

PROTECTED INNOCENCE CHALLENGE

STATE ACTION. NATIONAL CHANGE.

2015 ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS IDAHO

FRAMEWORK ISSUE 1: CRIMINALIZATION OF DOMESTIC MINOR SEX TRAFFICKING

Legal Components:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*
- 1.2 *Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.*
- 1.3 *Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to identify the commercially sexually exploited minor as a trafficking victim.*
- 1.4 *The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute trafficking crimes.*

Legal Analysis¹:

- 1.1 *The state human trafficking law addresses sex trafficking and clearly defines a human trafficking victim as any minor under the age of 18 used in a commercial sex act without regard to use of force, fraud, or coercion, aligning to the federal trafficking law.*

Idaho's human trafficking law does not require force, fraud, or coercion if the person induced to perform the commercial sex act is under the age of 18. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) defines "human trafficking" in part as "[s]ex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained eighteen (18) years of age."

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties) states,

Notwithstanding any other law to the contrary, on and after July 1, 2006, any person who commits a crime as provided for in the following sections, and who, in the commission of such crime or crimes,

¹ This report includes legislation enacted as of August 1, 2015.

also commits the crime of human trafficking, as defined in section 18-8602 [Human trafficking defined], Idaho Code, shall be punished by imprisonment in the state prison for not more than twenty-five (25) years unless a more severe penalty is otherwise prescribed by law: 18-905 (Aggravated assault), 18-907 (Aggravated battery), 18-909 (assault with intent to commit a serious felony), 18-911 (battery with intent to commit a serious felony), 18-913 (Felonious administering of drugs), 18-1501(1) (Felony injury to child), 18-1505(1) (Felony injury to vulnerable adult), 18-1505(3) (Felony exploitation of vulnerable adult), 18-1505B (Sexual abuse and exploitation of vulnerable adult), 18-1506 (Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years), 18-1506A (Ritualized abuse of child), 18-1507 ([Definitions—sexual exploitation of child—penalties]), 18-1508A (Sexual battery of minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age), 18-1509A ([Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device—Penalties—jurisdiction]), 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child), 18-2407(1) (Grand theft), 18-5601 through 18-5614 (Prostitution), or 18-7804 (Racketeering).

1.2 Commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) is identified as a separate and distinct offense from general sexual offenses, which may also be used to prosecute those who commit commercial sex offenses against minors.

The following laws criminalize CSEC in Idaho:

1. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution—Penalties) provides that “[e]very person who induces or attempts to induce a person under the age of eighteen (18) years to engage in prostitution shall be guilty of a felony.” A conviction under this statute is a felony punishable by 2 years to life imprisonment, a fine up to \$50,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5609.
2. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution-penalties) provides that “[e]very person who exchanges or offers to exchange anything of value² for sexual conduct or sexual contact³ with a person under the age of eighteen (18) years shall be guilty of a felony.” A conviction under this statute is a felony punishable by 2 years to life imprisonment, a fine up to 50,000, or both.
3. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(2) (Definitions—Sexual exploitation of a child—penalties) states,
 - (2) A person commits sexual exploitation of a child⁴ if he knowingly and willfully:
 - (b) Causes, induces or permits a child to engage in, or be used for, any explicit sexual conduct for the purpose of producing or making sexually exploitative material;

A conviction under subsection (2)(a) of this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years in state prison, a fine not to exceed \$10,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(3). A conviction under subsections (2)(b), (2)(c), or (2)(d) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 30 years in a state prison, a fine not to exceed \$50,000 or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(4).

Other laws, while not expressly commercial in nature, may apply to sexual exploitation of children, including the following:

² “‘Anything of value’ includes, but is not limited to, a fee, food, shelter, clothing, medical care or membership in a criminal gang.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(2)(c),

³ The statute defines sexual conduct as “[s]exual intercourse or deviate sexual intercourse.” The statute defines sexual contact as “[a]ny touching of the sexual organs or other intimate parts of a person not married to the actor for the purpose of arousing or gratifying the sexual desire of either party.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(2)(a)-(b).

⁴ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(1)(b) defines “child” as “a person who is less than eighteen (18) years of age.”

1. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device—Penalties—jurisdiction) provides,

A person aged eighteen (18) years or older shall be guilty of a felony if such person knowingly uses the internet or any device that provides transmission of messages, signals, facsimiles, video images or other communication to solicit, seduce, lure, persuade or entice by words or actions, or both, a person under the age of sixteen (16) years or a person the defendant believes to be under the age of sixteen (16) years to engage in any sexual act with or against the person where such act would be a violation of chapter 15 [Children and vulnerable adults], 61 [Rape] or 66 [Sex crimes], title 18, Idaho Code.

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 15 years and a possible fine up to \$50,000.⁵ Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1509A (2), 18-112A.

2. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506(1) (Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years) states,

It is a felony for any person eighteen (18) years of age or older, with the intent to gratify the lust, passions, or sexual desire of the actor, minor child or third party, to:

- (a) Solicit⁶ a minor child under the age of sixteen (16) years to participate in a sexual act;
- (b) Cause or have sexual contact⁷ with such minor child, not amounting to lewd conduct as defined in section 18-1508 [Lewd conduct with minor child under sixteen], Idaho Code;
- (c) Make any photographic or electronic recording of such minor child; or
- (d) Induce, cause or permit a minor child to witness an act of sexual conduct.⁸

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 25 years in the state prison and a possible fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1506 (5), 18-112A.

3. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1508 (Lewd conduct with minor child under sixteen) states that it is a crime to

commit any lewd or lascivious act or acts upon or with the body or any part or member thereof of a minor child under the age of sixteen (16) years, including but not limited to, genital-genital contact, oral-genital contact, anal-genital contact, oral-anal contact, manual-anal contact, or manual-genital contact, whether between persons of the same or opposite sex, or [to] involve such minor child in any act of bestiality or sado-masochism as defined in section 18-1507 [Definitions—sexual exploitation of a

⁵ Where no fine is otherwise provided for an offense that is punishable as a felony, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-112A (Fine authorized) authorizes the court to impose a fine up to \$50,000.

⁶ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506(2) defines “solicit” as

any written, verbal, or physical act which is intended to communicate to such minor child the desire of the actor or third party to participate in a sexual act or participate in sexual foreplay, by the means of sexual contact, photographing or observing such minor child engaged in sexual contact.

⁷ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506(3) defines “sexual contact” as “any physical contact between such minor child and any person, which is caused by the actor, or the actor causing such minor child to have self contact.”

⁸ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506(4) defines “sexual conduct” as

human masturbation, sexual intercourse, sadomasochistic abuse, or any touching of the genitals or pubic areas of the human male or female, or the breasts of the female, whether alone or between members of the same or opposite sex or between humans and animals in an act of apparent sexual stimulation or gratification.

child–penalties], Idaho Code, when any of such acts are done with the intent of arousing, appealing to, or gratifying the lust or passions or sexual desires of such person, such minor child, or third party

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by up to life imprisonment in state prison and a possible fine not to exceed \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1508, 18-112A.

4. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1508A(1) (Sexual battery of a minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age—Penalty) provides,

It is a felony for any person at least five (5) years of age older than a minor child who is sixteen (16) or seventeen (17) years of age, who, with the intent of arousing, appealing to or gratifying the lust, passion, or sexual desires of such person, minor child, or third party, to:

- (a) Commit any lewd or lascivious act or acts upon or with the body or any part or any member thereof of such minor child including, but not limited to, genital-genital contact, oral-genital contact, anal-genital contact, oral-anal contact, manual-anal contact or manual-genital contact, whether between persons of the same or opposite sex, or who shall involve such minor child in any act of explicit sexual conduct as defined in section 18-1507 [Definitions–sexual exploitation of a child–penalties],⁹ Idaho Code; or
- (b) Solicit¹⁰ such minor child to participate in a sexual act; or
- (c) Cause or have sexual contact¹¹ with such minor child, not amounting to lewd conduct as defined in paragraph (a) of this subsection; or

. . . .

A conviction under subsection (1)(a) of this statute is punishable as a felony by up to life imprisonment in the state prison and a possible fine up to \$50,000, and a conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1508A(1)(b)–(d) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 25 years in state prison and a possible fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1508A(4), (5), 18-112A.

5. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child for adoption or other purpose penalized —Allowed expenses) states that “[a]ny person or persons who shall sell or barter any child for adoption or for any other purpose, shall be guilty of a felony.” A conviction under this statute is punishable by up imprisonment up to 14 years in the state penitentiary, a fine up to \$5,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511.

1.3 Prostitution statutes refer to the sex trafficking statute to identify the commercially sexually exploited minor as a trafficking victim.

Neither Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution) nor Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution) refer to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) when a minor is involved in prostitution.

⁹ See *supra* note 8 for the definition of “explicit sexual conduct.”

¹⁰ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1508A(2) defines “solicit” as

any written, verbal or physical act which is intended to communicate to such minor child the desire of the actor or third party to participate in a sexual act or participate in sexual foreplay, by the means of sexual contact, photographing or observing such minor child engaged in sexual contact.

¹¹ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1508A(3) defines “sexual contact” as “any physical contact between such minor child and any person or between such minor children which is caused by the actor, or the actor causing such minor child to have self contact.”

- 1.3.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution) and § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution) when a minor is involved in prostitution to refer to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) in order to identify CSEC victims as victims of sex trafficking.

1.4 *The state racketeering or gang crimes statute includes sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses as predicate acts allowing the statute to be used to prosecute trafficking crimes.*

Several CSEC crimes and human trafficking are predicate acts for racketeering violations under Idaho Code Ann. title 18, chapter 78 (Racketeering act). Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7804(a)–(d) (Prohibited activities—penalties) provides,

- (a) It is unlawful for any person who has received any proceeds derived directly or indirectly from a pattern of racketeering activity in which the person has participated, to use or invest, directly or indirectly, any part of the proceeds or the proceeds derived from the investment or use thereof in the acquisition of any interest in, or the establishment or operation of, any enterprise¹² or real property. . . .
- (b) It is unlawful for any person to engage in a pattern of racketeering activity in order to acquire or maintain, directly or indirectly, any interest in or control of any enterprise or real property. . .
- (c) It is unlawful for any person employed by or associated with any enterprise to conduct or participate, directly or indirectly, in the conduct of the affairs of such enterprise by engaging in a pattern of racketeering activity. . . .
- (d) It is unlawful for any person to conspire to violate any of the provisions of subsections (a) through (c) of this section. . . .

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7803(a) (Definitions) defines “racketeering activity” as “any act which is chargeable or indictable under,” among others, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), § 18-5602 (Procurement), § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement), § 18-5604 (Paying for procurement), § 18-5605 (Detention for prostitution), § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute), § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes), and § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), as well as indecency and obscenity statutes (sections 18-1515, 18-1518, 18-4103, 18-4103A, 18-4104, 18-4105, 18-4105A and 18-4107, Idaho Code.

A conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7804(a)–(d) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 14 years in the Idaho penitentiary, a fine up to \$25,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7804(a)–(e). Additionally, a conviction under this statute provides for mandatory asset forfeiture. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7804 (Prohibited activities), subsection (g) provides,

In addition to any other penalties prescribed by law, whoever violates any provisions of this act shall forfeit to the state of Idaho:

- (1) Any interest acquired or maintained in violation of the racketeering act; and
- (2) Any interest in, security of, claim against or property or contractual right of any kind affording a source of influence over any enterprise which he has established, operated, controlled, conducted or participated in the conduct of in violation of the provisions of the racketeering act.

¹² Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7803(c) defines an “enterprise” as “any sole proprietorship, partnership, corporation, business, labor union, association or other legal entity or any group of individuals associated in fact although not a legal entity, and includes illicit as well as licit entities.”

Additional penalties are available, where the enterprise is a criminal gang.¹³ Idaho Code Ann. title 18, chapter 85 (Idaho Criminal Gang Enforcement Act). Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8503(1), (2) (Punishment) states,

(1) An adult . . . who is convicted of any felony or misdemeanor enumerated in section 18-8502(3)[Definitions], Idaho Code, that is knowingly committed for the benefit or at the direction of, or in association with, any criminal gang¹⁴ or criminal gang member,¹⁵ in addition to the punishment provided for the commission of the underlying offense, shall be punished as follows:

(a) Any adult . . . who is convicted of a misdemeanor shall be punished by an additional term of imprisonment in the county jail for not more than one (1) year.

(b) Any adult . . . who is convicted of a felony shall be punished by an extended term of not less than two (2) years and not more than five (5) years in prison.

(c) If the underlying offense described in section 18-8502(3), Idaho Code, is a felony and committed on the grounds of, or within one thousand (1,000) feet of, a public or private elementary, secondary or vocational school during hours when the facility is open for classes or school-related programs or when minors are using the facility, the extended term shall be not less than two (2) years and not more than five (5) years in prison.

(2) This section does not create a separate offense but provides an additional penalty for the primary offense, the imposition of which is contingent upon the finding of the prescribed facts.

Included among the offenses listed in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8502(3) (Definitions) are Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602 (Human trafficking defined), § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), § 18-5602 (Procurement), § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement), § 18-5604 (Paying for procurement), § 18-5605 (Detention for prostitution), § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute), § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes), § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), § 18-5613 (Prostitution), § 18-5614 (Patronizing a prostitute), § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-7804 (Prohibited activities), and § 18-8201 (Money laundering and illegal investment).

¹³ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8504(1) (Recruiting criminal gang members), also criminalizes, “(a) Knowingly soliciting, inviting, encouraging or otherwise causing a person to actively participate in a criminal gang; or (b) Knowingly using force, threats, violence or intimidation directed at any person, or by the infliction of bodily injury upon any person, to actively participate in a criminal gang.” A conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8504(2).

¹⁴ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8502(1) (Definitions) defines “criminal gang” as “an ongoing organization, association, or group of three (3) or more persons, whether formal or informal, that has a common name or common identifying sign or symbol, whose members individually or collectively engage in or have engaged in a pattern of criminal gang activity, having as one (1) of its primary activities the commission of one (1) or more of the criminal acts enumerated in subsection (3) of this section.”

¹⁵ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8502(2) defines a “criminal gang member” as

any person who engages in a pattern of criminal gang activity and who meets two (2) or more of the following criteria:

(a) Admits to gang membership;

(b) Is identified as a gang member;

(c) Resides in or frequents a particular gang’s area and adopts its style of dress, its use of hand signs, or its tattoos, and associates with known gang members;

(d) Has been arrested more than once in the company of identified gang members for offenses that are consistent with usual gang activity;

(e) Is identified as a gang member by physical evidence such as photographs or other documentation;

or

(f) Has been stopped in the company of known gang members four (4) or more times.

Gangs and criminal enterprises also face criminal liability under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8504(1) (Recruiting criminal gang members), which criminalizes, “(a) Knowingly soliciting, inviting, encouraging or otherwise causing a person to actively participate in a criminal gang; or (b) Knowingly using force, threats, violence or intimidation directed at any person, or by the infliction of bodily injury upon any person, to actively participate in a criminal gang.” A conviction under this statute is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8504(2).

In addition to these laws, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution-penalties) includes a provision addressing gang membership. The statute states that every person who exchanges or offers “anything of value” for the sexual conduct or contact with a minor will be guilty of a felony. The law specifically states that gang membership constitutes a thing of value, bringing gang-related activities under the scope of the law. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610.

Legal Components:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to the buyers of commercial sex acts with a victim of domestic minor sex trafficking.*
- 2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*
- 2.3 *Solicitation laws differentiate buying sex acts with an adult and buying sex acts with a minor under 18.*
- 2.4 *Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.*
- 2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*
- 2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*
- 2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*
- 2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*
- 2.9 *Buying and possessing child pornography carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
- 2.10 *Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors and child pornography are required to register as sex offenders.*

Legal Analysis:

- 2.1 *The state sex trafficking law can be applied to the buyers of commercial sex acts with a victim of domestic minor sex trafficking.¹⁶*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) includes “[s]ex trafficking . . . in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained eighteen (18) years of age.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1). Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties), predicate crimes for determining penalties include the following: Idaho Code Ann. § 18-905 (Aggravated assault), § 18-907 (Aggravated battery), § 18-909 (Assault with intent to commit a serious felony), § 18-911 (Battery with intent to commit a serious felony), § 18-1501(1) (Felony injury to child), § 18-1506 (Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years), § 18-1506A (Ritualized abuse of child), § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of child—penalties), § 18-1508A (Sexual battery of minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age), § 18-1509A (Enticing a child over the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction), § 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child), §§ 18-5601 to -5614 (Prostitution), or § 18-7804 (Racketeering). Inclusion of patronizing a prostitute under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614(1), as well as several sex offenses, as offenses that constitute sex trafficking, bring offenses committed by purchasers of sex with minors within the definition of sex trafficking.

¹⁶ See generally SHARED HOPE INTERNATIONAL, “Eliminating the Third Party Control Barrier to Identifying Juvenile Sex Trafficking Victims,” JuST Response Policy Paper (2015), http://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Policy-Paper_Eliminating-Third-Party-Control_Final1.pdf (discussing need to include buyer conduct in core sex trafficking offense regardless of whether victim is under control of a third party and explaining negative impact on victims and victim-identification when buyers are excluded as sex trafficking offenders).

2.2 *Buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor can be prosecuted under commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) laws.*

Buyers of commercial sex acts with minors can be prosecuted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution—penalties), which states, “every person who exchanges or offers to exchange anything of value for sexual conduct or sexual contact with a person under the age of eighteen shall be guilty of a felony.”

Several sexual offense statutes could be used to prosecute certain buyers of commercial sex acts with a minor, but they do not specifically criminalize the commercial sexual exploitation of a child and do not refer to the human trafficking statute to bring these criminal offenses within the ambit of human trafficking under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined).¹⁷

2.3 *Solicitation laws differentiate buying sex acts with an adult and buying sex acts with a minor under 18.*

The offense of buying sex with a minor versus an adult is separately criminalized under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(1) (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution—penalties), which states, “[E]very person who exchanges or offers to exchange anything of value for sexual conduct or sexual contact with a person under the age of eighteen shall be guilty of a felony.”

Otherwise, Idaho’s general solicitation law does not differentiate between buying sex with an adult and buying sex with a minor. Instead, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614(1) (Patronizing a prostitute) is age-neutral, stating that “[a] person is guilty of patronizing a prostitute when he or she . . . [p]ays or offers or agrees to pay another person a fee for the purpose of engaging in an act of sexual conduct or sexual contact.”¹⁸ A first or second conviction under this statute is punishable as a misdemeanor by imprisonment up to 6 months in county jail, a fine up to \$1,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5614(2), 18-113(1). A subsequent conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 5 years in state prison, a fine up to \$50,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5614(2), 18-112.

2.3.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614(1) (Patronizing a prostitute) to differentiate between buying sex with an adult and buying sex with a minor.

2.4 *Penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are as high as federal penalties.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) is punishable by imprisonment up to 25 years “unless a more severe penalty is otherwise prescribed by law.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution) is a felony punishable by 2 years to life imprisonment, a fine up to 50,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(1).

Several sexual offenses that do not criminalize commercial sexual exploitation specifically may be applicable to the criminal actions of a buyer of commercial sex acts with a minor. These carry high sentences and fines.¹⁹

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the federal Trafficking Victims Protection Act²⁰ for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed

¹⁷ See *supra* Section 1.2 for a full description of the sexual offense laws that may be used to prosecute certain buyers.

¹⁸ See *supra* Section 2.2 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614.

¹⁹ See *supra* section 1.2 for a list of relevant sexual offenses.

²⁰ Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Pub. L. No. 106-386, 114 Stat. 1464, 1466 (codified in scattered sections of 18 and 22 U.S.C.).

\$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the buyer has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense²¹ against a minor. 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(1). To the extent buyers can be prosecuted under other federal CSEC laws,²² a conviction is punishable by penalties ranging from a fine not to exceed \$250,000 to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.²³

2.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, or purchase, or attempt to lure, entice, or purchase commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for buyers.*

Although it is not expressly commercial, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) may be used to convict buyers who use the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit, or purchase commercial sex acts with a person under the age of 16. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) states,

A person aged eighteen (18) years or older shall be guilty of a felony if such person knowingly uses the internet or any device that provides transmission of messages, signals, facsimiles, video images or other communication to solicit, seduce, lure, persuade or entice by words or actions, or both, a person under the age of sixteen (16) years or a person the defendant believes to be under the age of sixteen (16) years to engage in any sexual act with or against the person where such act would be a violation of chapter 15 [Children and vulnerable adults], 61 [Rape] or 66 [Sex crimes], title 18, Idaho Code.²⁴

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 15 years and a possible fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1509A(2), 18-112A.

In addition, Idaho has established a special Internet Crimes Against Children (ICAC) Unit in the office of the Attorney General. The unit “shall have the authority and responsibility to conduct a statewide program for the investigation and prosecution of violations of all applicable Idaho laws that involve or are directly related to

²¹ Pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3559(e)(2), “federal sex offense” is defined as

an offense under section 1591 [18 USCS § 1591] (relating to sex trafficking of children), 2241 [18 USCS § 2241] (relating to aggravated sexual abuse), 2242 [18 USCS § 2242] (relating to sexual abuse), 2244(a)(1) [18 USCS § 2244(a)(1)] (relating to abusive sexual contact), 2245 [18 USCS § 2245] (relating to sexual abuse resulting in death), 2251 [18 USCS § 2251] (relating to sexual exploitation of children), 2251A [18 USCS § 2251A] (relating to selling or buying of children), 2422(b) [18 USCS § 2422(b)] (relating to coercion and enticement of a minor into prostitution), or 2423(a) [18 USCS § 2423(a)] (relating to transportation of minors).

²² 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (Selling or buying of children), 2251(a) (Sexual exploitation of children), 2423(a) (Transportation of a minor with intent for minor to engage in criminal sexual activity), 2422(a) (Coercion and enticement), 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors).

²³ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2251A(b) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 30 years to life and a fine), 2251(e) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 15–30 years and a fine), 2423(a) (conviction punishable by imprisonment for 10 years to life and a fine), 2422(a) (conviction punishable by a fine, imprisonment up to 20 years, or both), 2252(a)(2), (4) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both.); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

²⁴ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(4) states, however, that “[i]n a prosecution under this section, it is not necessary for the prosecution to show that an act described in chapter 15 [Children and vulnerable adults], 61 [Rape] or 66 [Sex crimes], title 18, Idaho Code, actually occurred.”

child pornography and solicitation of minors for pornography, prostitution or sex-related offenses.” Idaho Code Ann. § 67-1410(1, 2).

2.6 *No age mistake defense is permitted for a buyer of commercial sex acts with any minor under 18.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) and Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution—penalties are silent on the availability of a defense based on age mistake. Moreover, the defense of age mistake is irrelevant to a violation of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614(1) (Patronizing a prostitute) because the illegality of the conduct criminalized under that statute does not depend on the age of the prostituted victim.

2.6.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) and Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution—penalties) to expressly prohibit the defense of age mistake.

2.7 *Base penalties for buying sex acts with a minor under 18 are sufficiently high and not reduced for older minors.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking definition) does not apply different penalties if the trafficking victim is a child instead of an adult.²⁵ A conviction is punishable as a felony by “imprisonment in the state prison for not more than twenty-five (25) years unless a more severe penalty is otherwise prescribed by law,” and a possible fine of \$50,000 regardless of whether the person trafficked is a child or an adult. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-8603, 18-112A.

Under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution—Penalties), penalties do not differ based on the minors’ age, making convicted offenders subject to 2 years to life imprisonment. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(1).

2.8 *Financial penalties for buyers of commercial sex acts with minors are sufficiently high to make it difficult for buyers to hide the crime.*

Buyers may have to pay fines and restitution. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties) provides the penalties for human trafficking offenses and includes a possible fine of \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-8603, 18-112A. If convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(1) (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution), buyers face a fine up to 50,000, and a buyer convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction)also faces a possible fine of up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5610(1), 18-1509A(2), 18-112A. Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1) (Fines—reimbursements—priority—disposition) provides that persons convicted of any crime also have to pay an additional fine or reimbursement²⁶ of at least \$75.00 per felony count, \$37.00 per misdemeanor count, and at least \$300.00 per sex offense count.²⁷ Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1)(a)–(c).

²⁵ See *supra* Section 1.1 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602 and § 18-8603.

²⁶ Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1) states that the court shall impose these fines unless “the defendant is indigent and at the time of sentencing shows good cause for inability to pay and written findings to that effect are entered by the court.”

²⁷ Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1)(c), the \$300 fine applies to “any sex offense, including, but not limited to, offenses pursuant to sections 18-1506 [Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years], 18-1507 [Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties], 18-1508 [Lewd conduct with minor child under sixteen], 18-1508A [Sexual battery of a minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age], 18-6101 [Rape defined], 18-6108 [Male rape], 18-6605 [Crime against nature—Punishment] and 18-6608 [Forcible sexual penetration by use of foreign object], Idaho Code.”

Asset forfeiture is generally not an available remedy in Idaho against buyers. Instead, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-314 (Property of convict not forfeited) provides,

No conviction of any person for crime works any forfeiture of any property, except in cases in which a forfeiture is expressly imposed by law; and all forfeitures to the people of this state, in the nature of a deodand, or where any person shall flee from justice, are abolished.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties [for human trafficking offenses]), Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5610(1) (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution) and § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) do not expressly authorize forfeiture of a defendant’s property.

The court has the discretion to order a convicted buyer to make restitution to the victim. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims) states,

Unless the court determines that an order of restitution would be inappropriate or undesirable, it shall order a defendant found guilty of any crime²⁸ which results in an economic loss²⁹ to the victim³⁰ to make restitution to the victim. An order of restitution shall be a separate written order in addition to any other sentence the court may impose, including incarceration, and may be complete, partial, or nominal. The court may also include restitution as a term and condition of judgment of conviction; however, if a court orders restitution in the judgment of conviction and in a separate written order, a defendant shall not be required to make restitution in an amount beyond that authorized by this chapter. Restitution shall be ordered for any economic loss which the victim actually suffers. The existence of a policy of insurance covering the victim’s loss shall not absolve the defendant of the obligation to pay restitution.

If a buyer is convicted of certain sex offenses or possessing or accessing child pornography, the court also has discretion to order restitution under Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(6) which states, “Unless the court determines that an order of restitution would be inappropriate or undesirable, it shall order any person subject to the provisions of this section to pay restitution to help offset costs incurred by law enforcement agencies for the expense of DNA analysis.” Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(7), “The court may order such person to pay restitution for DNA analysis in an amount not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500) per DNA sample analysis, or in the aggregate not more than two thousand dollars (\$2,000). . . .” Subsections (1) and (2) include the following offenses: Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506 (Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years), § 18-1507 (Definitions—Sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-1508 (Lewd conduct with minor child under sixteen), 18-1508A (Sexual battery of a minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age), 18-1509 (Enticing a child), 18-1509A (Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device).

²⁸ Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(1)(b) defines “found guilty of any crime” as “a finding by a court that a defendant has committed a criminal act and shall include an entry of a plea of guilty, an order withholding judgment, suspending sentence, or entry of judgment of conviction for a misdemeanor or felony.”

²⁹ Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(1)(a) states,

“Economic loss” includes, but is not limited to, the value of property taken, destroyed, broken, or otherwise harmed, lost wages, and direct out-of-pocket losses or expenses, such as medical expenses resulting from the criminal conduct, but does not include less tangible damage such as pain and suffering, wrongful death or emotional distress.

³⁰ Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(1)(e)(i) defines a “victim” in part as “[t]he directly injured victim which means a person or entity, who suffers economic loss or injury as the result of the defendant’s criminal conduct and shall also include the immediate family of a minor and the immediate family of the actual victim in homicide cases.”

- 2.8.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties) for sex trafficking offenses, § 18-5610(1) (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution) and § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) to expressly require buyers to forfeit property used in or acquired by committing the crime.

2.9 *Buying and possessing child pornography carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Idaho prohibits the possession of child pornography. Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties),

- (2) A person commits sexual exploitation of a child³¹ if he knowingly and willfully:
(a) Possesses or accesses through any means including, but not limited to, the internet, any sexually exploitative material; or

-
(3) The sexual exploitation of a child pursuant to subsection (2)(a) of this section is a felony and shall be punishable by imprisonment in the state prison for a period not to exceed ten (10) years or by a fine not to exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000), or by both such imprisonment and fine.

....

In comparison, a federal conviction for possession of child pornography³² is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³³ Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.³⁴

2.10 *Convicted buyers of commercial sex acts with minors and child pornography are required to register as sex offenders.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8306(2), (3) (Notice of duty to register and initial registration) provides,

- (2) A person convicted of an offense identified in section 18-8304, Idaho Code, and released on probation without a sentence of incarceration in a county jail or correctional facility, including release pursuant to a withheld judgment or release from any mental institution, shall be notified by the

³¹ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(1)(b) defines a “child” as “a person who is less than eighteen (18) years of age.”

³² 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(2), (a)(4) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2)–(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a), (b) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

³³ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(2) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (a)(4) is punishable by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

³⁴ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years, but if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(4), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 10–20 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); *see also* 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

sentencing court of the duty to register pursuant to the provisions of this chapter and the offender shall register in accordance with this chapter no later than two (2) working days after sentence is imposed or judgment is withheld. . . .

(3) With respect to an offender convicted of a sexual offense identified in section 18-8304, Idaho Code, and sentenced to a period of immediate incarceration in a jail or correctional facility and subsequently released, placed on probation, or paroled, the department of correction or jail shall provide, prior to release from confinement, written notification of the duty to register and the offender shall register prior to his or her release. . . .

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8304(1)(a) (Application of chapter—rulemaking authority) states,

The provisions of this chapter shall apply to any person who:

(a) On or after July 1, 1993, is convicted of the crime, or an attempt, a solicitation, or a conspiracy to commit a crime provided for in section . . . 18-1506 (Sexual abuse of a child under sixteen years of age), . . . 18-1507 [Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties], 18-1508 (Lewd conduct with a minor child), 18-1508A (Sexual battery of a minor child sixteen or seventeen years of age), 18-1509A [Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction], . . . 18-5610 (Utilizing a person under eighteen years of age for prostitution), . . . or 18-8602(1), Idaho Code, (Sex trafficking).

Buyers convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5614(1) (Patronizing a prostitute) are not required to register as sex offenders, even when the person with whom sex is purchased is a minor.

Legal Components:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*
- 3.2 *Creating and distributing child pornography carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*
- 3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*
- 3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*
- 3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*
- 3.6 *Laws relating to termination of parental rights for certain offenses include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses in order to remove the children of traffickers from their control and potential exploitation.*

Legal Analysis:

- 3.1 *Penalties for trafficking a child for sexual exploitation are as high as federal penalties.*

A trafficker who commits human trafficking³⁵ while violating Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-1509A (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction), § 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child for adoption or other purpose penalized), § 18-7804 (Prohibited activities), or any of the crimes in Idaho Code Ann. chapter 56 (Prostitution) of title 18 “shall be punished by imprisonment in the state prison for not more than twenty-five (25) years unless a more severe penalty is otherwise prescribed by law.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603.

A trafficker also may be punished under Idaho’s CSEC laws. A conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution) is a felony conviction punishable by 2 years to life imprisonment, a fine up to \$50,000, or both a conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(2)(a) (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years in state prison, a fine up to \$10,000, or both; a conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(2)(b), (c) (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 30 years in state prison, a fine up to \$50,000, or both; and a conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 15 years and a possible fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5609, 18-1509A(1), (2), 18-112A.

Traffickers who “sell or barter any child for adoption or for any other purpose” may be convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child for adoption or other purpose penalized). A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 14 years in the state penitentiary, a fine up to \$5,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511.

Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201 (Money laundering and illegal investment—Penalty—Restitution) makes it illegal for a person to engage in a financial transaction that furthers racketeering, stating,

³⁵ See *supra* Section 1.1 for the definition of “human trafficking” in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602.

- (1) It is unlawful for any person to knowingly or intentionally give, sell, transfer, trade, invest, conceal, transport, or make available anything of value that the person knows is intended to be used to commit or further a pattern of racketeering activity
- (2) It is unlawful for any person to knowingly or intentionally direct, plan, organize, initiate, finance, manage, supervise, or facilitate the transportation or transfer of proceeds known by that person to be derived from a pattern of racketeering activity
- (3) It is unlawful for any person to knowingly or intentionally conduct a financial transaction involving proceeds known by that person to be derived from a pattern of racketeering activity . . . if the transaction is designed in whole or in part to conceal or disguise the nature, location, source, ownership, or control of the proceeds, or to avoid a transaction reporting requirement under state or federal law.

A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine up to of the greater of \$250,000 or “twice the value of the property involved in the transaction,” or both imprisonment and fine. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(4).

Traffickers also face enhanced penalties under Idaho Code Ann. title 18, chapter 85 (Idaho Criminal Gang Enforcement Act)³⁶, which provides for an additional penalty for felonies or misdemeanors enumerated in section 18-8502(3). Included among the offenses listed in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8502(3) (Definitions) are Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602 (Human trafficking defined), § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), § 18-5602 (Procurement), § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement), § 18-5604 (Paying for procurement), § 18-5605 (Detention for prostitution), § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute), § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes), § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), § 18-5613 (Prostitution), § 18-5614 (Patronizing a prostitute), § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-7804 (Prohibited activities), and § 18-8201 (Money laundering and illegal investment).

Idaho Code Ann. §18-8503(1), creates the following additional penalties, to be added to sentences for the above offenses:

- (a) Any adult . . . who is convicted of a misdemeanor shall be punished by an additional term of imprisonment in the county jail for not more than one (1) year.
- (b) Any adult . . . who is convicted of a felony shall be punished by an extended term of not less than two (2) years and not more than five (5) years in prison.
- (c) If the underlying offense described in section 18-8502(3), Idaho Code, is a felony and committed on the grounds of, or within one thousand (1,000) feet of, a public or private elementary, secondary or vocational school during hours when the facility is open for classes or school-related programs or when minors are using the facility, the extended term shall be not less than two (2) years and not more than five (5) years in prison.

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA)³⁷ for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense³⁸ against a minor.

³⁶ See *supra* Section 1.4 for discussion of the applicable provisions of Idaho Code Ann. title 18, chapter 85.

³⁷ See *supra* note 20.

³⁸ See *supra* note 21.

3.2 *Creating and distributing child pornography carries penalties as high as similar federal offenses.*

Creating and distributing child pornography is illegal under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 which states,

(2) A person commits sexual exploitation of a child³⁹ if he knowingly and willfully:

....

(c) Promotes, prepares, publishes, produces, makes, finances, offers, exhibits, or advertises any sexually exploitative material; or

(d) Distributes through any means including, but not limited to, mail, physical delivery or exchange, use of a computer or any other electronic or digital method, any sexually exploitative material.

Distribution of sexually exploitative material does not require a pecuniary transaction or exchange of interests in order to complete the offense.

....

(4) The sexual exploitation of a child pursuant to subsections (2)(b), (c) and (d) of this section is a felony and shall be punishable by imprisonment in the state prison for a term not to exceed thirty (30) years or by a fine not to exceed fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000) or by both such fine and imprisonment.

....

In comparison, if the victim is under the age of 14, a conviction under the TVPA for child sex trafficking is punishable by 15 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(1), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). If the victim is between the ages of 14–17, a conviction is punishable by 10 years to life imprisonment and a fine not to exceed \$250,000. 18 U.S.C. §§ 1591(b)(2), 3559(a)(1), 3571(b)(3). A conviction is punishable by mandatory life imprisonment, however, if the trafficker has a prior conviction for a federal sex offense⁴⁰ against a minor. Additionally, a federal conviction for distribution of child pornography⁴¹ is generally punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.⁴² Subsequent convictions, however, are punishable by imprisonment up to 40 years and a fine not to exceed \$250,000.⁴³

3.3 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to lure, entice, recruit or sell commercial sex acts with a minor is a separate crime or results in an enhanced penalty for traffickers.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) makes it a crime to use the Internet or electronic communications to lure or entice a person under the age of 16 to engage in a sexual act; however, the statute has limited applicability to

³⁹ See supra note 4.

⁴⁰ See supra note 21.

⁴¹ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material involving the sexual exploitation of minors), 2252A(a)(2), (a)(3) (Certain activities relating to material constituting or containing child pornography), 1466A(a) (Obscene visual representations of the sexual abuse of children).

⁴² 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 2252A(b)(1) (a conviction is punishable by imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that a conviction under subsection (a) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(1),” imprisonment for 5–20 years and a fine, while a conviction under subsection (b) is “subject to the penalties provided in section 2252A(b)(2),” imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine, or both); see also 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

⁴³ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2252(b) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(1), (a)(2), or (a)(3) or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 2252A(b)(1) (stating if a person has a prior conviction under subsection (a)(2), (a)(3), or a list of other statutes, a conviction is punishable by a fine and imprisonment for 15–40 years), 1466A(a), (b) (stating that the penalty scheme for section 2252A(b) applies); see also 18 U.S.C. §§ 3559(a)(1) (classifying all of the above listed offenses as felonies), 3571(b)(3) (providing a fine up to \$250,000 for any felony conviction).

traffickers, as it only applies to offenders who attempt to have the person “engage in any sexual act with or against the person where such act is a violation of chapter 15 [Children and vulnerable adults], 61 [Rape] or 66 [Sex crimes], title 18, Idaho Code.”⁴⁴ This statute likely applies to traffickers who use the Internet with the intent to commit a violation of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties). A conviction under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(1) is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 15 years and a possible fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-1509A(1), (2), 18-112A.

In addition, Idaho has established a special Internet Crimes Against Children Unit under the Attorney General. The unit “shall have the authority and responsibility to conduct a statewide program for the investigation and prosecution of violations of all applicable Idaho laws that involve or are directly related to child pornography and solicitation of minors for pornography, prostitution or sex-related offenses.” Idaho Code Ann. § 67-1410(1-2).

3.4 *Financial penalties for traffickers, including asset forfeiture, are sufficiently high.*

Traffickers may be subject to fines, restitution, and forfeiture. A trafficker convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602 (Human trafficking defined) or § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) may be subject to a fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-8603, 18-1509A(2), 18-112A. A trafficker convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution) or § 18-1507(23) (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties) may be required to pay a fine up to \$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5609, 18-1507(4). A trafficker convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), § 18-5602 (Procurement), § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement), § 18-5604 (Paying for procurement), § 18-5605 (Detention for prostitution), § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute), or § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes) may be required to pay a fine of \$1,000–\$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5601, to -5606, 18-5608. A trafficker convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511 (Sale or barter of child for adoption or other purpose penalized) may be required to pay a fine up to \$5,000. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1511.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-314 (Property of convict not forfeited)⁴⁵ limits the availability of asset forfeiture to where it is expressly authorized by law, however, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5612 (Property subject to criminal forfeiture) subjects traffickers convicted under the age-neutral offense of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5602 (Procurement definition and penalty)⁴⁶ or the CSEC offense under § 18-5609 (Inducing persons under 18 into prostitution—Penalties) to asset forfeiture. Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5612 (Property subject to criminal forfeiture),

(1) Any person who is found guilty of, who enters a plea of guilty or who is convicted of a violation of section 18-5602 [Procurement definition and penalty] or 18-5609 [Inducing persons under 18 into prostitution—Penalties], Idaho Code, no matter the form of the judgment or order withholding judgment, shall forfeit to the state of Idaho:

(a) Any property constituting, or derived from, any proceeds the person obtained directly or indirectly as the result of such violation; and

⁴⁴ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(4) states that “[i]n a prosecution under this section, it is not necessary for the prosecution to show that an act described in chapter 15, 61 or 66, title 18, Idaho Code, actually occurred.

⁴⁵ See *supra* section 2.8 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-314 (Property of convict not forfeited).

⁴⁶ Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5602 (Procurement -- definition and penalty),

Any person who induces, compels, entices, or procures another person to engage in acts as a prostitute shall be guilty of a felony punishable by imprisonment for a period of not less than two (2) years nor more than twenty (20) years, or by a fine of not less than one thousand dollars (\$1,000) nor more than fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000), or by both such fine and imprisonment.

- (b) Any of the person's property used, or intended to be used, in any manner or part to commit or to facilitate the commission of such violation.
- (2) The court, in imposing sentence on such person as described in subsection (1) of this section, shall order, in addition to any other sentence imposed, that the person forfeit to the state of Idaho all property described in this section. The provisions of this chapter shall not be construed in any manner to prevent the state of Idaho, the attorney general or the appropriate prosecuting attorney from requesting restitution pursuant to section 19-5304, Idaho Code. The issue of criminal forfeiture shall be for the court alone, without submission to a jury, as a part of the sentencing procedure within the criminal action.

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5618⁴⁷ (Property subject to forfeiture),

Property subject to criminal forfeiture under this chapter includes:

- (1) "Real property" including things growing on, affixed to or found on the land; and
- (2) "Tangible and intangible personal property" including rights, privileges, interests, claims and securities.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5620 (Forfeiture request—rebuttable presumption) provides in part,

There is a rebuttable presumption that any property of a person subject to the provisions of section 18-5612, Idaho Code, is subject to forfeiture under this chapter if the state of Idaho establishes by a preponderance of the evidence that:

- (1) The property was acquired by a person during the period of the violation of either section 18-5609 (inducing a person under eighteen years of age into prostitution) or section 18-5602 (procurement), Idaho Code, or within a reasonable time after such violation; and
- (2) There was no likely source for such property other than the violation of either section 18-5609 (inducing a person under eighteen years of age into prostitution) or section 18-5602 (procurement), Idaho Code.

Traffickers' assets may also be forfeited if deemed a moral nuisance; real property deemed a moral nuisance may be forfeited temporarily while personal property and monies deemed a moral nuisance may be forfeited permanently. Idaho Code Ann. § 52-406 (Right to possession of real property and personal property after hearing on the temporary injunction—Conditions for avoidance of temporary forfeiture) authorizes the court to "declare a temporary forfeiture of the use of the real property upon which [a] public nuisance is located and the personal property located therein" where allegations complaining of a moral nuisance are supported by clear and convincing evidence. Idaho Code Ann. § 52-104(F) (Moral nuisances—types) expressly declares that "[e]very place which, as a regular course of business, is used for the purposes of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, and every such place in or upon which acts of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, are held or occur," is a moral nuisance.⁴⁸ Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 52-415 (Civil penalty—Forfeiture—Accounting—Lien as to expenses of abatement) states,

⁴⁷ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5618(1) defines property as including "things growing on, affixed to or found on the land." Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5618(2) defines "tangible and intangible personal property" as including "rights, privileges, interests, claims and securities."

⁴⁸ Idaho Code Ann. § 52-103(E) (Moral nuisance—definitions) defines a "moral nuisance" as "a nuisance which is injurious to public morals." Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 52-104 (Moral nuisances – types)

The following are declared to be moral nuisances:

- (A) Any and every place in the state where lewd films are publicly exhibited as a regular course of business, or possessed for the purpose of such exhibition;

All personal property declared to be a moral nuisance . . . and all monies and other considerations declared to be a moral nuisance . . . are the subject of forfeiture to the local government and are recoverable as damages in the county wherein such matter is sold, exhibited or otherwise used. Such monies may be traced to and shall be recoverable from persons who, under section 52-405 [Notice of hearing on temporary injunction—Consolidation], Idaho Code, have knowledge of the nuisance at the time such monies are received by them.

A trafficker convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201 (Money laundering and illegal investment) may be ordered to pay a fine up to the greater of \$250,000 or “twice the value of the property involved in the transaction.” Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-7804(e), 18-8201(4). Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1) (Fines) provides that a trafficker convicted of any crime also may have to pay an additional fine or reimbursement of \$37.00 per misdemeanor count, at least \$75.00 per felony count, and at least \$300.00 per sex offense count.⁴⁹

A court is required to order that traffickers to pay restitution to the victims of human trafficking. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8604(1), (2) (Restitution—rehabilitation) provides,

- (1) In addition to any other amount of loss resulting from a human trafficking violation, the court shall order restitution, as applicable, including the greater of:
 - (a) The gross income or value to the defendant of the victim’s labor or services; or
 - (b) The value of the victim’s labor as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the federal fair labor standards act.
- (2) In addition to any order for restitution as provided in this section, the court shall order the defendant to pay an amount determined by the court to be necessary for the mental and physical rehabilitation of the victim or victims.

A trafficker convicted of any other crime also may be required to make restitution to the victims at the court’s discretion. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims) requires the court to order a defendant to make restitution where the crime resulted in an economic loss⁵⁰ to the victim, unless restitution is determined to be “inappropriate or undesirable.”⁵¹ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(5) (Money laundering and illegal investment) further authorizes the court to “order restitution for all costs and expenses of prosecution and investigation,” where a trafficker is convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(1)–(3).

Traffickers convicted of certain offenses will also be subject to discretionary restitution under Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(6) which states, “Unless the court determines that an order of restitution would be inappropriate or

-
- (B) Any and every place in the state where a lewd film is publicly and repeatedly exhibited, or possessed for the purpose of such exhibition;
 - (C) Any and every lewd film which is publicly exhibited, or possessed for such purpose at a place which is a moral nuisance under this section;
 - (D) Any and every place of business in the state in which lewd publications constitute a principal part of the stock in trade;
 - (E) Any and every lewd publication possessed at a place which is a moral nuisance under this section; and
 - (F) Every place which, as a regular course of business, is used for the purposes of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, and every such place in or upon which acts of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, are held or occur.

⁴⁹ See *supra* note 27 for the applicable sex offenses.

⁵⁰ See *supra* note 29 for the definition of “economic loss.”

⁵¹ See *supra* section 2.8 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims).

undesirable, it shall order any person subject to the provisions of this section to pay restitution to help offset costs incurred by law enforcement agencies for the expense of DNA analysis.” Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(7), “The court may order such person to pay restitution for DNA analysis in an amount not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500) per DNA sample analysis, or in the aggregate not more than two thousand dollars (\$2,000). . . .” Subsections (1) and (2) include the following offenses: Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—Sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-1509 (Enticing a child), § 18-1509A (Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device), § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), and § 18-5609 (Inducing a minor into prostitution).

3.5 *Convicted traffickers are required to register as sex offenders.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8306(2), (3) (Notice of duty to register and initial registration) requires those convicted of offenses listed in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8304 (Applicability of chapter) to register as sex offenders.⁵² Included among the offenses listed in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8304(1)(a) are Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined), § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device), § 18-5605 (Detention for prostitution).

3.6 *Laws relating to termination of parental rights for certain offenses include sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses in order to remove the children of traffickers from their control and potential exploitation.*

Convictions under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) or Idaho’s CSEC laws are not listed as grounds for terminating parental rights in Idaho. The only relevant provisions in Idaho Code Ann. § 16-2005(1)–(3) (Conditions under which termination may be granted) that may be used to terminate the relationship between a trafficker and a child include when it is in the child’s best interest and “[t]he parent has neglected or abused the child” or “has been incarcerated and is likely to remain incarcerated for a substantial period of time during the child’s minority.” Idaho Code Ann. § 16-2005(1)(b), (e). The court may presume it is in the best interests of the child to terminate the relationship if the parent has abandoned, caused chronic abuse or neglect in an extreme or repetitious manner, which would place the child in an unacceptable risk. Sexual abuse, torture, or battery against the child, are also factors that can enable termination of a parental rights. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-2005(2)(b). Idaho Code Ann. § 16-2005(2)(b). Finally, pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-2005(3), “[t]he court may grant an order terminating the relationship if termination is found to be in the best interest of the parent and child.”

⁵² See *supra* Section 2.10 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8306.

Legal Components:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*
- 4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*
- 4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*
- 4.4 *Promoting and selling child pornography is illegal.*

Legal Analysis:

- 4.1 *The acts of assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from child sex trafficking are included as criminal offenses in the state sex trafficking statute.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) does not expressly criminalize assisting, enabling, or financially benefitting from domestic minor sex trafficking, stating instead that “‘human trafficking’ means: (1) Sex trafficking . . . in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained eighteen (18) years of age.” Additionally, no CSEC laws include the acts of facilitators. However, other laws related to prostitution may be used to prosecute facilitators.

A facilitator may be convicted under several Idaho prostitution laws, all of which are punishable as felonies by imprisonment for 2–20 years, a \$1,000–\$50,000 fine, or both. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5603, 18-5604, 18-5606, 18-5608. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement) applies to a facilitator “who knowingly receives money or any object of value to procure a prostitute.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5604 (Paying for procurement) applies to a facilitator “who pays another money or any object of value to procure a third person to engage in prostitution.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute) applies to a facilitator “who shall knowingly accept or appropriate any money or item of value from the proceeds or earnings of any person engaged in prostitution as part of a joint venture⁵³ with such person.” Lastly, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes) applies to a facilitator “maintaining, controlling or supporting a house of prostitution.”

Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201 (Money laundering and illegal investment) separately makes it illegal for a facilitator to knowingly engage in certain financial transactions that further racketeering.⁵⁴ A conviction under this statute is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 10 years, a fine of the greater of up to \$250,000 or “twice the value of the property involved in the transaction,” or both fine and imprisonment. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(4).

- 4.1.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) to include anyone who knowingly assists, enables, or financially benefits from human trafficking.

⁵³ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5606(2) defines “joint venture” as “an undertaking by two (2) or more persons jointly to carry out a single business enterprise involving one or more transactions for profit. Such joint venture can be created by oral agreement or may be inferred from acts or conduct.”

⁵⁴ See *supra* Section 3.1 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201.

4.2 *Financial penalties, including asset forfeiture laws, are in place for those who benefit financially from or aid and assist in committing domestic minor sex trafficking.*

Facilitators may be subject to fines, restitution, forfeiture, and civil damages. A facilitator convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5603 (Receiving pay for procurement), §18-5604 (Paying for procurement), § 18-5606(1) (Accepting earnings of prostitute), or § 18-5608 (Harboring prostitutes) may be required to pay a fine of \$1,000–\$50,000. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5604, 18-5603, 18-5606, 18-5608.

A facilitator convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(4) (Money laundering and illegal investment) may be ordered to pay a fine of the greater of up to \$250,000 or “twice the value of the property involved in the transaction.” Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-7804(e), 18-8201(4). Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1025(1) (Fines) provides that a facilitator convicted of any crime also may have to pay an additional fine or reimbursement of \$37.00 per misdemeanor count, at least \$75.00 per felony count, and at least \$300.00 per sex offense account.⁵⁵

Facilitators convicted of any crime may be required to make restitution to their victims, at the discretion of the court. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims) requires the court to order a defendant to make restitution when the crime resulted in an economic loss⁵⁶ to the victim, unless the court determines that restitution is “inappropriate or undesirable.”⁵⁷ Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(5) (Money laundering and illegal investment) further authorizes the court to “order restitution for all costs and expenses of prosecution and investigation,” if a facilitator is convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8201(1)–(3).

Restitution may also be ordered under Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(6) which states, “Unless the court determines that an order of restitution would be inappropriate or undesirable, it shall order any person subject to the provisions of this section to pay restitution to help offset costs incurred by law enforcement agencies for the expense of DNA analysis.” Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5506(7), “The court may order such person to pay restitution for DNA analysis in an amount not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500) per DNA sample analysis, or in the aggregate not more than two thousand dollars (\$2,000). . . .” Subsections (1) and (2) include the following offenses: Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—Sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-1509 (Enticing a child), § 18-1509A (Enticing a child through use of the internet or other communication device), § 18-5601 (Interstate trafficking in prostitution), and § 18-5609 (Inducing a minor into prostitution).

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-314 (Property of convict not forfeited)⁵⁸ limits the availability of asset forfeiture to when it is expressly authorized by law. Most of the laws under which facilitators may be prosecuted do not expressly authorize asset forfeiture. However facilitators may face forfeiture of assets deemed a moral nuisance under Idaho Code Ann. § 52-406 (Right to possession of real property and personal property after hearing on the temporary injunction) which authorizes the court to “declare a temporary forfeiture of the use of the real property upon which [a] public nuisance is located and the personal property located therein” if allegations complaining of a moral nuisance⁵⁹ are supported by “clear and convincing evidence.” Idaho Code Ann. § 52-104(F) (Moral nuisances—types) expressly declares that “[e]very place which, as a regular course of business, is used for the purposes of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, and every such place in or upon which acts of lewdness, assignation, or prostitution, are held or occur” is a moral nuisance. Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 52-415 (Civil penalty) states in part,

⁵⁵ See *supra* note 27 for the applicable sex offenses.

⁵⁶ See *supra* note 29 for the definition of “economic loss.”

⁵⁷ See *supra* Section 2.8 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. §19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims).

⁵⁸ See *supra* Section 2.8 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-314 (Property of convict not forfeited).

⁵⁹ See *supra* note 48 for the definition of “moral nuisance.”

All personal property declared to be a moral nuisance . . . and all monies and other considerations declared to be a moral nuisance . . . are the subject of forfeiture to the local government and are recoverable as damages in the county wherein such matter is sold, exhibited or otherwise used. Such monies may be traced to and shall be recoverable from persons who, under section 52-405 [Notice of hearing on temporary injunction—consolidation], Idaho Code, have knowledge of the nuisance at the time such monies are received by them.

4.3 *Promoting and selling child sex tourism is illegal.*

Idaho does not specifically prohibit sex tourism.

- 4.3.1 Recommendation: Enact a law that specifically prohibits selling or offering to sell travel services that include or facilitate travel for the purpose of engaging in commercial sexual exploitation of a minor or prostitution of a minor, if the offering, selling, or travel occurs in Idaho.

4.4 *Promoting and selling child pornography is illegal.*

Promoting and selling child pornography is illegal under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(2)(c) and (d) (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), which states,

(2) A person commits sexual exploitation of a child⁶⁰ if he knowingly and willfully:

....

(c) Promotes, prepares, publishes, produces, makes, finances, offers, exhibits, or advertises any sexually exploitative material; or

(d) Distributes through any means including, but not limited to, mail, physical delivery or exchange, use of a computer or any other electronic or digital method, any sexually exploitative material.

Distribution of sexually exploitative material does not require a pecuniary transaction or exchange of interests in order to complete the offense.

....

(4) The sexual exploitation of a child pursuant to subsections (2)(b), (c) and (d) of this section is a felony and shall be punishable by imprisonment in the state prison for a term not to exceed thirty (30) years or by a fine not to exceed fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000) or by both such fine and imprisonment.

....

⁶⁰ See supra note 4.

Legal Components:

- 5.1 *Statutorily-mandated victim services define “victim” to specifically include victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) to ensure prompt identification and access to victims’ rights and services.*
- 5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from raising consent of the minor to the commercial sex acts as a defense.*
- 5.3 *Prostitution laws apply only to adults, preventing criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*
- 5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*
- 5.5 *Commercial sexual exploitation is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*
- 5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*
- 5.7 *Crime victims’ compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) without regard to ineligibility factors.*
- 5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*
- 5.9 *Expungement or sealing of juvenile delinquency records resulting from arrests or adjudications for prostitution-related offenses committed as a result of, or in the course of, the commercial sexual exploitation of a minor is available within a reasonable time after turning 18.*
- 5.10 *Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.*
- 5.11 *Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened sufficiently to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.*

Legal Analysis:

- 5.1 *Statutorily-mandated victim services define “victim” to specifically include victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) to ensure prompt identification and access to victims’ rights and services.*

Commercially sexually exploited children are not specifically defined as victims in the Idaho Code. However, they may still satisfy other requirements that would qualify them as victims under the existing definitions in the Idaho Code. For example, in the context of crime victims compensation, Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1003(8) (Definitions) defines a “victim” as “a person who suffers injury⁶¹ or death as a result of: (a) Criminally injurious conduct; (b) His good faith effort to prevent criminally injurious conduct;⁶² or (c) His good faith effort to apprehend a person reasonably suspected of engaging in criminally injurious conduct.”

⁶¹ “Injury” is defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1003(7) as

actual bodily harm or disfigurement and, with respect to a victim, includes pregnancy, venereal disease, mental or nervous shock, or extreme mental distress. For the purposes of this chapter, ‘extreme mental distress’ means a substantial personal disorder of emotional processes, thought or cognition which impairs judgment, behavior or ability to cope with the ordinary demands of life.

⁶² “Criminally injurious conduct” is defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1003(4) as

intentional, knowing, or reckless conduct that:

Additionally, for the purposes of restitution under Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(e)(i) (Restitution for crime victims), a “victim” includes “[t]he directly injured victim which means a person or entity, who suffers economic loss⁶³ or injury as the result of the defendant’s criminal conduct and shall also include the immediate family of a minor and the immediate family of the actual victim in homicide cases.”

With respect to rights afforded to victims during the investigation and prosecution of a case, Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5306(5)(a) (Rights of victim during investigation, prosecution, and disposition of the crime) defines a “victim” as “an individual who suffers direct or threatened physical, financial or emotional harm as the result of the commission of a crime⁶⁴ or juvenile offense.”

5.1.1 Recommendation: Amend the Idaho Code to expressly define commercially sexually exploited children as victims.

5.2 *The state sex trafficking statute expressly prohibits a defendant from raising consent of the minor to the commercial sex acts as a defense.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined), § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), and § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) do not expressly prohibit a perpetrator from using the consent of a minor to a commercial sex act as a defense to the crime, although it appears from these statutes’ language that a consent defense would be inconsistent with these statutes.⁶⁵

5.2.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined), § 18-1507(1) (Definitions—Sexual exploitation of a child—penalties), § 18-5609 (Inducing person under eighteen years of age into prostitution), and § 18-1509A(1) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) to expressly eliminate a consent defense.

-
- (a) Occurs or is attempted in this state or occurs outside the state of Idaho against a resident of the state of Idaho and which occurred in a state which does not have a crime victims compensation program for which the victim is eligible as eligibility is set forth in this statute;
 - (b) Constitutes an act of terrorism as defined by 18 U.S.C. 2331, committed outside the United States against a resident of this state;
 - (c) Results in injury or death; and
 - (d) Is punishable by fine, imprisonment, or death or would be so punishable but for the fact that the person engaging in the conduct lacked capacity to commit the crime under the laws of this state. . . .

⁶³ “Economic loss” is defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(1)(a) as including, not exclusively, “the value of property taken, destroyed, broken, or otherwise harmed, lost wages, and direct out-of-pocket losses or expenses, such as medical expenses resulting from the criminal conduct, but does not include less tangible damage such as pain and suffering, wrongful death or emotional distress.”

⁶⁴ “Criminal offense” is defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5306(5)(b) as “any charged felony or a misdemeanor involving physical injury, or the threat of physical injury, or a sexual offense.”

⁶⁵ Senate Bill 1337, passed during the second regular session of the sixty-first legislature of the State of Idaho, 2012 Ida. Ch. 269, deleted the legislative findings contained in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507(1), which stated: “[t]he legislature hereby finds and declares that the commercial sexual exploitation of children constitute a wrongful invasion of the child’s right of privacy and results in social, developmental, and emotional injury to the child; that a child below the age of eighteen (18) years is incapable of giving informed consent to the use of his or her body for a commercial purpose; and that to protect children from commercial sexual exploitation it is necessary to prohibit the production for trade or commerce of material which involves or is derived from such exploitation and to exclude all such material from the channels of trade and commerce.”

5.3 *Prostitution laws apply only to adults, preventing criminalization of minors under 18 for prostitution offenses.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution) is not limited in applicability to adults and therefore renders minors subject to prosecution for prostitution offenses. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613(1) states instead,

A person is guilty of prostitution when he or she:

- (a) engages in or offers or agrees to engage in sexual conduct, or sexual contact with another person in return for a fee; or
- (b) is an inmate of a house of prostitution; or
- (c) loiters in or within view of any public place for the purpose of being hired to engage in sexual conduct or sexual contact.

A first or second conviction under this statute is a misdemeanor punishable by imprisonment up to 6 months in county jail, a fine up to \$1,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5613(2), 18-113(1). A third or subsequent conviction is punishable as a felony by imprisonment up to 5 years in the state prison, a fine up to \$50,000, or both. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 18-5613(2), 18-112.

- 5.3.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution) to eliminate liability for prostitution offenses for all minors under 18.

5.4 *State law provides a non-punitive avenue to specialized services through one or more points of entry.*

Child Initially Identified as Abused/Neglected

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(1)(b) (Definitions),⁶⁶ a sexually exploited child is likely to be identified as abused or neglected. However, even if a child is identified as abused or neglected under Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(1)(b), the definition of caregiver or “custodian” under Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(13) (Definitions)⁶⁷ is not sufficiently broad to involve Child Protective Services in investigations where the child is in the custody or control of a non-family trafficker.

I. Initial Custody

To the extent that a victim of child sex trafficking is identified as abused or neglected, the child may initially come to the attention of law enforcement or the Department of Health and Welfare through the filing of a mandatory report of abuse pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1605 (Reporting of abuse, abandonment or neglect).

a. Authority for Initial Custody

Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1605 (Reporting of abuse, abandonment or neglect) requires medical professionals, school employees, social workers, and any other persons “having reason to believe that a child under the age of eighteen (18) years has been abused,⁶⁸ abandoned or neglected or who observes” such conduct to report the incident to law enforcement or the department of health and welfare.

⁶⁶ See *infra* section 5.5 for a full analysis of the definition of “abuse” as it related to identification of sexually exploited children.

⁶⁷ See *infra* section 5.6 for a full analysis of the definition of “custodian.”

⁶⁸ Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(1)(b) (Definitions) defines “abused” to include situations where a child has been subjected to “[s]exual conduct, including rape, molestation, incest, prostitution, obscene or pornographic

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 32-11-201 (Initial child custody jurisdiction):

- (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 32-11-204, Idaho Code, a court of this state has jurisdiction to make an initial child custody determination only if:
- (1) This state is the home state of the child on the date of the commencement of the proceeding, or was the home state of the child within six (6) months before the commencement of the proceeding and the child is absent from this state but a parent or person acting as a parent continues to live in this state;
 - (2) A court of another state does not have jurisdiction under paragraph (1) of this subsection, or a court of the home state of the child has declined to exercise jurisdiction on the ground that this state is the more appropriate forum under section 32-11-207 or 32-11-208, Idaho Code, and:
 - (A) The child and the child's parents, or the child and at least one (1) parent or a person acting as a parent, have a significant connection with this state other than mere physical presence; and
 - (B) Substantial evidence is available in this state concerning the child's care, protection, training and personal relationships;
 - (3) All courts having jurisdiction under paragraph (1) or (2) of this subsection have declined to exercise jurisdiction on the ground that a court of this state is the more appropriate forum to determine the custody of the child under section 32-11-207 or 32-11-208, Idaho Code; or
 - (4) No court of any other state would have jurisdiction under the criteria specified in paragraph (1), (2) or (3) of this subsection.
- (b) Subsection (a) of this section is the exclusive jurisdictional basis for making a child custody determination by a court of this state.
- (c) Physical presence of, or personal jurisdiction over, a party or a child is not necessary or sufficient to make a child custody determination.

b. Placement: Where are the victims placed upon initial custody (immediate placement)?

Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1609(1) requires the law enforcement officer taking custody of the child to place the child in a “place of shelter.” According to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1608(1)(a) (Emergency removal),

A child may be taken into shelter care⁶⁹ by a peace officer without [a court] order . . . only where the child is endangered in his surroundings and prompt removal is necessary to prevent serious physical or mental injury⁷⁰ to the child or where the child is an abandoned child pursuant to the provisions of chapter 82 [Idaho safe haven act], title 39 [Health and safety], Idaho Code.

An officer must release a juvenile taken into custody “to his parent or other responsible adult upon written promise . . . to bring the juvenile to court at a stated time,” unless the court orders otherwise or it appears to the officer that releasing the juvenile would not be in the juvenile’s or society’s best interests. Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(2).

II. Process following initial custody:

photographing, filming or depiction for commercial purposes, or other similar forms of sexual exploitation harming or threatening the child’s health or welfare or mental injury to the child.”

⁶⁹ Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(33) defines “shelter care” as “places designated by the department for temporary care of children pending court disposition or placement.”

⁷⁰ Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(25) defines “mental injury” as “a substantial impairment in the intellectual or psychological ability of a child to function within a normal range of performance and/or behavior, for short or long terms.”

- a. Where is child referred after initial custody?

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(33) “shelter care” are “places designated by the department for temporary care of children pending court disposition or placement.”

- b. When/how does court assume jurisdiction?

Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1609(1) requires the law enforcement officer taking custody of the child to notify the court and the child’s parents and to place the child in a “place of shelter” for no more than 48 hours, during which a “shelter care hearing” must take place. The purpose and the goals of the shelter care hearing is

to decide whether a child should be placed in or remain in temporary shelter care pending the adjudicatory hearing under the Child Protective Act (CPA). The hearing is governed by Idaho Code §16-1615 and Idaho Juvenile Rule 39. The shelter care hearing is preliminary in nature and is not intended to resolve the substantive issues that will be addressed at the adjudicatory hearing. The court’s decision is comprised of two principal questions. First, a court at the shelter care hearing must determine whether there is reasonable cause to believe that the child is within the jurisdiction of the courts pursuant to the CPA. Second, if there is reasonable cause to believe the child is within the jurisdiction of the court, the court must then determine whether it is in the child’s best interests to remain in or be placed in a place of temporary shelter care pending the adjudicatory hearing. While there are other important areas of inquiry at a shelter care hearing, these two questions are the primary matters of focus.⁷¹

III. Placement process pending adjudication/investigation:

At the shelter care hearing, the court will determine whether the child will continue to be held in custody. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1615(1). Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1615(5),

If, upon the completion of the shelter care hearing, it is shown that:

- (a) A petition has been filed; and
- (b) There is reasonable cause to believe the child comes within the jurisdiction of the court under this chapter⁷² and either:
 - (i) The department made reasonable efforts to eliminate the need for shelter care but the efforts were unsuccessful; or
 - (ii) The department made reasonable efforts to eliminate the need for shelter care but was not able to safely provide preventive services; and
- (c) The child could not be placed in the temporary sole custody of a parent having joint legal or physical custody; and
- (d) It is contrary to the welfare of the child to remain in the home; and
- (e) It is in the best interests of the child to remain in temporary shelter care pending the conclusion of the adjudicatory hearing; or
- (f) There is reasonable cause to believe that the child comes within the jurisdiction of the court under this chapter, but a reasonable effort to prevent placement of the child outside the home could

⁷¹ Idaho Child Protection Manual, Chapter 4, Shelter Care, “4.1 Purpose and Goals of the Shelter Care Hearing,” page 35, Last Revised April 22, 2011. Available at: [HTTP://WWW.ISC.IDAHO.GOV/CHILDPROTECTION/MAIN.HTM](http://www.isc.idaho.gov/childprotection/main.htm)

⁷² Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1603(1) (Jurisdiction of the courts), a child comes within the court’s jurisdiction if the child is “neglected, abused or abandoned,” homeless, or if the child’s “parents or other legal custodian fails to provide a stable home environment.”

be affected by a protective order safeguarding the child's welfare and maintaining the child in his present surroundings;
the court shall issue, within twenty-four (24) hours of such hearing, an order of temporary legal custody and/or a protective order. . . .

IV. Adjudication or referral to alternate process:

If the court retains custody over the child, an adjudicatory hearing will be held within 30 days of the date the petition was filed. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1615(6). As long as the child is adjudicated to come within the court's jurisdiction,⁷³ pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1619(5) (Adjudicatory hearing), the court at the adjudicatory hearing may

- (a) Place the child under protective supervision in of the department for an indeterminate period not to exceed the child's eighteenth birthday; or
- (b) Vest legal custody in the department or other authorized agency subject to residual parental rights and subject to full judicial review by the court of all matters relating to the custody of the child by the department or other authorized agency.

V. Outcomes

a. Disposition

If the court decides to grant custody to the department, pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1619(6), it must

make detailed written findings based on facts in the record, that . . . continuation of residence in the home would be contrary to the welfare of the child and that vesting legal custody with the department or other authorized agency would be in the best interests of the child. . . . [and that] the department made reasonable efforts to prevent the placement of the child in foster care

If the court finds that reasonable efforts to reunify the child with one or both parents are not necessary because aggravating circumstances were present, the court must hold a permanency hearing within 30 days of the determination of aggravating circumstances. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1619(6). The department must prepare a permanency plan and file the permanency plan with the court at least five (5) days prior to the permanency hearing. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1620(1).

Child Initially Identified as Delinquent

Despite the protections above, domestic minor sex trafficking victims also may be dealt with under the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. title 20 (State prison and county jails), chapter 5 (Juvenile corrections act).

I. Initial Custody:

a. Authority for initial custody

Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(1) (Apprehension and release of juveniles—Detention) authorizes a peace officer to take a juvenile into custody without a court order

⁷³ See *supra* note 72 for cases in which the court has jurisdiction.

- (a) When he has reasonable cause to believe that the juvenile has committed an act which would be a misdemeanor or felony if committed by an adult; or
- (b) When in the presence of a peace officer or private citizen the juvenile has violated any local, state or federal law or municipal ordinance; or
- (c) When there are reasonable grounds to believe the juvenile has committed a status offense. Status offenses are truancy, running away from or being beyond the control of parents, guardian, or legal custodian and curfew violations.

Depending on whether the child has any prior convictions under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution), a commercially sexually exploited child could be considered to have committed either a misdemeanor or felony prostitution offense and may be taken into custody under Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516

(1).⁷⁴ Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(2) also authorizes a peace officer to take a juvenile into custody pursuant to a court order or warrant.

b. Placement

Placement options include parents, relatives, a foster or group home, a juvenile detention center, or a “community-based diversion program.” Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(4)(a)–(f).

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(1) (Apprehension and release of juveniles—Detention) status offenders shall not be placed in any jail facility but instead may be placed in juvenile shelter care facilities,⁷⁵ except in the case of runaways, when there is a specific detention request from a foreign jurisdiction to hold the juvenile pending transportation arrangements.

II. Process following initial custody:

a. Where is child referred after initial custody?

An officer must release a juvenile taken into custody “to his parent or other responsible adult upon written promise . . . to bring the juvenile to court at a stated time,” unless the court orders otherwise or it appears to the officer that releasing the juvenile would not be in the juvenile’s or society’s best interests. Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(2).

b. When/how does court assume jurisdiction?

If the child is not released, the court must hold a “detention hearing to determine where the juvenile will be placed until the next hearing” within 24 hours. Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(4).

III. Placement process pending adjudication/investigation:

a. Placement hearing i.e. shelter or detention hearing

Idaho Code Ann. § 20-510 (Information—Investigation—Petition) provides that the prosecuting attorney or a peace officer may file a petition with the court alleging the facts that bring the juvenile within the court’s jurisdiction. Before any petition is filed, however, the prosecuting attorney may refer the case directly “to the county probation officer or a community-based diversion program for informal probation and counseling” if the prosecutor decides court action is not required. Idaho Code Ann. § 20-511(1) (Diversion or informal

⁷⁴ See *supra* section 5.3 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613.

⁷⁵ See *supra* note 69 for the definition of “shelter care.”

disposition of the petition). If the diversion process is utilized, any statements made by a juvenile in a diversion proceeding are inadmissible as substantive evidence of guilt at an adjudicative proceeding on the underlying charge. Idaho Code Ann. § 20-511(1) (Diversion or informal disposition of the petition).

b. Placement Options

Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 20-516(4)(a)–(f), placement options include parents, relatives, a foster or group home, a juvenile detention center, or a “community-based diversion program.”

IV. Adjudication or referral to alternate process

a. Adjudicatory/dispositional hearing

If the juvenile denies the petition’s allegations, the court will hold an evidentiary hearing pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 20-519 (Evidentiary hearing).⁷⁶ Even if a petition is filed, if the juvenile offender admits the petition’s allegations, “the court may decide to make an informal adjustment of the petition.” Idaho Code Ann. § 20-511(2). Pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 20-511(2),

Informal adjustment can include, but is not limited to:

- (a) Reprimand of the juvenile offender;
- (b) Informal supervision with the probation department;
- (c) Community service work;
- (d) Restitution to the victim;
- (e) Participation in a community-based diversion program.

V. Outcomes

a. Disposition

There is a re-disposition hearing which takes place when a Child Protective Act (CPA) case is ongoing and the child is removed from his or her home after having been returned there pursuant to an order for protective supervision. In this type of case, the child has previously been found to be within the jurisdiction of the CPA. Idaho Code Ann. §16-1623 (2011). (Amended Disposition -- Removal During Protective Supervision).

If the juvenile denies the petition’s allegations, the court will hold an evidentiary hearing pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 20-519 (Evidentiary hearing), and if the court determines that the juvenile offender falls within the court’s jurisdiction,⁷⁷ Idaho Code Ann. § 20-520(1)⁷⁸ (Sentencing) authorizes the court to hold a sentencing hearing where it may

- (a) Place the juvenile offender on formal probation for a period not to exceed three (3) years from the date of the order, except the court may place a juvenile offender on formal probation for a period not to exceed the juvenile offender’s twenty-first birthday if the court finds that the juvenile offender has

⁷⁶ See *supra* note 72 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 20-505, which describes the types of juveniles over which the court has jurisdiction.

⁷⁷ See *supra* note 72 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 20-505, which describes the types of juveniles over which the court has jurisdiction.

⁷⁸ Here and elsewhere in this report that Idaho Code Ann § 20-520 is quoted or cited, it has been updated to reflect the amendments added by the passage of House Bill No. 61 and Senate Bill No. 1035. H.B. 61, 63rd Leg., 1st Reg. Sess. (Idaho 2015) (effective July 1, 2015); S.B. 1035, 63rd Leg, 1st Reg. Sess. (Idaho 2015) (effective July 1, 2015).

committed a crime of a sexual nature. If a juvenile offender is committed to the Idaho department of juvenile corrections pursuant to paragraph (r) of this subsection, the court may place the juvenile offender on probation from the date of sentencing up to three (3) years past the date of release from custody or the juvenile offender's twenty-first birthday, whichever occurs first; provided the court shall conduct a review hearing within thirty (30) days following release of the juvenile offender from the department of juvenile corrections in order to determine the conditions and term of such probation; ;

....

(c) Commit the juvenile offender to a period of detention, pursuant to this act, for a period of time not to exceed ninety (90) days for each unlawful or criminal act the juvenile offender is found to have committed, if the unlawful or criminal act would be a misdemeanor if committed by an adult, or where the juvenile offender has been adjudicated as an habitual status offender;

(d) If the juvenile offender has committed an unlawful or criminal act which would be a felony if committed by an adult, the court may commit the juvenile offender to detention for a period not to exceed one hundred eighty (180) days for each unlawful or criminal act;

....

(f) Commit the juvenile offender to detention and suspend the sentence on specific probationary conditions;

....

(h) The court may order that the juvenile offender be examined or treated by a physician, surgeon, psychiatrist or psychologist, or that he receive other special care, or that he submit to an alcohol or drug evaluation, if needed, and for such purposes may place the juvenile offender in a hospital or other suitable facility.

(r) Commit the juvenile offender to the legal custody of the department of juvenile corrections for an indeterminate period of time not to exceed the juvenile offender's nineteenth birthday, unless the custody review board determines that extended time in custody is necessary to address competency development, accountability, and community protection; provided however, that no juvenile offender shall remain in the custody of the department beyond the juvenile offender's twenty-first birthday. . . .

,⁷⁹

(s) Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, a court may not commit a juvenile offender under the age of ten (10) years to a period of detention or to the custody of the department of juvenile corrections for placement in secure confinement.

5.4.1 Recommendation: Enact a mandatory protective response for juvenile sex trafficking victims that provides an avenue to specialized services outside detention.

5.5 *Commercial sexual exploitation is identified as a type of abuse and neglect within child protection statutes.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(1)(b) (Definitions) identifies commercial sexual exploitation as child abuse. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(1)(b) specifies that “[s]exual conduct, including . . . prostitution, obscene or pornographic photographing, filming or depiction for commercial purposes, or other similar forms of sexual exploitation harming or threatening the child’s health or welfare or mental injury to the child” is considered abuse.

⁷⁹ Idaho Code Ann. § 20-520(1)(r) continues, “[j]uvenile offenders convicted as adults and placed in the dual custody of the department of juvenile corrections and the state board of correction under section 19-2601A, Idaho Code, are under the retained jurisdiction of the court and are not within the purview of the custody review board”

5.6 *The definition of “caregiver” or another related term in the child welfare statutes is not a barrier to a sex trafficked child accessing the protection of child welfare.*

Under Idaho Code Ann. title 16, chapter 16 (Child Protective Act), Idaho’s definition of “custodian” is too narrow to allow for child welfare intervention where the exploiter is not a person with legal custody of the child. Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(13) (Definitions) defines a “custodian” as “a person, other than a parent or legal guardian, to whom legal or joint legal custody of the child has been given by court order.”

5.6.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1602(13) (Definitions) to allow child welfare protection for juvenile sex trafficking victims irrespective of the perpetrator of the abuse.

5.7 *Crime victims’ compensation is specifically available to a child victim of sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) without regard to ineligibility factors.*

Crime victims compensation is not specifically available to victims of domestic minor sex trafficking, but under the Crime Victims Compensation Act, such victims still may receive compensation.

Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1002 (Legislative purpose and intent) explains that, in enacting the Crime Victims Compensation Act, it was the legislature’s intent to assist and compensate “those persons within the state who are innocent victims of criminal acts and who suffer injury or death. To this end, it is the legislature’s intention to provide compensation for injuries suffered as a direct result of the criminal acts of other persons.” As defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1003(8)(a) (Definitions), a “victim” is “a person who suffers injury or death as a result of . . . [c]riminally injurious conduct.” Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1003(4) defines “criminally injurious conduct” as

intentional, knowing, or reckless conduct that:

- (a) Occurs or is attempted in this state or occurs outside the state of Idaho against a resident of the state of Idaho and which occurred in a state which does not have a crime victims compensation program for which the victim is eligible as eligibility is set forth in this statute;
- (b) Constitutes an act of terrorism as defined by 18 U.S.C. 2331, committed outside the United States against a resident of this state;
- (c) Results in injury or death; and
- (d) Is punishable by fine, imprisonment, or death or would be so punishable but for the fact that the person engaging in the conduct lacked capacity to commit the crime under the laws of this state. . . .

The Crime Victims Compensation Act contains ineligibility criteria that could bar a domestic minor sex trafficking victim’s claim for compensation. Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1018 (Award of compensation) provides,

- (1) The commission shall award compensation benefits under this chapter, if satisfied by a preponderance of the evidence that the requirements for compensation have been met.
- (2) An award may be made whether or not any person is prosecuted or convicted. . . .
- (3) The commission may suspend the proceedings pending disposition of a criminal prosecution that has been commenced or is imminent and may make a tentative award under section 72-1017 [Tentative award of compensation], Idaho Code.

However, a victim will not receive compensation unless the crime was reported to law enforcement within 72 hours and an application for compensation was filed within 1 year of the crime’s occurrence, unless in either case good cause is shown. Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016(1), (3). Nothing in Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016 clarifies what is sufficient to constitute good cause.

Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016(4) (Limitations on awards) further requires victims to fully cooperate with law enforcement “in the apprehension and prosecution of the offender.” Additionally, if a domestic minor sex trafficking victim is convicted under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 (Prostitution) and sentenced to imprisonment, the minor will be unable to receive compensation, as Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016(6) prohibits incarcerated persons from receiving compensation. Additionally, victims who are deemed to have “contributed to the infliction of death or injury with respect to which the claim is made” may have the amount of compensation they are eligible to receive reduced “in proportion to what the commission finds to be the victim’s contribution.” Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016(7)(a). Finally, a child convicted for a third or subsequent violation of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-5613 may face a 50% reduction in the award for having “engaged in a felony.” Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016(7)(b).

5.7.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 72-1016 (Limitations on awards) to create exceptions for domestic minor sex trafficking victims to the listed criteria.

5.8 *Victim-friendly procedures and protections are provided in the trial process for minors under 18.*

Idaho does not specifically afford extra protections to domestic minor sex trafficking victims in its criminal justice procedures; however, domestic minor sex trafficking victims may avail themselves of protections available to crime victims generally.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8601 (Legislative intent) declares that the legislature intended to “assist and direct victims of such trafficking to available community resources.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8605 (Human trafficking victim protection) provides,

(1) The attorney general, in consultation with the department of health and welfare and the United States attorney’s office, shall, no later than July 1, 2007, issue a report outlining how existing victim and witness laws respond to the needs of human trafficking victims, and suggesting areas of improvement and modification.

(2) The department of health and welfare, in consultation with the attorney general, shall, no later than July 1, 2007, issue a report outlining how existing social service programs respond or fail to respond to the needs of human trafficking victims, and the interplay of such existing programs with federally-funded victim service programs, and suggesting areas of improvement or modification. Such inquiry shall include, but not be limited to, the ability of state programs and licensing bodies to recognize federal T nonimmigrant status for the purposes of benefits, programs and licenses.

Children who are crime victims or witnesses receive some special protections under Idaho’s laws. The Uniform Child Witness Testimony by Alternative Methods Act protects a child witness “under the age of thirteen (13) years who has been or will be called to testify in” any criminal or noncriminal case. Idaho Code Ann. §§ 9-1802(2), 9-1803. Idaho Code Ann. § 9-1805(1) (Standards for determining whether child witness’ testimony may be presented by alternative method) explains that in a criminal proceeding, a child witness may give testimony via an “alternative method”⁸⁰ only in certain circumstances. Idaho Code Ann. § 9-1805(1) states,

(a) A child witness’ testimony may be taken otherwise than in an open forum in the presence and full view of the finder of fact if the presiding officer finds by clear and convincing evidence that the child

⁸⁰ Idaho Code Ann. § 9-1802(1) (Definitions) defines “alternative method” as

a method by which a child witness testifies which does not include all of the following:

- (a) Having the child present in person in an open forum;
- (b) Having the child testify in the presence and full view of the finder of fact and presiding officer; and
- (c) Allowing all of the parties to be present, to participate and to view and be viewed by the child.

would suffer serious emotional trauma that would substantially impair the child's ability to communicate with the finder of fact if required to testify in the open forum.

(b) A child witness' testimony may be taken other than in a face-to-face confrontation between the child and a defendant if the presiding officer finds by clear and convincing evidence that the child would suffer serious emotional trauma that would substantially impair the child's ability to communicate with the finder of fact if required to be confronted face-to-face by the defendant.

In noncriminal proceedings, the child may give testimony via an alternative method where the "presiding officer finds by a preponderance of the evidence that presenting the testimony of the child by an alternative method is necessary to serve the best interests of the child or enable the child to communicate with the finder of fact." Idaho Code Ann. § 9-1805(2).

Idaho Code Ann. § 19-3023 (Child summoned as witness) further provides that where

a child is summoned as a witness in . . . any criminal matter, . . . parents, a counselor, friend or other person having a supportive relationship with the child shall be allowed to remain in the courtroom at the witness stand with the child during the child's testimony unless . . . the court finds that the defendant's constitutional right to a fair trial will be unduly prejudiced.

Other protections that are generally afforded to crime victims may be available to domestic minor sex trafficking victims. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5306(1) (Rights of victim during investigation, prosecution, and disposition of the crime) enumerates the rights of crime victims.⁸¹ Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5306(1) provides crime victims the rights to be

- (a) Treated with fairness, respect, dignity and privacy throughout the criminal justice process;
- (b) Permitted to be present at all criminal justice proceedings or juvenile proceedings including probation proceedings;
- (c) Entitled to a timely disposition of the case;
- (d) Given prior notification of trial court, appellate, probation and parole proceedings and, upon request, to information about the sentence, incarceration, placing on probation or release of the defendant;
- (e) Heard, upon request, at all criminal justice proceedings considering a plea of guilty, sentencing, incarceration, placing on probation or release of the defendant unless manifest injustice would result;
- (f) Afforded the opportunity to communicate with the prosecution in criminal or juvenile offenses, and be advised of any proposed plea agreement by the prosecuting attorney prior to entering into a plea agreement in criminal or juvenile offenses involving crimes of violence, sex crimes or crimes against children;
- (g) Allowed to refuse an interview, ex parte contact or other request by the defendant or any other person acting on behalf of the defendant, unless such request is authorized by law;
- (h) Consulted by the presentence investigator during the preparation of the presentence report and have included in that report a statement of the impact which the defendant's criminal conduct had upon the victim and shall be allowed to read, prior to the sentencing hearing, the presentence report relating to the crime. The victim shall maintain the confidentiality of the presentence report, and shall not disclose its contents to any person except statements made by the victim to the prosecuting attorney or the court;
- (i) Assured the expeditious return of any stolen or other personal property by law enforcement agencies when no longer needed as evidence;

⁸¹ Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5306(5)(a) (Rights of victim during investigation, prosecution, and disposition of the crime) defines "victim" as "an individual who suffers direct or threatened physical, financial or emotional harm as the result of the commission of a crime or juvenile offense."

(j) Notified whenever the defendant or suspect is released or escapes from custody. . . .

Additionally, if a victim of domestic minor sex trafficking is charged with a crime, the victim will benefit from the right to counsel for juveniles contained in Idaho Code Ann. § 20-514. The right may not be waived if “the juvenile is being adjudicated for commission of a crime of a sexual nature.” Idaho Code Ann. § 20-514(6)(c).

5.8.1. Recommendation: Amend the Uniform Child Witness Testimony by Alternative Methods Act to protect all children under the age of 18.

5.9 *Expungement or sealing of juvenile delinquency records resulting from arrests or adjudications for prostitution-related offenses committed as a result of, or in the course of, the commercial sexual exploitation of a minor is available within a reasonable time after turning 18.*⁸²

Idaho Code Ann. § 20-525A(1)–(3) (Expungement of record) provides,

- (1) Any person who has been adjudicated in a case under this act and found to be within the purview of the act for having committed a felony offense or having been committed to the department of juvenile corrections may, after the expiration of five (5) years from the date of termination of the continuing jurisdiction of the court, or, in case the juvenile offender was committed to the juvenile correctional center, five (5) years from the date of his release from the juvenile correctional center, or after reaching age eighteen (18) years, whichever occurs last, petition the court for the expungement of his record. . . .
- (2) Any person who has been adjudicated in a case under this act and found to be within the purview of the act for having committed misdemeanor or status offenses only and not having been committed to the department of juvenile corrections may, after the expiration of one (1) year from the date of termination of the continuing jurisdiction of the court or after reaching age eighteen (18) years, whichever occurs later, petition the court for the expungement of his record. . . .
- (3) In any case where the prosecuting attorney has elected to utilize the diversion process or the court orders an informal adjustment pursuant to section 20-511, Idaho Code, the person may, after the expiration of one (1) year from the date of termination of the continuing jurisdiction of the court or after

⁸² Idaho Code Ann. § 67-3014 (Expungement for Victims of Human Trafficking) specifically allows victims of human trafficking to petition the court to vacate and/or expunge criminal records related to prostitution charges or acts committed “during a period of time when the person was a victim of human trafficking and that was the result of acts required by the human trafficker”. Idaho Code Ann. § 67-3014 states,

- (2) Any person who was arrested, prosecuted and/or convicted of a violation of section 18-5613 [Prostitution], Idaho Code, or any other offense determined by the court to be appropriate, except convictions for offenses for which a defense of coercion would not be available and that was committed during a period of time when the person was a victim of human trafficking and that was the result of acts required by the human trafficker, may bring a petition under the provisions of this section to vacate such conviction and/or to expunge the criminal history records taken in connection with the conviction
- (4) Any action brought under this section shall be filed within a reasonable time after the arrest, prosecution or conviction that is the subject of the action brought under this section, except that a petition to expunge an arrest that did not result in a prosecution shall not be brought until two (2) years after the arrest.
. . . .
- (6) The petition filed in this action shall: . . . (b) Include a short, plain statement . . . including the identity of the human trafficker
. . . .

Here and elsewhere in this report that Idaho Code Ann § 67-3014 is quoted or cited, it has been updated to reflect the amendments added by the passage of Senate Bill No. 1154, S.B. 1154, 63rd Legislature., Reg. Sess. (Idaho 2015). S.B. 1154, 63rd Leg, 1st Reg. Sess. (Idaho 2015) (effective July 1, 2015).

reaching age eighteen (18) years, whichever occurs later, petition the court for the expungement of his record. . . .
. . . .

Under Idaho Code Ann. § 20-525A(5),

If the court finds after hearing that the petitioner . . . has not been convicted of a felony, or of a misdemeanor wherein violence toward another person was attempted or committed since the termination of the court's jurisdiction or his release from the juvenile correctional center, and that no proceeding involving such felony or misdemeanor is pending or being instituted against him, and if the court further finds to its satisfaction that the petitioner has been held accountable, is developing life skills necessary to become a contributing member of the community and that the expungement of the petitioner's record will not compromise public safety, it shall order all records in the petitioner's case . . . sealed; and shall further order all references to said adjudication, diversion or informal adjustment removed from all indices and from all other records available to the public. However, a special index of the expungement proceedings and records shall be kept by the court ordering expungement, which index shall not be available to the public and shall be revealed only upon order of a court of competent jurisdiction. . . . Upon the entry of the order the proceedings in the petitioner's case shall be deemed never to have occurred and the petitioner may properly reply accordingly upon any inquiry in the matter. Inspection of the records may thereafter be permitted only by the court upon petition by the person who is the subject of the records or by any other court of competent jurisdiction, and only to persons named in the petition.

In regards to court records involving a child taken into custody under the Child Protective Act or adjudicated as an abused, neglected, or abandoned child,⁸³ Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1626 (Court records) provides,

The court shall keep a record of all court proceedings under this chapter. The records shall be available only to parties to the proceeding, persons having full or partial custody of the subject child and authorized agencies providing protective supervision or having legal custody of the child. Any other person may have access to the records only upon permission by the court and then only if it is shown that such access is in the best interests of the child; or for the purpose of legitimate research. If the records are released for research purposes, the person receiving them must agree not to disclose any information which could lead to the identification of the child.

5.10 Victim restitution and civil remedies for victims of domestic minor sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) are authorized by law.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8604 (Restitution—Rehabilitation) specifically requires the court to order an offender convicted of a human trafficking violation to make restitution. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8604 states,

- (1) In addition to any other amount of loss resulting from a human trafficking violation, the court shall order restitution, as applicable, including the greater of:
 - (a) The gross income or value to the defendant of the victim's labor or services; or
 - (b) The value of the victim's labor as guaranteed under the minimum wage and overtime provisions of the federal fair labor standards act.
- (2) In addition to any order for restitution as provided in this section, the court shall order the defendant to pay an amount determined by the court to be necessary for the mental and physical rehabilitation of the victim or victims.

⁸³ See *supra* note 72 for the provisions of Idaho Code Ann. § 16-1603 describing the jurisdiction of courts.

More generally, offenders convicted of other crimes also may be required to make restitution to their victims. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5304(2) (Restitution for crime victims) states,

Unless the court determines that an order of restitution would be inappropriate or undesirable, it shall order a defendant found guilty of any crime⁸⁴ which results in an economic loss⁸⁵ to the victim⁸⁶ to make restitution to the victim. An order of restitution shall be a separate written order in addition to any other sentence the court may impose, including incarceration, and may be complete, partial, or nominal. The court may also include restitution as a term and condition of judgment of conviction; however, if a court orders restitution in the judgment of conviction and in a separate written order, a defendant shall not be required to make restitution in an amount beyond that authorized by this chapter. Restitution shall be ordered for any economic loss which the victim actually suffers. The existence of a policy of insurance covering the victim's loss shall not absolve the defendant of the obligation to pay restitution.

Commercially sexually exploited minors may also be able to pursue civil remedies for “any liability to damages, penalty, forfeiture, or other remedy imposed by law and allowed to be recovered or enforced in any civil action or proceeding,” even if they are not specifically articulated in the code. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-103.

Additionally, children may pursue a tort claim where they have been victims of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child—penalties) and other non-CSEC sexual offenses. Idaho Code Ann. § 6-1701. Specifically, Idaho Code Ann. § 6-1703 (Damages—Attorneys' fees) explains that child victims of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 may be able to receive damages that

consist of compensation for past and future damages and may consist of emotional and physical pain and suffering, mental anguish, disability, loss of society and companionship, expenses for past and future therapy, and punitive damages where the claimant proves malicious or outrageous conduct by the party against whom the claim for punitive damages is asserted.

Also, “The prevailing party in a child abuse tort action shall be entitled to costs and reasonable attorneys' fees.” Idaho Code Ann. § 6-1703.

Lastly, commercially sexually exploited children whose offenders engage in a pattern of racketeering activity⁸⁷ in violation of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7804 (Prohibited activities) may be liable for civil damages up to 3 “times the actual damages proved and the cost of the suit, including reasonable attorney's fees.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7805(a).

5.11 Statutes of limitations for civil and criminal actions for child sex trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) offenses are eliminated or lengthened sufficiently to allow prosecutors and victims a realistic opportunity to pursue criminal action and legal remedies.

Idaho Code Ann. § 19-401 (No statute of limitations for certain felonies) provides that no statute of limitations apply to prosecutions for violations of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1506 (Sexual abuse of a child under the age of sixteen years) and § 18-1508 (Lewd conduct with minor child under sixteen). Most other felonies, including violations of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) and Idaho's CSEC laws, are subject to

⁸⁴ See *supra* note 28 for the definition of “found guilty of a crime.”

⁸⁵ See *supra* note 29 for the definition of “economic loss.”

⁸⁶ See *supra* note 30 for the definition of “victim.”

⁸⁷ See *supra* Section 1.4 for the definition of a “pattern of racketeering activity.”

5-year statutes of limitations. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-402. Finally, there is a 1-year statute of limitations for prosecutions of misdemeanors, except where the misdemeanor is failure to report child abuse, in which case a 4-year statute of limitations applies. Idaho Code Ann. § 19-403(1), (2).

Idaho Code Ann. § 6-1704(1) (Statute of limitations) provides that child abuse tort actions, such as those related to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1507 (Definitions—sexual exploitation of a child--penalties) have a 5-year statute of limitations from the date the child reaches the age of 18 “or, after the child reaches the age of eighteen (18) years, within five (5) years of the time the child discovers or reasonably should have discovered the act, abuse or exploitation and its causal relationship to an injury or condition suffered by the child, whichever occurs later.” Idaho Code Ann. § 5-218(1) (Statutory liabilities, trespass, trover, replevin, and fraud) establishes a 3-year statute of limitations for causes of action “created by statute, other than a penalty or forfeiture,” such as an action brought pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-7805(a) (Racketeering—civil remedies). However, Idaho Code Ann. § 5-230 (Persons under disabilities—Other than for real property) provides for tolling of the statute of limitations until the child reaches the age of majority, “provided however, that the time limited for the commencement of an action shall not be tolled for a period of more than six (6) years on account of minority.”

- 5.11.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 19-401 (No statute of limitations for certain felonies) to eliminate statutes of limitations for prosecutions involving violations of Idaho’s CSEC laws and for prosecutions of those crimes listed in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8603 (Penalties) where in the commission of such crimes the offender also commits human trafficking as defined in Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined).

Legal Components:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*
- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*
- 6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking.*
- 6.4 *Using a law enforcement posing as a minor to investigate buying or selling of commercial sex acts is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*
- 6.5 *Using the Internet or other electronic communication to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*
- 6.6 *Law enforcement and child welfare agencies are mandated to promptly report missing and recovered children.*

Legal Analysis:

- 6.1 *Training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking for law enforcement is statutorily mandated or authorized.*

Idaho encourages law enforcement to receive training on human trafficking and domestic minor sex trafficking. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8601 (Legislative intent) states in part,

In addition to the other provisions enumerated in this chapter, the legislature finds that it may also be appropriate for members of the law enforcement community to receive training from the respective training entities in order to increase awareness of possible human trafficking cases occurring in Idaho and to assist and direct victims of such trafficking to available community resources.

Despite the legislative intent to have law enforcement trained in human trafficking, such training is not mandated under Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5109 (Powers of the council—Standards of training, education and employment of peace officers). However, Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5109(1)(a) requires the Peace Officers Standards and Training Council (Council) to establish basic training requirements for peace officers, which must include “a course in the investigation of and collection of evidence in cases involving an allegation of sexual assault or battery.” Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5109(6) separately allows the Council to establish basic training requirements “for juvenile detention officers, juvenile probation officers, and employees of the Idaho department of juvenile corrections who are engaged in the direct care and management of juveniles.” Additionally under Idaho Code Ann. §§ 67-1401 (Duties of Attorney General), 67-1410 (Internet Crimes against Children Unit) investigators and prosecutors within this unit will have to be trained and educated on minor prostitution, solicitation, and sex-related offenses.

- 6.1.1 Recommendation: Amend Idaho Code Ann. § 19-5109 (Powers of the council—Standards of training, education and employment of peace officers) to mandate or expressly authorize training for law enforcement on domestic minor sex trafficking.

- 6.2 *Single party consent to audiotaping is permitted in law enforcement investigations.*

Idaho permits single party consent to audiotaping. Under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-6702(2)(c), (d) (Interception and disclosure of wire, electronic or oral communications prohibited),

(c) It is lawful under this chapter for a law enforcement officer or a person acting under the direction of a law enforcement officer to intercept a wire, electronic or oral communication when such person is a party to the communication or one (1) of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to such interception.

(d) It is lawful under this chapter for a person to intercept a wire, electronic or oral communication when one (1) of the parties to the communication has given prior consent to such interception.

6.3 *Wiretapping is an available tool to investigate domestic minor sex trafficking.*

Although wiretapping in sex trafficking investigations is not expressly authorized, law enforcement is probably able to use wiretapping, pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-6706 (Authorization for interception of wire, electronic or oral communications), when investigating violations of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) and Idaho’s CSEC laws. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-6706 authorizes the issuance of an order authorizing wiretapping where

such interception may provide or has provided evidence of the commission of the offense of murder, kidnapping, gambling, robbery, bribery, extortion, or dealing in narcotic drugs, marijuana or other dangerous drugs, or other crime dangerous to life, limb, or property, and punishable by imprisonment for more than one (1) year, or any conspiracy to commit any of the foregoing offenses.

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602 (Human trafficking defined) and Idaho’s CSEC laws are each punishable by imprisonment for more than 1 year and could be considered crimes that are “dangerous to life, limb, or property.”

6.4 *Using a law enforcement posing as a minor to investigate buying or selling of commercial sex acts is not a defense to soliciting, purchasing, or selling sex with a minor.*

Neither Idaho’s CSEC laws, nor Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) expressly authorizes the use of a decoy by law enforcement in investigating prostitution or domestic minor sex trafficking. However, the non-commercial offense under Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(3) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction), expressly provides that “[i]t shall not constitute a defense against any charge or violation of this section that a law enforcement officer, peace officer, or other person working at the direction of law enforcement was involved in the detection or investigation of a violation of this section.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(4) further provides “In a prosecution under this section, it is not necessary for the prosecution to show that an act described in chapter 15, 61 or 66, title 18, Idaho Code, actually occurred.”

6.4.1 Recommendation: Enact a law explicitly permitting the use of a decoy in investigating violations of Idaho Code Ann. § 18-8602(1) (Human trafficking defined) and CSEC offenses.

6.5 *Using the Internet or electronic communications to investigate buyers and traffickers is a permissible investigative technique.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(3) (Enticing a child through the use of the internet or other communication device—penalties—jurisdiction) authorizes law enforcement to use the Internet or electronic communications when investigating buyers and traffickers. This statute applies to a person who “knowingly uses the internet or any device that provides transmission of messages, signals, facsimiles, video images or other communication to solicit, seduce, lure, persuade or entice by words or actions, or both, a person under the age of sixteen (16) years or a person the defendant believes to be a minor child under the age of sixteen (16) years to engage in” certain sexual acts. Idaho Code Ann. §18-1509A(1). Furthermore, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(3) states that “[i]t

shall not constitute a defense against any charge or violation of this section that a law enforcement officer, peace officer, or other person working at the direction of law enforcement was involved in the detection or investigation of a violation of this section.” Idaho Code Ann. § 18-1509A(4) further provides “In a prosecution under this section, it is not necessary for the prosecution to show that an act described in chapter 15, 61 or 66, title 18, Idaho Code, actually occurred.”

6.6 *Law enforcement and child welfare agencies are mandated to promptly report missing and recovered children.*

Idaho Code Ann. § 18-4509(1) (Missing child reports—Law enforcement agencies—Duties) requires law enforcement agencies to enter information about a missing child into the national crime information center computer immediately after receiving a report of a missing or runaway child and further states, “Law enforcement agencies having direct access to the national crime information center computer shall enter and retrieve the data directly and shall cooperate in the entry and retrieval of data on behalf of law enforcement agencies which do not have direct access to the system.”

If the law enforcement agency has reason to believe the child is a student at an Idaho school, it will notify the child’s school. Idaho Code Ann. §18-4509(2). A school notified of a missing or runaway child, pursuant to Idaho Code Ann. § 18-4511(1) (School duties), is required to flag the child’s records and report any requests made regarding the flagged records to law enforcement. Idaho Code Ann. § 18-4510(1) (Birth records of missing children) imposes similar requirements on the state registrar to flag a child’s birth certificate records and report any inquiries made regarding the flagged records.

Additionally, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-4512(1) (Missing persons clearinghouse) establishes a missing persons clearinghouse “as a resource center of information and assistance regarding missing and unidentified persons.”

When a missing or runaway child is returned, Idaho Code Ann. § 18-4509(5) states that “the law enforcement agency having jurisdiction over the investigation shall clear the entry from the national crime information center computer.”

© January 23, 2012 Shared Hope International, American Center for Law and Justice. All rights reserved.

© November 29, 2012 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 7, 2013 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 6, 2014 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.

© November 11, 2015 Shared Hope International. All rights reserved.