4. Receive prompt medical care, mental health care, food, and other assistance, as necessary;

5. Have access to legal assistance, information about their rights, and translation services, as necessary; and

6. Be provided protection if the safety of the victim is at risk or if there is a danger of additional harm by recapture of the victim by a trafficker, including:

a. taking measures to protect trafficked persons and their family members from intimidation and threats of reprisals, and

b. ensuring that the names and identifying information of trafficked persons and their family members are not disclosed to the public.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(C) authorizes the Attorney General "to establish an emergency hotline number for victims of human trafficking to call in order to request assistance or rescue."

Protections available to other crime victims may also be available to some domestic minor sex trafficking victims. For example, commercially sexually exploited children who are involved in a criminal case "filed pursuant to the Oklahoma Child Abuse Reporting and Prevention Act" or who are the "alleged subject of child abuse or neglect" may be appointed a guardian ad litem under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 843.7(A)(1), (B) (Appointment of representatives for child).

Additionally, pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 12, § 2412(A), (B) (Sexual offense against another person— Evidence of other sexual behavior inadmissible—Exceptions), domestic minor sex trafficking victims whose offenders are charged with a sexual offense receive protections in criminal prosecutions under Oklahoma's rape shield law. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 12, § 2412(A), (B) prohibits the admission of "[e]vidence of reputation or opinion regarding other sexual behavior of a victim or the sexual offense alleged" and "[e]vidence of specific instances of [the victim's] sexual behavior" unless it is being offered to prove something other than consent, including "the source of semen, pregnancy, disease or injury," "[f]alse allegations of sexual offenses," or "[s]imilar sexual acts in the presence of the accused with persons other than the accused which occurs at the time of the event giving rise to the sexual offense alleged." Additionally, all crime victims⁸⁹ receive certain protections under the Oklahoma Victim's Rights Act. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142A-2(A) (Victims and witnesses rights) provides,

The district attorney's office shall inform the victims and witnesses of crimes of the following rights:

2. To receive protection from harm and threats of harm arising out of the cooperation of the person with law enforcement and prosecution efforts, and to be provided with information as to the level of protection available and how to access protection;

3. To be informed of financial assistance and other social services available as a result of being a witness or a victim, including information on how to apply for the assistance and services;

. . . .

5. To be informed of the procedure to be followed in order to apply for and receive any restitution to which the victim is entitled;

6. To be provided, whenever possible, a secure waiting area during court proceedings that does not require close proximity to defendants and families and friends of defendants;

. . .

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142A-2(D) provides that in a felony case involving "a violent crime or a sex offense, the district attorney's office shall inform the victim, as soon as practicable, . . . of the progress of pretrial proceedings which could substantially delay the prosecution of the case." Under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142A-3(C) (Informing victim of rights), a rape victim "has the right to be informed by the officer who interviews the victim . . . of the twenty-four-hour statewide telephone communication service established by the Office of the Attorney General for victims of sexual assault"

Crime victims also have the right to receive some assistance in seeking restitution. Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142A-5 (Restitution form),

The district attorney's office shall provide all victims, regardless of whether the crime victim makes a specific request, with an official request for restitution form to be completed and signed by the crime victim, and to include all invoices, bills, receipts, and other evidence of injury, loss of earnings and out-of-pocket loss

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 142A-9 (Disclosure of personal information of victim or witness may be prohibited) also allows the court, upon request by the victim or district attorney, to keep the "address, telephone number, place of employment, or other personal information of the victim" confidential.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1024.4 (Destruction of obscene material or child pornography upon conviction) may serve to further protect victims depicted in images of child sexual exploitation (ICSE) as it authorizes the destruction of these images upon the final conviction of the offender.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 40.2(A) (Victim protection order - Victims not to be discouraged from pressing charges - Rape or forcible sodomy) also provides a victim protection order "for any victim of rape, forcible sodomy, a sex offense⁹⁰, kidnapping or assault and battery with a deadly weapon shall be substantially similar to a protective order in domestic abuse cases pursuant to the Protection from Domestic Abuse Act "

⁸⁹ See supra Component 5.1 for the definition of "victim."

⁹⁰ Under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 40(6) (Definitions), "Sex offense" as used in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, §§ 40- 40.3, which proscribes the availability and process for obtaining a protection order, includes crimes pf sexual assault, human trafficking, sexual abuse or sexual exploitation by a caretaker, child sexual abuse or child sexual exploitation, . . . procuring, producing, distributing or possessing child pornography, . . . distributing obscene material or child pornography, offering or soliciting sexual conduct with a child, procuring a child for prostitution or other lewd acts, inducing a child to engage in prostitution, lewd or indecent proposals or acts to a child

Lastly, Oklahoma's constitution further emphasizes crime victims' rights. Okla. Const. art. II, § 34(A) (Rights of victims) states,

To preserve and protect the rights of victims to justice and due process, and ensure that victims are treated with fairness, respect and dignity, and are free from intimidation, harassment, or abuse, throughout the criminal justice process, any victim or family member of a victim of a crime has the right to know the status of the investigation and prosecution of the criminal case, including all proceedings wherein a disposition of a case is likely to occur, and where plea negotiations may occur. The victim or family member of a victim of a crime has the right to know the location of the defendant following an arrest, during a prosecution of the criminal case, during a sentence to probation or confinement, and when there is any release or escape of the defendant from confinement. The victim or family member of a victim of a crime has a right to be present at any proceeding where the defendant has a right to be present, to be heard at any sentencing or parole hearing, to be awarded restitution by the convicted person for damages or losses as determined and ordered by the court, and to be informed by the state of the constitutional rights of the victim.

5.9 Child sex trafficking victims may vacate delinquency adjudications and expunge related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.

Oklahoma law does not provide a mechanism for minors to vacate delinquency adjudications related to trafficking victimization, and juvenile records may only be expunged after a waiting period.

For purposes of the Oklahoma Juvenile Code, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-102(A)(1) (Confidential juvenile records) states that juvenile court records are "confidential and shall not be open to the general public, inspected, or their contents disclosed," subject to exceptions specified in Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-102 (C), which states,

The confidentiality requirements of subsection A of [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-102] for juvenile court records and law enforcement records shall not apply:

. . . .

4. To a juvenile who is fourteen (14) years of age or older and who has been adjudicated delinquent and who subsequently comes before the juvenile court on a new delinquency matter after July 1, 1995;

. . . .

8. Whenever a juvenile is accepted for placement or treatment in a facility or private treatment facility within this state as a result of or following a conviction or adjudication for an out-of-state offense that would qualify the juvenile as a youthful offender,⁹¹ as defined in Section 2-5-202 [Definitions—Purpose] of this title, had the crime occurred within this state

1. "Youthful offender" means a person:

b. fifteen (15), sixteen (16), or seventeen (17) years of age and charged with a crime listed in subsection A of Section 2-5-206 [Certain acts mandating youthful offender status—Filing of delinquency petition or youthful offender information—Warrant, certification process—Guidelines] of this title, and

c. sixteen (16) or seventeen (17) years of age and charged with a crime listed in subsection B of Section 2-5-206 of this title,

if the offense was committed on or after January 1, 1998.

⁹¹ Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-5-202(A)(1) (Definitions—Purpose),

a. thirteen (13) or fourteen (14) years of age who is charged with murder in the first degree and certified as a youthful offender as provided by Section 2-5-205 [Certification as youthful offender or juvenile] of this title,

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-102(D) further provides,

Following the first adjudication as a delinquent, the court having jurisdiction shall note on the juvenile court record of the person that any subsequent juvenile court records shall not be confidential; provided, the child is at least fourteen (14) years of age or older. Any juvenile court record which becomes an open juvenile record as provided in this subsection may be expunged as provided in Section 7307-1.8 [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-109 (Expungement of open juvenile court record) (Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10, § 7307-1.8 renumbered)] of this title.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-6-109 (Expungement of open juvenile court record) states,

A. A person who is the subject of a juvenile court record, that is not confidential as provided by law, may petition the district court in which the juvenile court record is located for an order to expunge all or any part of the record pertaining to the person, except basic identification information; provided:

1. The person has attained twenty-one (21) years of age or older;

2. The person has not been arrested for any adult criminal offense and no charge, indictment, or information has been filed or is pending against the person at the time of the petition for an expungement;

3. The person has not been subject to any deferred prosecution or deferred sentence, and has not been convicted of any criminal offense; and

4. All court costs, restitution, fines and other court-ordered requirements have been completed for all juvenile proceedings.

C. Upon a finding that the harm to privacy of the person in interest or dangers of unwarranted adverse consequences outweigh the public interest in retaining the records, the court may order the records, or any part thereof except basic identification information, to be expunded

G. Nothing in this section shall be construed to authorize the physical destruction of any juvenile records.

J. Any record ordered to be expunged pursuant to this section shall be sealed and, if not unsealed within ten (10) years of the expungement order, may be obliterated or destroyed at the end of the ten-year period.

. . . .

Because a minor must turn 21 before records may be sealed and wait an additional 10 years before the records may be destroyed, a child sex trafficking victim may face collateral consequences associated with having an accessible juvenile record.

Oklahoma law does contain a trafficking-specific expungement provision, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 19c (Arrest or charge as result of human trafficking – Expungement on motion of court or defendant), which states,

The court, upon its own motion or upon petition by the defendant and for good cause shown, may enter an order for expungement of law enforcement and court records relating to a charge or conviction for a prostitution-related offense committed as a result of the defendant having been a victim of human trafficking Records expunged pursuant to this section shall be sealed to the public but not to law enforcement agencies for law enforcement purposes. Although Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 19c allows for record expungement without a waiting period, it applies only to "convictions." Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A, § 2-2-402(F), "any adjudication in a juvenile proceeding shall not be considered [a] . . . conviction for purposes of . . . any statute" Accordingly, records related to a delinquency adjudication cannot be expunged under this law.

Further, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 19c applies only to violations of Oklahoma's prostitution-related offenses, foreclosing the law's applicability to other offenses related to trafficking victimization.

5.9.1 Recommendation: Amend Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 19c (Arrest or charge as result of human trafficking – Expungement on motion of court or defendant) to allow child sex trafficking victims to vacate delinquency adjudications and expunged related records for prostitution and other offenses arising from trafficking victimization, without a waiting period.

5.10 Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748(C) (Human trafficking) specifically provides for mandatory restitution for human trafficking victims, stating that "[t]he court shall also order the defendant to pay restitution to the victim as provided in Section 991f [Restitution] of Title 22 [Criminal procedure] of the Oklahoma Statutes." Commercially sexually exploited children whose offenders are convicted of other crimes that cause injury to the child may also be able to receive restitution under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1) (Restitution).⁹² Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(A)(1) defines "restitution" as "the sum to be paid by the defendant to the victim of the criminal act to compensate that victim for up to three times the amount of the economic loss suffered as a direct result of the criminal act of the defendant." Under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(A)(2), a "victim" is "any person, partnership, corporation or legal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal act of legal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal act of legal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal act of legal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal entity that suffers an economic loss as a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal act of legal entity that suffers an economic loss are a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal entity that suffers an economic loss are a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal act of the criminal entity that suffers an economic loss are a direct result of the criminal act of the criminal entity that suffers an economic loss."

actual financial detriment suffered by the victim consisting of medical expenses actually incurred, damage to or loss of real and personal property and any other out-of-pocket expenses, including loss of earnings, reasonably incurred as the direct result of the criminal act of the defendant. No other elements of damage shall be included as an economic loss for purposes of this section.

Additionally, under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(B) (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action states), civil remedies are available to minors victimized through sex trafficking. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(B) states,

Any person aggrieved by a violation of subsection B of Section 748 [Human trafficking] of this title may bring a civil action against the person or persons who committed the violation to recover actual and punitive damages and reasonable attorney fees and costs . . . A criminal case or prosecution is not a necessary precedent to the civil action. The statute of limitations for the cause of action shall not commence until the latter of the victim's emancipation from the defendant, the victim's twenty-first birthday, or the plaintiff discovers or reasonably should have discovered that he or she was a victim of human trafficking and that the defendant caused, was responsible for or profited from the human trafficking.

⁹² See supra Component 2.8 for the substantive provisions of Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 991f(C)(1).

5.11 Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 152 (Statute of limitations) sets forth the applicable statute of limitations for criminal prosecutions in Oklahoma. Crimes that do not have a statute of limitations specified, including Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking), § 1029 (Engaging in prostitution, etc.), § 1087 (Child under 18 years of age—Procuring for prostitution, lewdness or other indecent act—Punishment), and § 1088(A) (Child under 18 years of age—Inducing, keeping, detaining or restraining for prostitution—Punishment), are subject to a 3 year statute of limitations. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 152(H).

Pursuant to Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 152(C)(1), prosecutions for sexual crimes against children, including Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1021.2(A) (Minors—Procuring for participation in pornography), § 1021.3(A) (Guardians—Parents—Custodians—Consent to participation of minors in child pornography), § 1040.12a (Aggravated child pornography), § 1111 (Rape defined), § 1111.1 (Rape by instrumentation), § 1113 (Slight penetration is sufficient to complete crime), § 888 (Forcible sodomy), § 1114 (Rape in first degree—Second degree), § 1123 (Lewd or indecent proposals or acts as to child under 16), § 843.5 (Child sexual abuse), and § 866 (Elements of offense (Trafficking in children)), "shall be commenced by the forty-fifth birthday of the alleged victim" Under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 22, § 152(C)(2)(a), (b), however, prosecutions for any of these offenses may be commenced at any time under the following circumstances:

a. physical evidence is collected and preserved that is capable of being tested to obtain a profile from deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA), and

b. the identity of the offender is subsequently established through the use of a DNA profile using evidence listed in subparagraph a of this paragraph.

Regarding civil actions in trafficking cases, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748.2(B) (Guidelines for treatment of human trafficking victims—Right to civil action) states, "The statute of limitations for the cause of action shall not commence until the latter of the victim's emancipation from the defendant or the victim's twenty-first birthday, or the plaintiff discovers or reasonably should have discovered that he or she was a victim of human trafficking and that the defendant caused, was responsible for or profited from the human trafficking."

In civil actions based on damages for injury caused by criminal offenses, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 12, 95(A)(7) (Limitation of other actions) provides,

An action based on intentional conduct brought by any person for recovery of damages for injury suffered as a result of criminal actions, as defined by the Oklahoma Statutes, may be brought against any person incarcerated or under the supervision of a state, federal or local correctional facility on or after November 1, 2003:

a. at any time during the incarceration of the offender for the offense on which the action is based, or

b. within five (5) years after the perpetrator is released from the custody of a state, federal or local correctional facility, if the defendant was serving time for the offense on which the action is based.

Additionally, for civil actions based on damages resulting from childhood sexual abuse or exploitation, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 12, \S 95(A)(6) states,

An action based on intentional conduct brought by any person for recovery of damages for injury suffered as a result of childhood sexual abuse incidents or exploitation as defined by Section 1-1-105 [Definitions] of Title 10A of the Oklahoma Statutes . . . against the actual perpetrator shall be commenced by the forty-fifth birthday of the alleged victim . . . provided, that the time limit for commencement of an action pursuant to this paragraph is tolled for a child until the child reaches the age of eighteen (18) years

5.11.1 Recommendation: Eliminate statutes of limitations for commencing a prosecution under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 748 (Human trafficking) and Oklahoma's CSEC offenses.

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 6: CRIMINAL JUSTICE TOOLS FOR INVESTIGATION AND PROSECUTIONS

Legal Components:

- 6.1 Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.
- 6.2 Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.
- 6.3 Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).
- 6.4 Using a law enforcement decoy to investigate buying or selling commercial sex is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.
- 6.5 Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.
- 6.6 State law requires reporting of missing children and located missing children.

Legal Analysis:

6.1 Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.

Oklahoma does not mandate that law enforcement receive training on human trafficking or domestic minor sex trafficking. However, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 70, § 3311(A) (Council on law enforcement education and training) establishes the Council on Law Enforcement Education and Training ("Council") and grants it "the authority to exercise the rights, privileges and functions necessary to ensure the professional training and continuing education of law enforcement officers in the State of Oklahoma." Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 70, § 3311(B)(2) specifically authorizes the Council to "[p]romulgate rules with respect to such matters as certification, revocation, . . . minimum courses of study, . . . minimum standards for basic and advanced in-service courses, and seminars for Oklahoma police and peace officers."

Pursuant Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A § 1-9-123 the Department of Human Services "in consultation with "state and local law enforcement, juvenile justice systems" shall provide trainings for caseworkers.

The Department of Human Services shall, in consultation with state and local law enforcement, juvenile justice systems, health care providers, education agencies, and organizations with experience in dealing with at-risk children and youth, establish policies and procedures, including relevant training for caseworkers, for identifying, documenting in agency records and determining appropriate services for children and youth at risk of sex trafficking.

- 6.1.1 Recommendation: Mandate training on domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement.
- 6.2 Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.

Oklahoma permits single-party consent to audio-taping. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 13, § 176.4(4), (5) (Acts not prohibited) states,

It is not unlawful pursuant to the Security of Communications Act for:

4. a person acting under color of law to intercept a wire, oral or electronic communication when such person is a party to the communication or one of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to such interception; or

5. a person not acting under color of law to intercept a wire, oral or electronic communication when such person is a party to the communication or when one of the parties to the communication has

given prior consent to such interception unless the communication is intercepted for the purpose of committing any criminal act.

6.3 Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC).

Oklahoma permits law enforcement to use wiretapping and resulting evidence when authorized by a court order, and provides for the issuance of a court order in the investigation of crimes related to domestic minor sex trafficking, including human trafficking and prostitution of children. Specifically, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 13, § 176.7 (Court order authorizing interception of communications) states,

The Attorney General, upon application by a district attorney, may make application to a judge of competent jurisdiction for, and such judge may grant in conformity with the Security of Communications Act, an order authorizing the interception of wire, oral or electronic communications by any law enforcement agency of this state or any political subdivision thereof having responsibility for the investigation of the offense as to which the application is made, when such interception may provide evidence of acts of biochemical terrorism, terrorism, terrorism hoax, and biochemical assault, as defined in Section 1268.1[Definitions] of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes, the commission of the offense of murder, the cultivation or manufacture or distribution of narcotic drugs or other controlled dangerous substances, as defined in the Uniform Controlled Dangerous Substances Act, trafficking in illegal drugs, as defined in Section 1081 of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes, the pandering of humans for sex as provided in Section 1081 of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes or the prostitution of a child, as defined in Section 1030 of Title 21 of the Oklahoma Statutes, and any conspiracy to commit the crimes specifically enumerated in this section.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 13, § 176.8(E) (Disclosure of information) further provides,

When a law enforcement officer, while engaged in intercepting wire, oral or electronic communications in an authorized manner, intercepts wire, oral or electronic communications relating to offenses for which an order or authorization could have been secured or any offense listed in [Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571],⁹³ which is other than those specified in the order of authorization, the contents thereof and evidence derived therefrom may be disclosed or used as provided in this section. Such contents and any evidence derived therefrom may be used when authorized by a judge of competent jurisdiction when such judge finds on subsequent application that the contents were otherwise intercepted in accordance with the provisions of the Security of Communications Act. . . .

6.4 Using a law enforcement decoy to investigate buying or selling commercial sex is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(C) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor) prohibits a defense to prosecution based on the use of a law enforcement decoy posing as a minor during an investigation; it states, "[t]he fact that an undercover operative or law enforcement officer was involved in the detection and investigation of an offense pursuant to this section shall not constitute a defense to a prosecution under this section."

⁹³ Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 57, § 571 (Definitions) lists, in relevant part, child pornography, aggravated child pornography, child prostitution, human trafficking, child abuse, rape, or lewd or indecent proposition or lewd or indecent act with a child.

However, a defendant may still be able to assert a defense based on a law enforcement decoy posing as a minor to investigate other buyer-applicable offenses through reverse sting operations, which are the most likely situations in which a defendant would try to use such a defense. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) (Engaging in prostitution, etc.) is a buyer-applicable CSEC offense⁹⁴ that does not prohibit this defense, meaning that buyers charged for attempting to solicit or purchase sex with a minor under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2) would not be prohibited from raising a defense based on the fact that an action minor was not involved.

6.5 Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.

Law enforcement may use the Internet or other electronic communication to investigate buyers and traffickers under Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1040.13a(C) (Facilitating, encouraging, offering or soliciting sexual conduct or engaging in sexual communication with a minor or person believed to be a minor), which expressly provides that "[t]he fact that an undercover operative or law enforcement officer was involved in the detection and investigation of an offense pursuant to this section shall not constitute a defense to a prosecution under this section."

Additionally, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 74, § 151.1 (Internet crimes against children unit) states,

A. The Oklahoma State Bureau of Investigation shall establish an Internet Crimes Against Children (ICAC) unit for the primary purpose of investigating Internet crimes committed against children, including, but not limited to, offenses related to child pornography and solicitation of minors for pornography, prostitution or sex-related offenses. The unit shall additionally promote safe Internet use among children and their parents by various media or printed-material campaigns or by offering educational programs to schools or communities throughout this state. The Bureau shall employ sufficient employees to investigate and implement the ICAC unit.

B. The Director of the Oklahoma State Bureau of Investigation is hereby authorized to enter into local cooperative agreements with local law enforcement agencies for the purpose of appointing ICAC Affiliate Task Force Agents to assist the ICAC unit of the Bureau . . . ICAC Affiliate Task Force Agents shall have general peace officer powers and the authority to arrest persons throughout the state for the purpose of investigating Internet crimes committed against children including, but not limited to, offenses related to child pornography, solicitation of minors for pornography, prostitution or sex-related offenses

6.6 State law requires reporting of missing children and located missing children.

The Department of Human Services is required to report missing children as well as children who are identified as sex trafficking victims. Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10A § 1-9-123 provides,

. . . .

B. When notified a child or youth has run away or is missing from a foster placement, the Department shall, within twenty-four (24) hours of notification, report such status of the child or youth to local law enforcement, the National Crime Information Center, and to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children."

C. The Department shall develop and implement specific protocols to:

1. Expeditiously locate any child or youth missing from foster care;

2. Determine the primary factors that contributed to the child or youth running away or otherwise being absent from foster care;

⁹⁴ See supra Component 2.2 for more information about Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 21, § 1029(A)(2).

3. Respond, to the extent possible and appropriate, to those factors that contributed to the absence from care or runaway behaviors in the current and subsequent placements of the child or youth; and

4. Determine what the child or youth experienced while absent from care, that would include an appropriate screening to determine if the child or youth is a possible victim of sex trafficking.

D. The Department shall report to law enforcement authorities immediately, and in no case later than twenty-four (24) hours, after receiving information on a child or youth who has been identified as being a sex trafficking victim as defined by Section 1-1-105 of Title 10A of the Oklahoma Statutes.

Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 10, § 1628 (Missing children 16 and under-Investigation of disappearance) states,

It is hereby made the duty of any sheriff, chief of police, city marshal, constable, or any other law enforcement officer, upon notification of a report of a missing child sixteen (16) years and under, to immediately initiate an investigation into the disappearance of said child.

6.6.1 Recommendation: Enact a requirement that law enforcement and child welfare promptly report information about both missing and located missing children.

© January 23, 2012 Shared Hope International, American Center for Law and Justice. All rights reserved.

- © November 29, 2012 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.
- © November 7, 2013 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 6, 2014 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 11, 2015 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 17, 2016 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 15, 2017 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 14, 2018 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.